

Post-Shakespeare Chronology 1800-2004
History of Shakespeare-Catholic/Protestant interpretations, with some notice of significant events in
Protestant/Catholic relations (small print).

Including
Recent Scholarship 1985-Present

Revised 31 Jan. 2007

- **1800**** John Milner's Letters to a Prebendary, defending against Protestant attack, astonished readers by its erudition; compared Elizabeth to Julian's deadly "benevolence;" defended Catholic loyalty despite the Bull; tried to correct partial Catholic and Protestant perspectives. Friedrich Schiller, Mary Stuart romanticizing the passionate Catholic princess against the repressed Elizabeth) same year that Schiller translated Macbeth.
- **1803**** Milner made bishop and Vicar Apostolic of Middle District, "without demur; nothing could more eloquently demonstrate the demise of the Cisalpine movement" (Duffy, 1970). Milner signaled 19th century conservative popularist (i.e. Irish) Catholic church, built first Gothic Revival church, Berington and Enlightenment cisalpines left behind. But some like Lingard retained cisalpine spirit. "The English Church has flirted with heterodoxy for twenty years; the flirtation was at an end" *Cuffy, 1970, 144. Even Berington, with his anti-Protestant Faith of Catholics, looked back on as solid Catholic.
- **1805**** Blake, Jerusalem; see Merton, Seven Storey Mountain (1948): "If in one page of Blake these priests in black gowns were frightening and hostile figures, on another, the 'Grey Monk of Charlemaine' was a saint and a hero of charity and of faith, fighting for the peace of the true God with all the ardent love that was the only reality Blake lived for. Towards the end of his life, Blake told his friend Samuel Palmer that the Catholic Church was the only that one that taught the love of God."
- **1805**** William Henry Ireland, Confessions, on how his forging of a Protestant statement of faith by Shakespeare was motivated by "Having the most rooted antipathy to every thing like superstition and bigotry, and having heard it very frequently surmised that our great poet, like his father, was no protestant, but of the catholic persuasion (particularly on account of the language made use of by the Ghost in Hamlet..." (cited by Chandler, 2006)
Chateaubriand's Le génie du Christianisme, creating a new romantic image of Catholicism; "marked the re-emergence of the Catholic mind from its isolation into contact with and influence upon the general stream of European thought" (Wilfrid Ward); saw medieval spiritual imagination destroyed by rationalism.
Scott, The Lay of the Last Minstrel (ends with elaborate ritual remembering dead magician, Michael Scott: hero vows pilgrimage to Melrose Abbey, for sake of Michael's soul; others make vows to their patron saints, and vow pilgrimage: "And slow up the dim aisle afar, / With sable cowl and scapular, / And snow-white stoles, in order due, / The holy Fathers, two and two, / In long procession came ... The mitred Abbot stretch'd his hand, / And bless'd them as they kneel'd' / With holy cross he sign'd them all ... Then mass was sung," ending with prayer for man facing Last Judgment; concluding epilogue: "hush'd is the harp -- the Minstrel gone ... he ended in "A simple hut: but there was seen / The little garden hedged with green ... There shelter'd wanderers ... Oft heard the tale of other days ... And Yarrow, as he roll'd along, / Bore burden to the Minstrel's song;" Marmion appeared in 1808.
- **1807**** Thomas Fisher, A Series of Antient Allegorical, Historical, and Legendary, Paintings Which Were Discovered in the Summer of 1804 on the walls of the Chapel of the Trinity at Stratford Upon Avon. London: Thomas Fisher, c. 1807-12. Contains Fisher's drawings of the Guild wall paintings, later reproduced in Clifford Davidson, The Guild Chapel wall paintings at Stratford-upon-Avon (New York : AMS Press, 1988).
Madame de Staël, Corinne, or Italy [compare Browning] with strong empathy for both Catholicism and Protestantism, very influential work.
- **1808**** Goethe, Faust, Part 1. Part 2 pub. in 1832 (year of Goethe's death). Faust makes wager with devil that he will never be satisfied with anything or will say of any moment of delight, "Stay, thou art so fair." In Part 1, Gretchen invites him to commitment which he rejects. Gretchen seen

coming from confession in church, "I envy the body of the Lord / When her lips rest upon the holy bread", mater dolorosa, prays to Heavenly church at execution and is redeemed; thus Catholic girl alternative to modern rootlessness of Faust. In Part 2, Faust is finally satisfied with a good work done, to envision a land where all might develop freely ("Stay, thou art so fair"), and falls dead. Mephistopheles thus wins and loses. In losing wager, Faust in fact gains eternal life. Intervention of Gretchen and Virgin Mary saves Faust at end.

****1810**** John Stockdale, History of the Inquisition, classic anti-Catholic work.

Scott, The Lady of the Lake.

****1811**** Coleridge lecture on Romeo and Juliet (1811-12) "Friar Lawrence ... enables me to remark upon the different manner in which Shakespeare has treated the priestly character, as compared with other writers. In Beaumont and Fletcher priests are represented as a vulgar mockery; and, as in others of their dramatic personages, the errors of a few are mistaken for the demeanour of the many; but in Shakespeare they always carry with them our love and respect."

****1813**** Madame de Staël, De l'Allemagne trans. as On Germany (1814): "There are in the human mind two very distinct impulses; one make us feel the want of faith, the other that of examination. One of these tendencies ought not to be satisfied at the expense of the other."

Charles Butler, An Address to the Protestants of Great Britain and Ireland, noting closeness of Catholicism and Anglicanism: "And after all, is the Reunion of the Roman Catholic and Protestant Churches, absolutely impossible?" Cites Bossuet-Leibniz dialogue.

Fr. Joseph Berington, History of the Decline and Fall of the Roman Catholic Religion in England: on Parsons, "the calamity of the English Catholics"83; "Through a period of two hundred and thirty four years ... I have exhibited ... the suffering, the troubles, the dissensions, the hopes, the fears of a society by their enemies termed Papists, by themselves Catholics, and whom Providence, by an intervention almost miraculous, has preserved from utter extinction. They are the venerable ruins of a majestic church, that once filled the extent of our island, that civilized its rude inhabitants, planting in their minds the seeds of virtue, and with them the seeds of Christian faith ... by the statute of 1791, the grievances that oppressed us most are removed."

****1814**** Wordsworth, The Excursion, 7.1010ff: "The courteous Knight, whose bones are here interred ... Had also witnessed, in his morn of life, / That violent commotion, which o'erthrew, / In town and city and sequestered glen, / Altar and cross, and church of solemn roof, / And old religious house - - pile after pile; / And shook their tenants out into the fields, / Like wild beasts without home! Their hour was come ..." Scott's Waverley. Southey's Roderick, The Last of the Goths, dons guise of monk and achieves peace; also Southey's Madoc (1794-), sympathetic portrait of 12th century Catholicism; also see his "The Five Martyrs of Morocco" (1803) and "Queen Mary's Christening" (1829), praising Catholic piety.

Reestablishment of Jesuits by Pius VII.

Jane Austen, Mansfield Park, visit to the Rushworth estate chapel. Fanny is disappointed and says to Edmund: "This is not my idea of a chapel. There is nothing awful here, nothing melancholy, nothing grand. Here are no aisles, no arches, no inscriptions, no banners. No banners, cousin, to be 'blown by the night wind of Heaven.' No signs that a 'Scottish monarch sleeps below'." (i.e. from Scott's "The Lay of the Last Minstrel" Canto 2, 10-13.)

****1815**** Wordsworth's "The White Doe of Rylstone," mystical creature who appears in precincts of Bolton Priory to comfort girl whose home life was wrecked in storms of Reformation.

****1817**** Nathan Drake, Shakespeare and His Times: accepts Chalmers on John Shakespeare's Catholicism, but says that William was simply attracted "to the poetical nature of the materials which the doctrines of Rome supply" (cited by Chandler, 2006).

****1818**** Mary Shelley's Valperga, celebrating Lady Euthanasia's Catholicism, combining faith and reason -- vs. earlier Dr. Frankenstein's destructive intellectual experimentation; she tries to curb Beatrice's dangerous wild imagination.

Samuel Wix, Reflections concerning the expediency of a Council of the Church of England and the Church of Rome being holden, with a view to accommodate religious differences and to promote unity of religion, cited by Tavard, "all but forgotten today, and ... never very prominent."

****1819**** Lingard's History of England (-1830), uses archives, evenhandedly, to make the Catholic view respectable; celebrates Elizabeth's political success, economically, against Spain, etc.; said she was indifferent to religion and defended Protestantism for political reasons (reflecting Cisalpine solution that she pardon those who abjured Pope's temporal pretensions); would influence

Cobbett, and provide scholarly intellectual model for Oxford movement converts. Cobbett influenced Marx. Lingard saw his history as promoting reconciliation and return to the Ancient Faith; “The proper remedy would have been to offer liberty of conscience to all Catholics who would abjure the temporal pretensions of the pontiff”. On the new rich, “their prosperity was not the prosperity of the nation; it was that of one half obtained at the expense of the other;” “he shows that medieval catholics carefully distinguished between the papacy’s temporal and spiritual power, and stresses catholic loyalty to the crown” (S. Gilley, 1977). Replaced Protestant-Whig histories of Burnet and Hume. “historians scrambled to defend the good name of their Protestant forebears and the Anglican church. Robert Southey, Henry Hallam, Thomas Carlyle, James Anthony Froude, and Lord Macaulay all wrote histories of England in the following years in defense of ... Good Queen Bess” (Vidmar review, CHR 2003). Lingard “wrote in such a spirit of fairness that some Catholics considered his work unduly conciliatory. He freely admitted the prevalence of corruption ... Lingard’s account of the English Reformation is notable for its heavy emphasis on the impact of the Henrician divorce ... and its gross misjudgment of Cranmer as despicable” (A. Dickens et al, Reformation in Historical Thought).

Charles Butler’s Historical Memoirs (-1821), Catholic history in appellant tradition, justifying Elizabeth’s policy against traitors, attacked Pius V’s Bull (“it tended to produce a civil war between the pope’s protestant and Catholic subjects, with all the horrors of a disputed succession, and ... it necessarily involved a multitude of respectable and conscientious individuals in the bitterest and most complicated distress”), supported Catholics signing oath of Allegiance; Butler motivated by desire for reconciliation, “to put Catholics and Protestants into good humour with one another, and Catholics into good humour among themselves”. Butler said: “MAY the writer premise a suspicion which, from internal evidence, he has long entertained, that Shakespeare was a roman-catholic?—Not one of his works contains the slightest reflections on popery; or any of its practices; or any eulogy of the Reformation. His panegyric on queen Elizabeth is cautiously expressed; while queen Catherine is placed in a state of veneration ... The ecclesiastic is never presented by Shakespeare in a degraded point of view” (“first Catholic to claim Shakespeare as Catholic,” focused discussion on Henry VIII—Chandler, 2006)

Scott’s Ivanhoe, first of Waverly novels on early English era, making possible the Catholic Revival according to Newman; it and Quentin Durward (1823) the two most popular of his medievalist novels. Wilt: “as the novels of Scott show, the continuing return of the repressed Catholic, inn Stuart counter-revolutionary enterprises and Celtic resistances, in neo-medievalisms and pre-Raphaelitisms of all sorts, play out an anxiety that ‘the Catholic’ is in fact the authentic, and the Protestant a mere show, or shell. Scratch a Protestant and you find a hollow or a Catholic” (“Masques of the English in Barnaby Rudge, Dickens Studies Annual 2001).

****1820****

George IV begins reign; secretly marries Catholic Mrs. Fitzherbert.

Walter Scott, The Monastery: 1830 intro. says intention was “to conjoin two characters ... who, thrown into situations which gave them different views on the subject of the Reformation, should, with the same sincerity and purity of intention, dedicate themselves, the one to the support of the sinking fabric of the Catholic Church, the other to the establishment of the Reformed doctrines.” Lady Avenal still goes to church, like the “earlier reformers, who seemed to have studied, for a time at least, to avoid a schism, until the violence of the Pope rendered it inevitable;” the monk “employed himself in fervent and sincere, though erroneous, prayers, for the weal of the departed spirit;” poem praises “something purer” in the “ancient superstition” (applicable to Catholicism): heresy of Henry Warden called “purer religion;” great debates between him and the monk Eustace; also Scott, The Abbot (1820), romanticizing Catholicism, suggesting its value as source of order; balancing good reformer with good Catholic; moving picture of dispossessed monks (though Scott condemned papism); the two brothers, one Protestant, the other an abbot, are both respected; The Abbot portrays social value of medieval church as source of order, font of alms, etc. (However, Scott portrays sinister Catholic practices in various novels.) “Scott repeatedly makes statements critical of Catholic beliefs and practices, but his scene of monks fallen on evil days are often moving ones, and must have aroused the sympathy of many readers” (Irene Bostrom, 1963).

Wordsworth, “Memorials of a Tour on the Continent 1820” which includes “Between Namur and Liege,” “In the Cathedral at Cologne,” “Composed in one of the Catholic Cantons,” “Engelberg, The Hill of Angels,” “Our Lady of the Snow,” “The Church of San Salvador Seen from the Lake of Lugano,” “The Three Cottage Girls,” “Processions Suggested on a Sabbath Morning in the Vale

of Chamouny,” “Elegiac Stanzas,” on Wordsworth’s admiration for continental Catholicism. Charles Robert Maturin, Melmoth the Wanderer: on horrors of inquisition, but tale of a friendly priest saving a Protestant family’s fortune. Catholic Alonzo de Monçada preaches the sacred “secret of silence.” Maturin “wants to evoke in properly ambiguous Gothic style the pre-modern ferocity of the religious current ... mediated and modernized by the Anglican via media, but also, of course, obscured and miniaturized by it” (Wilt in Barth, ed., Fountain Light 2002).

Edmond Malone: “It is highly improbable, indeed, that [John Shakespeare] ... who held the situation of Bailiff of Stratford, should have been a Roman Catholic;” argues WS’s Protestantism, bec. of King John, Henry VIII and “evening mass” (The Plays and Poems of William Shakespeare, posthumously pub.).

****1822****

Wordsworth’s Ecclesiastical Sonnets, proto-Tractarian view that Reformation was regrettable but necessary because of papal corruption; yet much good was destroyed (monastic ideals (“The tapers shall be quenched, the belfries mute, / And ‘mid their choirs unroofed by selfish rage, / The warbling wren shall find a leafy cage”), saints (“Angels and Saints, in every hamlet mourned! / Ah! if the old idolatry be spurned, / Let not your radiant Shapes desert the Land”-II-24), Church independence (“the Crown assumes a voice / Of reckless mastery, hitherto unknown” -- 1.28)); regrets radicalism of Puritans (on Marian exiles, “their union is beset / With speculative notions rashly sown”) (“Men, who have ceased to reverence, soon defy, / True forefathers; lo! sects are formed, and split / With morbid restlessness ... Beneath the roof of settled Modesty./ The Romanist exults”); glorifies Elizabeth, ignores long recusant history, praises Laud and high Anglicanism; notes in “Regrets;” “Would that our scrupulous Sires had dared to leave / Less scanty measure of these graceful rites,” followed by “Mutability” sonnet: “Truth fails not; but her outward forms that bear / The longest date do melt like frosty rime.”

Kenneth Digby’s The Broad Stone of Honour: or the True Sense and Practice of Chivalry (with many expanded edns. thereafter) (I. Godefridus, II. Tancredus, III. Morus (i.e. Thomas More), IV. Orlandus) idealized Catholic middle Ages, pictured medieval chivalry as lay Christianity in action, and a moral inspiration to English governing classes, made Gothic part of Catholic apologetic, specified “the Catholic faith [as] the very basis of the character which belonged to the knight;” Digby (became Catholic in 1825) influenced by Lingard, and influenced Disraeli; “the chief British religious medievalist of the nineteenth century” (Morris, 1984). “It is striking that Digby talks as much of freedom as of authority” (Morris).

****1823****

Grace Kennedy’s Father Clement: A Roman Catholic Story, anti-catholic but tries to be reasonable and see unity of all churches.

Beethoven, Missa Solemnis (1818-23).

Ambrose Phillips has dream of reconversion of England.

****1824****

William Cobbett’s A History of the Protestant Reformation in England and Ireland ... Showing how the Event has Impoverished the Main Body of the People in those countries (–1827), seven hundred thousand copies sold by 1828 (Manning, “History,” HLQ, 2001); influenced by Lingard’s History: popularized thesis that Reformation devastated social provision in interest of rapacious monarch and aristocracy; eloquent defense of monasteries, church celibacy, good for poor; emphasizes extent of Henry’s plunder and devastating effect on poor. “A full third part of our fellow-subjects are still Catholics ... “ i.e. we need to be united.; “you have been the dupe of those who live upon the spoils of the Church of our fathers”; Cobbett called by Hazlitt “unquestionably the most powerful political writer of the present day.” Cobbett’s Political Register espoused Catholic emancipation in Ireland. Probably part of non-conformist campaign vs. Anglican parsons (Manning HLQ 2001).

Robert Southey, Book of the Church, attacking papism: “Some of them [recusant missionaries] are to be admired as men of genius and high endowment, as well as of heroic constancy: all to be lamented, as acting for an injurious purpose, under a mistaken sense of duty; but their sufferings belong to the history of papal politics, not to that of religious persecution.” “The Tudor martyrs “suffered for points of State, and not of Faith; not as Roman Catholics, but as Bull-papists; not for religion but for treason.” Answered in 1825 by Charles Butler’s The Book of the Roman Catholic Church, eirenicly praising catholic elements in Anglicanism, recalling past discussions of Leibniz and Bossuet, etc., well received for its urbanity.

Charles Robert Maturin, The Albigenses, Catholic villains but also heroes, thus balanced. At the end, Maturin praises both the Albegois minister and the Catholic monk: “May those of different

faiths, like them, imitate their tolerance and embrace their example.”

****1825****

[Friedrich Möhler, “The Unity of the Church as Exemplified by the Fathers,” “the most formidable attack on the Reformation since Bossuet” (Gooch).]

Coleridge’s Aids to Reflections praised by Aubrey de Vere as connecting “universal mind” with the ideal Catholicism always present in the Church. Coleridge: “My censures of the Papists do much differ from what they were at first. I then thought, that their errors in the doctrines of faith were the most dangerous mistakes. But now I am assured that their misexpressions and misunderstanding us, with our mistakings of them and inconvenient expressing of our own opinions, have made the difference in most points appear much greater than it is; and that in some it is next to none at all. But the great and unreconcilable differences lie in their Church Tyranny; in the usurpations of their Hierarchy, and Priesthood, under the name of spiritual authority exercising a temporal Lordship; in their corruptions and abasement of God’s Worship, but above all in their systematic befriending of Ignorance and Vice.”

Berlioz, Messe solennelle.

****1826****

Horace Smith, The Tor Hill, though defending Reformation, deploring stripping of Glastonbury Abbey, an idyllic place destroyed by Cromwell and the villainous Sir Lionel. Smith concludes: “England, long the pride and paragon of Europe, in arts and arms, in liberal institutions and intellectual eminence, will blush with shame at the thought of being behind her neighbours upon the single point of religious toleration.”

John Fletcher, A Comparative View of the Grounds of the Catholic, and Protestant, Churches, dedicated to Lingard, argues for “re-union of the catholic, and protestant churches;” and quotes Dr. Barrington, Bishop of Durham: “What public duty of greater magnitude can present itself to us, than the restoration of peace, and union, to the church, by the reconciliation of two so large portions of it, as the churches of England, and Rome? What undertaking of more importance, and higher interest, can employ the piety, and learning of the ministers of Christ, than the endeavour to accomplish this truly Christian work.” But argues a Catholic basis; “it is only in the catholic church, that there exists a centre of union.” “The great remedy ... is ... uniting the Christian world to the parent institute;” “let us hope that the protestant, and the catholic, laying aside, each of them every prejudice... will form, once more, one happy family;” in turn, “The catholic church would have sacrifices ... She must give up ... a variety of points of discipline ... certain practices, ceremonies, and customs, which are offensive to the prejudices of the protestant.”

****1827****

John Keble, The Christian Year.

****1828****

O’Connell wins parliamentary election for County Clare representative, despite ban.

Guizot, The History of Civilization in Europe, trans. 1846, Reformation achieved overthrow of Catholic clergy’s monopoly of spiritual power.

****1829****

Roman Catholic Emancipation act; Catholics allowed to become MP’s. End of long period of anxiety about the Penal Laws. Oaths of Allegiance, Supremacy, and Abjuration canceled.

(New oath required for Parliament: “I do ... abjure the Opinion, that Princes excommunicated ... by the Pope ... may be deposed or murdered ... I do not believe that the Pope ... hath or ought to have any Temporal ... jurisdiction ... I will defend to the utmost of my Power the Settlement of Property within this Realm ... I never will exercise any Privilege ... to disturb or weaken the Protestant Religion ... if any Person ... shall assume ... the Name ... of Archbishop ... in England, he shall ... pay the Sum of One hundred Pounds ... If any Jesuit ... come into this Realm, he shall be ... banished.”

Southey published his Sir Thomas More: or, Colloquies on the Progress and Prospects of Society, with its praise of feudal society.

****1830****

William IV begins reign.

Coleridge On the Constitution of the Church and State: Since “the paramount end and purpose of [the National Church] ... is the continued and progressive civilization of the community,”

“there are yet but two absolute disqualifications: namely, allegiance to a foreign power, or an acknowledgement of any other visible head of the Church, but our sovereign lord the king; and compulsory celibacy in connection with, and dependence on, a foreign and extra-national land;”

“if the papacy, and the Romish hierarchy as far as it is papal, be not Antichrist, the guilt of schism, in its most aggravated form, lies on the authors of the Reformation. For nothing less than this could have justified so tremendous a rent in the Catholic church, with all its foreseen most calamitous consequences. And so Luther himself thought; and so thought Wickliffe before

him.” Coleridge attacks the application of the Apocalyptic Anti-Christ to the Pope. “It is, I repeat, my full conviction, that the rites and doctrines, the agenda et credenda, of the Catholics, could we separate them from the adulterating ingredients combined with, and the use made of them, by the sacerdotal Marmelukes of the Romish monarchy, for the support of the Papacy and papal hierarchy, would neither have brought about, nor have sufficed to justify, the convulsive separation under Leo X.” Coleridge says that in his travels he saw that the Romish Priesthood helped keep the populations ignorant and poor in order to support Papal Sovereignty “against ... the reforms wished for by the more enlightened governments, as well as by all the better informed and wealthier class of Catholics generally;” Catholics “who would contemplate with as much horror a Reform from their Church, as they look with earnest aspirations and desires towards a Reform in the Church.” Citing the list of papal abuses listed by a prominent Catholic, Coleridge concludes: “Now, of the twelve abuses here enumerated, it is remarkable that ten, if not eleven, are but expansions of the one grievance -- the Papal Power as the centre, and the Pope as the one visible head and sovereign of the Christian church” (though Coleridge’s theological critique in the last phrase exceeds the quoted Catholic’s political critique). Coleridge “thought the English Church had lost its chance at the Reformation, when it replaced its allegiance to Rome with allegiance to the monarchy, instead of making itself into a supra-party organization” (Morris, 1984).

****1831****

Disraeli, The Young Duke, on old family English Catholics as oppressed loyal virtuous subjects, vs. Protestant bigots, describes “the mild dignity, the noble patience, the proud humility, the calm hope, the uncompromising courage” with which Catholics “lived as proscribed in the realm which they had created”; theme repeated in his Henrietta Temple (1836) and Venitia (1837): Mrs. Dacre and daughter in Young Duke have “living connection with what is best in traditional English society ... function ... of reconciling tradition and individuality” (Clausson, NCF 1979). Kenneth Digby, Mores Catholici, or Ages of Faith (-1842), that Catholic culture generated the highest art. England can return to pre-Reformation religion: “Let but the master arise who can revive the Catholic chord, and thou wilt again send forth the sweetest music;” “thy solemn woods would give shelter to he lonely eremite” (qu. Morris, 1984); much on monasteries, etc. John Stuart Mill, “The Spirit of the Age”: distinguishes “natural” from “transitional” societies; in the former, authority is still intact, managed by an elite, i.e. medieval Catholic clergy, “had the strongest motives ... for inculcating the natural equality of mankind, the superiority of love and sacrifice over mere courage and bodily prowess, of menacing the great with the only terrors to which they were accessible,” “a potent cause ... of the present civilization of Europe,” destroyed prematurely by the Reformation. Church of England “sunk from its independent rank, into an ... appendage, of the aristocracy.” (Mill and his father would transform 18th cent. ideal of political liberty to one of individualist liberty.)

****1832****

Macaulay’s essay, “Burleigh and His Times”: Reformation as “struggle of the laity against the clergy for intellectual liberty;” but “the most prominent and extraordinary phenomenon which it [the English Reformation] presents to us is the gigantic strength of the government contrasted with the feebleness of the religious parties,” yet Elizabeth was beloved, etc. “The partiality of Shakespeare for Friars is well known;” the ghost speeches in Hamlet could not have been written by a zealous Protestant; Elizabeth worse than Mary in being a tyrant without benefit of fanatical conviction. “The nation” was “clearly ready” to tolerate both religions, but Elizabeth “adopted a policy from which the empire is still suffering ... It is melancholy to think with what ease Elizabeth might have united all conflicted sects under the shelter of the same impartial laws ... and thus have placed the nation in the same situation, as far as the rights of conscience are concerned, in which we at last stand.”

Arthur Hallam, “The Influence of Italian Upon English Literature”: Dante, nurtured in a Catholicism rejuvenated by Sts. Francis and Dominic, influenced Chaucer and, less purely, Spenser and Milton. “I cannot help considering the Sonnets of Shakespeare as a sort of homage to that Genius of Christian Europe ...” Milton lacked Dante’s “universality and depth” but had “relative advantages over him, which were necessarily obtained from a Protestant and English position.” “In those obscured times, that followed the subversion of Rome, the muses clung not in vain for safety to the inviolate altars of the Catholic church ... It is not wholly without the bounds of probability, that a purer spirit than the Roman Catholicism may animate hereafter a loftier form of European civilization.” “The inordinate esteem for chastity; the solemnity attached to

conventual vows; the interest taken in those fair saints ... above all the worship of the Virgin, the Queen of Heaven ... these articles of a most unscriptural, but very beautiful mythology, could not be established in general belief without investing the feminine character with ideal splendour and loveliness

Arthur Hallam: "Remarks on Professor Rossetti's 'Disquisizioni Sullo Spirito Antipapale,' vs. Rossetti's theory that Dante was a closet freemason: "And in the pomp of Catholic superstition, the slow and solemn chaunts, the white-robed processions, the incense, and the censers, and the golden baldacchins, with ever-burning lights, and images, and pictures, in whose rude forms a prophetic eye might even then discern the future arts of Raffaello and Michelangiolo [sic] ... in this ceremonial worship, so framed to attach the imagination and the senses, was there nothing to make a poet pause and adore? The beautiful was everywhere around men, waiting, and, as it were, calling for their love. Is it wonderful that the call was heard? Is it wonderful that the feeling of reverence for that august name, the Church, -- for its antiquity, its endurance, its unity, its widespread dominion, and yet more ample prospects of indefinite magnificence, should, in that day, have been often irresistible in the minds of imaginative men" like Dante.

Hegel, Philosophy of History (1832, trans. 1857) on how Protestant freedom replaced the old superstitious fossilized medieval Catholicism: "Thus men came to the point of knowing that they were free ... Thus spirit came again to itself ... This new birth is pointed out as the revival of the arts and sciences which were concerned with present mater, the epoch when the spirit gains confidence in itself ... It is reality reconciled with the world." . Influenced Burckhardt.

Johann Adam Möhler, Symbolism [Symbolics], or Exposition of the Doctrinal Differences Between Catholics and Protestants, as Evidenced by their Symbolical Writings, with revised edns. thereafter, distinguishing the two mindsets, depending on view of original sin; saw Protestant error as proceeding from good intentions, i.e. to emphasize power of God, but polemically in favor of Catholicism. Presented Protestantism as a coherent whole. Revived enthusiasm for Catholicism in Germany.

****1833****

Coleridge, Notebook: "Were I young, had I the bodily strength & animal spirits of early manhood with my present powers & convictions, I should not so far despair of a union between the Protestant and the now papal but still Catholic Church, as to prevent me from making it an object," qu. in Barth, Coleridge and Christian Doctrine (1969).

Wordsworth, Poems Composed or Suggested During a Tour, in the Summer of 1833, including "Nun's Well, Brigham," "Mary Queen of Scots," "Stanzas Suggested in a Steamboat off Saint Bees' Heads, On the Coast of Cumberland," "At Sea off the Isle of Man," "At Bala-Sala, Isle of Man," "Iona," "Homeward We Turn," "Nunnery," "The Somnambulist," paying tribute to ancient English Catholicism.

The whole intellectual establishment, Mill, Coleridge, Macaulay, Disraeli, seemed to be going toward the Catholics. This intellectual sea change, begun with the French Revolution, was the supportive context for the upcoming Tractarian movement.

John Keble, sermon on "National Apostasy," July 14: "I ever considered and kept the day as the start of the religious Movement of 1833" (Newman, Apologia). Begins Oxford Movement. Newman, Keble, et al begin Tracts for the Times, 90 tracts published through 1841. "Anglo-Catholicism became the "extreme wing" of this movement" (Pickering, Anglo-Catholicism).

Heine, The Romantic School: "It is indeed very significant that at precisely the time when by public belief Faust lived, the Reformation began, and that he himself is supposed to have founded the art which secures for knowledge victory over faith, namely the printing press; an art, however, which also robbed us of the Catholic peace of mind and plunged us into doubt and revolutions ... But no, knowledge ... science gives us at last the pleasure of which religious faith, Catholic Christianity has cheated us for so long; we apprehend that men are called not only to a heavenly but also to an earthly equality."

****1834****

"The glory of the English Church is that it has taken the Via media ... between the (so-called) Reformers and the Romanists" first recorded usage, OED new edn (Newman, Tracts 38); see 1836.

[Leopold von Ranke, Die römischen Päpste (1834-6) emphasizes spiritual power and coherence of Catholic "counter-reformation."]

August Comte, Course of Positive Philosophy (1830-4), on the law of the three states; restated in System of Positive Polity (1851-4): "every branch of our knowledge is necessarily obliged to pass

successively ... through three ... states: the theological or fictitious state; the metaphysical or abstract state; finally, the scientific or positive state" (trans. Bridges); Positivist Calendar (1849) replaced saints with heroes of civilization, including Gutenberg and Shakespeare. Bridges trans. of a General View of Positivism (1865): "a new moral power will arise spontaneously throughout the West ... for the acceptance of a true spiritual power, a power more ... progressive, than the noble but premature attempt of mediaeval Catholicism ... Both are based on the principle of affection; but in Positivism the affection inculcated is social, in Catholicism it is essentially personal ... Catholicism, while appealing to the Heart, crushed Intellect ... Positivism, on the contrary, brings Reasons into complete harmony with Feeling ... Catholicism ... purified love from the animal propensities ... [but] Love of God ... was essentially a self-regarding principle." Comte admired De Maistre, De Bonald, on the social institutions of medieval Catholicism which he wished to prune and adapt for the new "religion of humanity," where humanity not God is loved and served. Huxley called it a "Catholicism without Christianity," complete with festivals, saints replaced by philosophers, social sacraments.

****1835****

Newman's Tract 71 written "with a view to reconciliation." "All we know is, that here we are, from long security ignorant why we are not Roman Catholics"

Alexis de Toqueville, Democracy in America (1835, 1840): "The priests in America have divided the intellectual world into two parts: in the one they place the doctrines of revealed religion, which command their assent; in the other they leave those truths which they believe to have been freely left open to the researches of political inquiry. Thus the Catholics of the United States are at the same time the most faithful believers and the most zealous citizens. "In France I had almost always seen the spirit of religion and the spirit of freedom pursuing courses diametrically opposed to each other; but in America I found that they were intimately united ... I found that they [Catholic clergy] ... mainly attributed the peaceful dominion of religion in their country to the separation of Church and State." "The men of our days are naturally disposed to believe; but, as soon as they have any religion, they immediately find in themselves a latent propensity which urges them unconsciously towards Catholicism. Many of the doctrines and the practices of the Romish Church astonish them; but they feel a secret admiration for its discipline, and its great unity attracts them ... our posterity will tend more and more to a single division into two parts - some relinquishing Christianity entirely, and others returning to the bosom of the Church of Rome. Catholicism favorable to equality, because all worshippers are religiously equal before the priest; but T. conceded that priests had to be removed from government.

Wordsworth, "Stanzas Suggested in a Steamboat off Saint Bees's Heads" (composed 1833): praises the monastery's "intercessions made for the soul's rest / Of tardy penitents; or for the best / Among the good (when love might else have slept, / Sickened, or died) in pious memory kept ... Are not in sooth, their Requiem's sacred ties / Woven out of passion's sharpest agonies, / Subdued, composed, and formalized by art, / To fix a wiser sorrow in the heart?;" note adds: "No reflecting person, however, can view without sorrow the abuses which rose out of thus formalizing sublime instincts ... and perverting them into ... rapacity."

Dublin Review founded.

****1836****

Charles Barry and Pugin win Westminster competition with Pugin's Gothic Perpendicular designs. Maria Monk's Awful Disclosures of Maria Monk, as Exhibited in a Narrative of Her sufferings During a Residence of Five Years as a Novice, and Two Years as a Black Nun, in the Hotel Dieu Nunnery at Montreal.

Newman's "Home Thoughts Abroad": Roman controversialist argues: "Surely there is such a religious fact as the existence of a great Catholic body, union with which is a Christian privilege and duty. Now, we English are separate from it;" answered that truth requires the regrettable division. Newman lectures on "Romanism and Popular Protestantism."

Augustus Pugin, Contrasts or, a Parallel between the Noble Edifices of the Middle Ages, and Corresponding Buildings of the Present Day; Shewing the Present Decay of Taste, revised edn. 1841, with contrasting plates of "Catholic Town in 1440," "The Same Town in 1840;" Pugin wanted reconciliation of high Anglican and Catholic; celebrated "the faith, the zeal, and, above all, the unity, of our ancestors, that enable them to conceive and raise those wonderful fabrics ... ere heresy had destroyed faith, [and] schisms had put an end to unity.")

Newman's Prophetical Office of the Church (retitled Via Media in third edn. of 1877): Romanists might say that "the pretended Via Media is but an eclectic system ... leading to arrogance and self-

sufficiency in judging of sacred subjects;" "the Via Media has never existed except on paper, it has never been reduced to practice."

Newman, et al, Lyra Apostolica.

Thomas Arnold calls Tractarians "the very Non-Jurors ... reproduced with scarcely a shade of difference" (see 1688); Tractarians feared Whigs coming into power and distributing church patronage.

John Lingard, A New Version of the Four Gospels: stresses that the gospels are socially conditioned "versions;" "embodied the most far-reaching effort of the English Catholic Enlightenment both to preach and to defend the church with modern techniques" (Chinnici, 1980).

****1837****

Queen Victoria begins reign.

S. R. Maitland begins attacking the credibility of John Foxe in various works beginning now. (C. S. Lewis says J. F. Mozley defended Foxe's integrity in 1940 "with complete success".)

E.C.A., Geraldine -- a Tale of Conscience, on movement from Anglican to Roman Church: reviewed by Newman, British Critic (1838): "It is ... sinful impatience, to go out of the English church for what every believing mind may find in it;" history is a "via media" between the two churches.

****1838****

"Anglo-Catholicism," first recorded usage, OED (Newman citing a book by Palmer).

Richard Hurrell Froude's Remains, ed. Newman and Keble: "I am every day becoming a less and less loyal son of the Reformation;" includes "Essay on Rationalism" (which will become Newman's Liberalism): Protestantism "set[s] up Sermons as means of grace, to the disparagement of Sacraments," etc.

Isaac Williams, The Cathedral.

****1839****

Heine, Shakespeares Maedchen und Frauen, trans. by Leland as Heine on Shakespeare a translation of his notes on Shakespeare heroines (1895): "It is lucky for us that Shakespeare came just at the right time ... while Protestantism ... expressed itself in the unbridled freedom of thought which prevailed, but which had not yet entered into life or feeling, and the kingdom of light by the last rays of setting chivalry still bloomed and gleamed in all the glory of poetry. True the popular faith of the middle Ages, or Catholicism, was gone as regarded doctrine, but it existed as yet with all its magic in men's hearts, and held its own in manners, customs, and views. It was not till later that the Puritans succeeded in plucking away flower by flower, and utterly rotting up the religion of the past, and spreading over all the land, as with a grey canopy, that dreary sadness which since then ... had diluted itself to a lukewarm ... pietism."

Cardinal Wiseman in Dublin Review compares Donatists and Anglicans -- which shook Newman. George Spencer, The Great Importance of a Re-union between the Catholics and the Protestants of England, cited by Newman.

Newman's "The State of Religious Parties" cites Scott ("turned men's mind in the direction of the Middle Ages"), Coleridge (made age interested "in the cause of Catholic truth"), Southey and Wordsworth ("one ... in fantastic fiction, the other in ... philosophical meditation ... addressed themselves to the same high principles and feelings.")

****1840****

Carlyle's "The Hero as Poet," on Shakespeare as the "noblest product" of "Middle-Age Catholicism": "May we not call Shakespeare the still more melodious Priest of a true Catholicism, the 'Universal Church' of the Future and of all times?" "The Hero as Priest" in Heroes and Hero-Worship (1841) celebrates Luther's "Here stand I" as delivering the European world from "stagnant putrescence."

Macaulay's review, "Ranke's History of the Popes": on importance of counter-Reformation, "how it was that the Church of Rome ... actually regained nearly half of what she had lost," though Protestantism made Northern countries prosper: thus reinstated the importance of the Counter-Reformation in English eyes.

Newman in British Critic: "It is a fact ... that Rome has added to the Creed; and it is a fact, however we justify ourselves, that we are estranged from the great body of Christians over the world;" "I began to wish for union between the Anglican Church and Rome ... and I did what I could to gain weekly prayers for that object."

****1841****

Frederick Oakeley, in The British Critic, influenced by Hurrell Froude, attacked Reformation as "deplorable schism."

Dickens's Barnaby Rudge, against the anarchy of the Gordon riots, satirizes use of no-popery language as rationale for social chaos; Squire Haredale presented as enlightened Catholic

gentleman; ending marriage proposes reconciliation of new Protestant and old Catholic. But describes Haredale finally immured in a monastery of “merciless penitence.” Ainsworth’s Guy Fawkes, sympathizing with oppressed Catholics.

Martyrs’ Memorial constructed at Oxford to defend the Reformation, in reaction against Hurrell’s Remains.

Dickens, The Old Curiosity Shop, Nell associated with Catholic images, but Dickens recoils from redemption through suffering (Schiefelbein, 2001).

Wordsworth, “Memorials of a Tour in Italy, 1837” (1837-41) including “Musings near Aquapendente, April, 1837,” “At Albano,” “The Cuckoo at Laverna,” “At Vallombrosa,” “Among the Ruins of a Convent in the Apennines,” on the spiritual power of Italian Catholicism.

Newman: “I saw clearly, that in the history of Arianism, the pure Arians were the Protestants, the semi-Arians were the Anglicans, and that Rome now was what it was then. The truth lay, not with the Via Media, but with what was called ‘the extreme party’.”

Newman, Tract 90, argues Catholicity of 39 Articles and of Homilies, ends Tracts for the Times.

Camden Society published first number of The Ecclesiologist, to promote medieval church architecture as a way of promoting high church religion.

****1842****

Frederick Faber, Sights and Thoughts in Foreign Churches, Anglican yearning toward Rome.

Balzac, ‘General Preface’ to La Comédie Humaine; Yeats, “If I were Four-and-Twenty” (1919): “Balzac is the only modern mind which has made a synthesis comparable to that of Dante, and, though certain of his books are on the Index, his whole purpose was to expound the doctrine of his Church as it is displayed, hot in decrees and manuals, but in the institutions of Christendom.” Faber would write hymn, “Faith of Our Fathers,” often sung by Protestants but omitting key Catholic verse: “Faith of our fathers, Mary’s prayers / Shall win our country back to thee; / And through the truth that comes from God / England shall then indeed be free.” (see Hopkins below).

Tennyson’s “Morte d’Arthur,” reviewed by John Sterling: “The poem might perhaps have made the loss of the magic sword, the death of Arthur, and dissolution of the round Table, a symbol for the departure from earth of the whole old Gothic world, with its half-pagan, all-poetic faith, and rude yet mystic blazonries,” but Tennyson is nervous about this conclusion, and concedes to modernism with “God fulfills himself in many ways.”

Jaime Balmes, Protestantism and Catholicity Compared in their Effects on the Civilization of Europe (in Spanish, trans. 1849), on disintegrative effect of Protestantism, exalts medieval universities; contra Guizot’s General History of Civilization in Europe, that Catholicism retards progress.

****1843****

Carlyle, Past and Present, contrasting soulless industrialism with monastic work and spirituality; book 2, “The Ancient Monk,” celebrates Abbot Samson of St. Edmundsbury monastery, identity of work and prayer (“Laborare est Orare ... older than all preached Gospels,” instinctive faith shaping all aspects of life, vs. modern “diseased self-introspection, an agonizing inquiry,” vs. modern papacy with its “phantasmagoria of wax-candles, organ-blasts, Gregorian chants, mass-brayings, purple monsignori” (thus, Carlyle no Anglo-Catholic) (Pope imagined saying: “Under this my ... beautiful wax-light Phantasmagory, kindly hidden from you is an Abyss, of Black Doubt, Scepticism, nay Sansculottic Jacobinism; an Orcus that has no bottom”); a model for reorganizing modern society by captains of industry (“a noble Master, among noble Workers”). Kingsley: monasticism “was all but inconceivable to us till Mr. Carlyle disinterred it in his picture of Abbot Sampson” (qu. Morris, 1984).

Ruskin, Modern Painters (vol. 2 in 1846, vols. 3, 4 in 1856, vol. 5 in 1860). Vol. 3: “whereas all the pleasure of the medieval was in stability, definiteness, and luminousness,” our poetry emphasizes “easily encouraged doubt, easily excited curiosity, habitual agitation, and delight in the changing and the marvellous, as opposed to the old quiet serenity of social custom and religious faith;” “those among us who may be said to believe, are divided ... into ... Romanist and Puritan,” each out to destroy the other; so that “nearly all our powerful men in this age of the world are unbelievers;” complains about Scott’s “incapacity of steady belief in anything,” and the age’s romantically idle looking back to past ages. Vol. 5: “Up to the time of the Reformation it was possible for men even of the highest powers of intellect to obtain a tranquillity of faith, in the highest degree favorable to the pursuit of any particular art;” “Then rising between the infancy of Reformation, and the palsy of Catholicism; -- between a new shell of half-built religion on one side, daubed with untempered mortar, and a falling ruin of outward religion on the other, lizard-

crannied, and ivy-grown; -- rose, on its independent foundation, the faithless and materialized mind of modern Europe."

Dickens, A Christmas Carol: Preface: "I have endeavoured in this Ghostly little book, to rise the Ghost of an Idea, which shall not put my readers out of humour with themselves ... May it haunt their house pleasantly, and no one wish to lay it." Dead Marley compared to ghost of King Hamlet. Scrooge: "every idiot who goes about with 'Merry Christmas,' on his lips, should be boiled ... and buried with a stake of holly through his heart." Capitalist Scrooge like late Puritan banning Christmas (Scrooge's room built by ancient Dutch merchant, who tiled with illustrations from Bible (not saints, etc.). The Dantesque ghost of Marley, "doomed to wander through the world ... and witness what it cannot share, but might have shared", followed by ghost of Christmas past, with branch of green holly; ghost of Christmas present like jolly green giant (out of medieval tales); talk of penance and repentance, intercession (by the Spirits), veneration and Gothic church, old bells, Christmas is associated with cakes and ale, old jollity, Spanish onions (like fat "Spanish friars"), French plums, etc. A few months later, Dickens dreams of Mary Hogarth as a Madonna, dreams of praying for her. "Dickens: 'But answer me one other question! What is the True religion? You think, as I do, that the Form of religion does not so greatly matter, if we try to do good? Or perhaps the Roman Catholic is the best? Perhaps it make one think of God oftener, and believe in him more steadily?' The Spirit: 'For you, it is the best.'" Soon however, Dickens's vaguely evangelical broad church objection to papism would resume.

1844

W. G. Ward continued Oakeley's attack see 1841) in The Ideal of a Christian Church: "the Roman Church seems an admirable model for our imitation ... we should be taught from above ... to repent in sorrow and bitterness of heart our great sin in deserting her communion."

Lady Georgiana Fullerton, Ellen Middleton, on longing for confession within Anglican Church.

Browning's "The Bishop Orders His Tomb at Saint Praxed's Church": on the bishops skepticism, materialism, and idolatry of the material (artistic) object: is Browning's ambivalence like Milton's?

Disraeli, Coningsby, sympathetic portrait of landowner Eustace Lyle, based on convert Ambrose Phillips de Lisle. (In 1857 Wiseman classes De Lisle as a dreamer hoping for reunion by a miracle (like Constable?). In 1840s Disraeli headed "Young England" movement, to recover continuity with aristocratic catholic past. Disraeli would distinguish old loyalist Catholics, loosely tied to Rome, from the radical Tractarian ultra-montagne types. The former illustrate needed loyalty to an older traditional socially responsible society.

The Lives of the English Saints Written by Various Hands at the Suggestion of John Henry Newman (1844-45). Newman: "the series 'might ' serve to make us love our country better, and on truer grounds than before; to teach us to invest her territory, her cities and villages, her hills and spring with sacred associations; to give us an insight into her present historical position in the course of the Divine Dispensation; to instruct us in the capabilities of the English character; and to open upon us the duties and the hope to which that Church is heir, which was in former times the Mother of St. Boniface and St. Ethelreda."

Novalis, Christianity or Europe, trans. John Dalton, orig. 1799: Novalis imagines a new truly Catholic church to restore Europe whose medieval cultural, social, and intellectual unity had been destroyed by the Reformation and the Enlightenment. Begins: "Those were bright, glorious times, when Europe formed but one Christian land; when one Christianity dwelt throughout the civilized part of the world, and one great mutual interest bound together the most remote provinces of this wide spiritual empire." Protestants "introduced many laudable changes ... but ... forgot the necessary result ... they separated the inseparable, they divided the indivisible, Church ... thus religion lost her great political peace-making influence." Protestant religion now reduced to the stark "barren contents" of the Bible, divorced from "the rich material of Catholic faith." There will be coming synthesis of "old and new world": "on the one side we see respect of antiquity, attachment to spiritual institutions ... and the joy of obedience; on the other, a rapturous feeling for liberty is visible, an unlimited expectation of a more extensive sphere of action, and a love for novelty ... a satisfaction in the enjoyment of personal right ... in a powerful desire for nationality;" "the existence of the Church will be true liberty; and, under her guidance, every necessary reformation will be carried on, as a proper and friendly state process."—essay satirized by Schelling poem, Heinz Widerporst.

1845

Newman converts to Catholicism: "Before I got to the end [of Development of Doctrine], I

resolved to be received.” Oxford’s condemnation of Ward’s Ideal (see 1844), and Newman’s conversion, provokes crisis of Oxford Movement.

Maynooth question, crisis over English subsidy to Maynooth College which trained Irish Catholic priests.

Disraeli, Sybil, on monastic social stability, English Catholics as patriotic; Sybil longs “to see the people once more kneel before our blessed Lady” ; Egremont: “I encountered her like a spirit amid the ruins of our abbey. And I am one of ‘the family of sacrilege.’ If she knew that!” Catholic Sybil and noble landowner Egremont will eventually marry, as a synthesis. Sybil: “The monks were ... in every district a point of refuge for all who needed succour, counsel, and protection; a body of individuals having no cares of their own, with wisdom to guide the inexperienced, with wealth to relieve the suffering, and often with power to protect the oppressed.” Disraeli disliked Oxford movement for paying too little attention to English patriotic history (Clausson); thus critiqued flight to Rome in Lothair (see below, 1870).

Margaret Fuller, Woman in the Nineteenth Century: “No figure ... has been received with more fervent reverence than that of the Madonna.” On the unmarried: “The person may gain, undistracted by other relationships, a closer communion with the one. Such a use is made of it by saints and sybils. Or she may be one of the lay sisters of charity, a canoness, bound by an inward vow ... she may, by steadfast contemplation entering into the secret of truth and love, use it for the use of all men, instead of a chosen few.”

Wagner, Tannhäuser, first performed : Tannhäuser, grown weary of Venus’s erotic rites, calls on Mary, makes penitential pilgrimage to Rome. Elizabeth prays to Mary for Tannhäuser, and dies. Ends with miracle of Pope’s staff bursting into bloom, as sign of forgiveness of Tannhäuser.

****1846**** [Johann Döllinger’s The Reformation, 3 vols, 1846-8; stressed chaos in Germany due to Reformation; but Döllinger would be excommunicated over papal infallibility.]

****1847**** Lady Georgiana Fullerton (now a Catholic convert), Grantley Manor, on two sisters, Protestant and Catholic.

Elizabeth Harris, From Oxford to Rome (followed by Rest in the Church 1848), split between Anglican and Roman yearning.

Mrs. Trollope’s Father Eustace: A Tale of the Jesuits; sinister Jesuit sent to seduce and ruin girl so she will repair to a convent, and give her property to the Church, etc.; novel explores her Catholic sensibilities; Eustace leaves Jesuits. Mrs. Trollope’s admiration of quasi-Catholic duty, in conflict with her love of individualism (Schiefelbein, 2001): tries to reconcile the two.

****1848**** Halliwell-Phillips publishes Davies’s 1688 note that “Shakespeare dyed a papist.”

Newman’s Loss and Gain, answering Harris’s novel of 1847. Protestant Sheffield to Charles Reading: “how an Englishman, a gentleman, a man here at Oxford, with all his advantages, can so eat dirt, scraping and picking up all the dead lies of the dark ages -- it’s a miracle.” Marx and Engels, The Communist Manifesto: “All fixed, fast-frozen relations, with their train of ancient and venerable prejudices and opinions are swept away, all new-formed ones become antiquated before they can ossify. All that is solid melts into air, all that is holy is profaned, and men at last are forced to face ... the real condition of their lives and their relations with their fellow men.” “The bourgeoisie, wherever it has got the upper hand, has put an end to all feudal, patriarchal, idyllic relations. It has pitilessly torn asunder the motley feudal ties that bound man to his natural superiors, and has left remaining no other nexus between man and man than naked self-interest, than callous cash-payment. It has drowned the most heavenly ecstasies of religious fervour, of chivalrous enthusiasm, of philistine sentimentalism, in the icy water of egotistical calculation. It has resolved personal worth into exchange value, and in place of the numerous indefeasible chartered freedoms, has set up that single unconscionable freedom—Free Trade”

‘James Fennimore Cooper, The Oak Openings: “Romanists abound, and spots that, half a century since, appeared to be the most improbable places in the world to admit of the rites of the priests of Rome, now hear the chants and prayers of the mass-books. All this shows a tendency to that great commingling of believers, which is doubtless to precede the final fusion of sects, and the predicted end.” “Cooper’s observation is not far from today’s best eschatological ecumenicism, and some time he will receive his due” (E. Fussell, 1993)

****1849**** Clough’s Amours de Voyage: “Luther was unwise ... [overcame the Renaissance and made Theology once again] flood upon Europe” but worse came with Ignatius who “fanaticised

Europe;" Rome is full of "metallic beliefs and regimental devotions;" but later "Alba, thou hauntest me still. Is it religion? ... or is it a vain superstition?"

Ruskin, The Seven Lamps of Architecture; tries to separate medieval art from Catholic belief, and see in it nascent Protestant Christianity; anti-papist attacks (note 1, the Romanist Church's "lying and idolatrous Power is the darkest plague that ever held commission to hurt the Earth") removed in 1880 edn.

Longfellow, Evangeline, evocative sentimental romanticizing of Acadian old simpler world

Catholicism. (see Franchot explication.)

****1850****

James Spedding, "Who wrote Shakespeare's Henry VIII?" (Gentleman's Magazine): divides up the authorship of the play, developing Malone's earlier argument.

"Papal Aggression," PM Russell's phrase to describe Pius IX dividing England into Catholic dioceses.

Wiseman Appeal to the English People defends new hierarchy, and says no harm meant to Anglicans; defuses the agitation. Wiseman always looked to a union of the churches.

Newman, Certain Difficulties Felt by Anglicans in Submitting to the Catholic Church (Anglican Difficulties), expanded in 1879, 1876: "the [church] Establishment, whatever it is be in the eyes of men, whatever its temporal greatness and its secular prospects, in the eyes of faith is a mere wreck."

Gorham decision, Privy Council decision to make Gorham Bishop, thus overturning Anglican Church decision against Gorham because he said Baptism was not valid just in itself. Convinced Manning to leave Anglican Church.

Wordsworth's Prelude: that Chartreuse should remain inviolate.

About 3/4 million Catholics in England, according to Bossy.

****1851****

Newman's The Present Position of Catholics in England: "the only wonder is that she has to be killed so often, and the life so often to be trodden out of her, and her priests and doctors to be so often put down, and her monks and nuns to be exposed, so often, and such vast sums to be subscribed by Protestants ... in order thoroughly, and once for all, and for the very last time, and for ever and ever, to annihilate her once more;" "What need of controversy to refute the claims of Catholicism ... when under a Queen's smile this vast and continuous Tradition had been unrolled before the eyes of men, luminous with the most dazzling colours, and musical with the most subduing strains?" "Protestantism is synonymous with good sense, and Catholicism with weakness of mind, fanaticism, or some unaccountable persuasion or fancy." "No wonder, then, that Protestantism, being the religion of our literature, is become the Tradition of civil intercourse and political life; no wonder that its assumptions are among the elements of knowledge, unchangeable as the moods of logic, or the idioms of language, or their injunctions of good taste;" "it is the incubism of this Tradition, which cumbers the land, and opposes an impregnable barrier between us and each individual Protestant whom we happen to address;" "its especial duty as a religious body, is not to inculcate any particular theological system, but to watch over the anti-Catholic Tradition, to preserve it from rust and decay, to keep it bright and keen, and ready for action on any emergency or peril." "The Maker of all, and only He, can shiver in pieces, this vast enchanted palace in which our lot is cast;" "What are the things that so offend ... It is the whole system of Catholicism; our miracles, and our relics, and our legends of saints; and then our doctrine of indulgences, and our purgatory; and our views of sin, and of the merit of celibacy; our strange formalities in worship ..." "When she had thus beaten the breath out of us, and made us ridiculous, she put us on our feet again, thrust us into a chair, hoisted us up aloft, and carried us about as a sort of Guy Faux, to show to all the boys and riff-raff of the town what a Papist was like;" "as English is the natural tongue, so Protestantism is the intellectual and moral language of the body politic." Newman's portrait of insular Englishman forecasts Dickens's Podsnap in Our Mutual Friend (1865) (Ker, Achievement of JHN; "a neglected satirical masterpiece"). George Eliot found the lectures "full of clever satire;" Döllinger translated it into German. Newman considered it his "best written book."

Ecclesiastical Titles Bill, forbidding Catholics to establish bishoprics -- never enforced.

Ruskin, The Stones of Venice (-1853); at best medieval workmen were creative and detailed, because supported by faith and authority. Venetian decline in art and religion began in 1418, resulting eventually in the Reformation which however threw out the art, which may have caused the stalling of the Reformation; we must see the "Christian" power in medieval art, and not be put

off by the Romanism. "Shall we not ... find that Romanism ... has never shown itself capable of a single great conception since the separation of Protestantism from its side;" "the point where simple reverence and the use of the image to render conception more vivid" becomes idolatry is difficult to judge; indeed Romanist may sometimes be more truly religious than us. "The Protestant Spirit of self-dependence and inquiry was expressed in every line." "It seems to be only modern Protestantism which is entirely ashamed of all symbols and words that appear in anywise like a confession of faith." "On one side stood the reanimated faith, in its right hand the book open ... On the other stood, or seemed to stand, all beloved custom and believed tradition ... the choice must have been a bitter one, even at the best." Protestantism drove Romanism into rigid definitions of what had been "little more than floating errors;" "Multitudes of minds which in other ages might have brought honor and strength to the Church, preaching the more vital truths which it still retained, were now occupied in pleading for arraigned falsehood;" "nor ... was ... Protestantism ... less injurious to itself ... Forced by the Romanist contumely into habits of irreverence, the self-trusting, rashly-reasoning spirit gained ground ... the miracles of the early Church were denied and its martyrs forgotten ... it became impossible even for the best and truest men to know the plague of their own hearts."

Noah Porter, of Yale University: "To those who, like ourselves, look upon the Romish system as a system of dangerous and fatal error, as a monstrous incubus, stifling and oppressing the Gospel of Christ, no place can be so dangerous to the young as a Jesuit college, every exercise of which is made to assume a religious aspect, and to exert a religious influence."

****1852****

Thackeray's Henry Esmond, favorable portrayal of Jesuit Father Holt, forerunner of other such treatments (see Maison, Victorian Vision, 1962).

Newman's sermon, "The Second Spring" (see Southwell letter 1588): resurrection of Catholic Church from what it had become: "a few adherents of the Old Religion, moving silently and sorrowfully about, as memorials of what had been ... cut off from the populous world around them, and dimly seen, as if through a mist or in twilight, as ghosts flitting to and fro, by the high Protestants, the lords of the earth." ("Popular Catholic history told of two death of the English Catholic community, each followed by a miraculous resurrection or Spring. The first death lasted from 1534 to 1570 and the first Spring from 1570 to 1688. The second death lasted from 1688 to the 1830s and was the prelude to the second Spring in Victorian England" --Aveling on Newman's sermon).

Melville, Pierre: "The Church of the Apostles": "When the substance is gone, men cling to the shadow ... by retaining some purely imaginative remainder. The curious effect of this tendency is oftenest evinced in those venerable countries of the old transatlantic world; where still over the Thames one bridge yet retains the monastic title of Blackfriars; though not a single Black Friar but many a pickpocket, has stood on that bank since a good ways beyond the days of Queen Bess; where still innumerable other historic anomalies sweetly and sadly remind the present man of the wonderful procession that preceded him in his new generation." Melville told Hawthorne: "I feel the Godhead is broken up like the bread at the Supper, and we are the pieces. Hence this infinite fraternity of feeling".

Catherine Sinclair, Beatrice; or, The Unknown Relatives: Cairngorum Castle, Protestant, heroic, philanthropic, rational, plain, versus Eaglescairn Castle, Catholic, exploitive, greedy, Jesuitical, imaginative, pageantry (see G. Ceraldi, 2003).

C. W. Dilke rediscovers Caryll transcripts, "part of a huge archive of political, religious, and literary papers attesting to a Catholic and Jacobite world then lost, but which had been very real in Pope's lifetime" (Erskine-Hill, DNB).

****1853****

Kingsley's Hypatia; or, New Foes with an Old Face, furiously anti-Catholic, and anti-celibacy.

Charlotte Brontë's Villette; interesting interaction of Catholic Monsieur Paul Emanuel and heroine Lucy (questionably labeled an anti-Catholic novel); see Schiefelbein, 1996.

Berlioz, L'Enfance du Christ (1850, first version), on Herod and flight to Egypt where holy family is taken in: "thus it was that by an infidel [i.e. Berlioz] / The Saviour was saved."

****1854****

William Finlason (see Chandler 2006) "Was Shakespeare a Catholic" (Rambler, July) (liberal Catholic review, ed. Simpson), on Shakespeare reverence for old religion, during slow Reformation. Cites John Shakespeare testament; Gaunt speech on Catholic England; K. John, consider the source; attacks hierarchy but reverences all other Catholic things; favors friars; praises confession; anti-Puritan; anti-Henry elements in HVIII; compares Delphic ceremony in

Winter's Tale to Mass. Finlason the first to focus on many plays, sees Shakespeare as divided in sympathies, thus forecasting Honigmann and Greenblatt (Chandler, 2006).

Pius IX proclaims dogma of the Immaculate Conception.

****1855****

Arnold, "Stanzas from the Grand Chartreuse" (begun 1851): "We are like children rear'd in shade / Beneath some old-world abbey wall."

Browning, "Bishop Blougram's Apology" (portrait of Cardinal Wiseman), Blougram "styled in partibus / Episcopus, nec non -- (the deuce know what / It's changed to by our novel hierarchy)": "The most pronounced moreover, fixed, precise / And absolute form of faith in the whole world."

Browning, "Childe Roland to the Dark Tower Came": parody of Grail quest, finds himself in familiar hollow, surrounded by hills.

Kingsley's Westward Ho! ("Nothing else binds up quite so successfully the cause of England's greatness with her loss of the Catholic faith" -- R. Knox); attacks Persons and the Jesuit missionaries. But The Hermits (see 1868) will regret some of this attack.

****1856****

James Anthony Froude defends Reformation as moral victory for freedom and enlightenment, in The History of England (-1870): Catholicism is "not credible any more to men of active and original vigour of understanding ... incredible then and ever more to the sane and healthy intelligence which in the long run commands the mind of the world."

Dr. Frederick Lee founds Anglican periodical, The Union (later The Union Review) to promote corporate reunion. Orestes Brownson, "The Mission of America": "Our Protestant ancestors founded the American order, not on their Protestantism, but on the natural law ... long prior to the Protestant movement of Luther ... and they followed out those great principles of natural right, justice, and equality, which Catholic councils, doctors ... during fifteen hundred years had labored to render popular. Thus Catholics should be patriots, "for it is the realization of the Christian ideal of society, and the diffusion ... of that free, pure, lofty and virile civilization which the church loves".

****1857****

Ambrose Phillips, Catholic convert, founds "Association for the Promotion of the Reunion of Christendom," initially approved by English hierarchy; urges negotiated settlement between Canterbury and Rome.

Orestes Brownson's The Convert (Catholic mind "no more restricted in its freedom by the authoritative definitions of the infallible church than the cautious mariner by the charts ...")

Gilbert Scott, Remarks on Secular and Domestic Architecture, Past and Present, definitive though secularized defense of the Gothic movement.

The Lives of Philip Howard, Earl of Arundel, and of Anne Dacres his Wife, probably by her confessor, ed. Lord Norfolk (see 1585).

****1858****

R. Simpson, "What was the Religion of Shakespeare?" I, II, III (Rambler), on Arden-Warwickshire-Clopton Catholicism, John S. could have avoided oath of supremacy, John not poor so conveys property in recusant style, avoiding process common excuse of recusants like John S. on recusant list, defends the John Shakespeare testament: formulae similar ... "from some book of devotions," perhaps from Persons' Directory itself; a similar form attributed to Borromeo prayer: "The form is precisely the same; the variations are only in expression." Borromeo entertained Campion, etc. in 1580, in Milan; notes debt as a cover for recusancy; on Lucy Protestant circle, enemies of Ardens and thus Shakespeare; on Shakespeare's distant relation, through Catholic relatives, to Southampton; on Somerville connections. Cites Catholic letters, "This allegorical tendency grew into an inveterate habit with the Catholic, who ... [were] obliged to express things indirectly." "The wandering habit became at last such a note of a Catholic, that every wanderer was supposed primâ facie to be a recusant." Cites Persons: "It is lawful to elude these interrogations, not by equivocation ... but by other indifferent speeches, as, 'Think you I will live like an atheist?'" etc.; cites Essex's Catholic connections, and significance of performance of RII - S's "motley" saved him, i.e. Eliz's liking for her players, vs. Hayward. In HVIII, "Catherine towers above the rest;" ending probably added by another. Friendship with Jonson began with latter's conversion, Shakespeare godfather (needed to be Catholic), friendship ended when Jonson recanted bec. of Gunpowder plot. Cites church papists strategy; Davies recollection. Says Döllinger believed Shakespeare was Catholic; "the first to bring an historical approach to the question ... and for offering the first informed defence of John's Shakespeare's Spiritual Last Will" (Chandler, 2006).

Newman, The Idea of a University, "Whether we will or no, the phraseology and diction of

Shakespeare, of the Protestant formularies, of Milton, of Pope, of Johnson's table talk, and of Walter Scott, have become a portion of the vernacular tongue ... The man in the comedy spoke prose without knowing it; and we Catholics, without consciousness and without offence, are ever repeating the half sentences of dissolute playwrights and heretical partisans and preachers. " (See Chesterton, 1926, qualifying Newman's concession of English literature to Protestantism.)

Newman on the Gentleman (see Pope and Arnold on standard establishment style): "If he be an unbeliever, he will be too profound and large-minded to ridicule religion or to act against itself; he is too wise to be a dogmatist or fanatic in his infidelity. Her respects piety and devotion; he even supports institutions as venerable, beautiful, or useful, to which he does not assent ... it contents him to decline its mysteries without assailing or denouncing them."

"in proportion as the Lutheran leaven spread, it became fashionable to say that faith was, not an acceptance of the revealed doctrine, not an act of the intellect, but a feeling, an emotion, an affection, an appetency; and, as this view of faith obtained, so was the connexion of faith with truth and knowledge more and more either forgotten or denied." "many men there are who, devoted to one particular subject of thought, and making its principles the measure of all things, become enemies to revealed religion before they know it ... Simply because they have made their own science, whatever it is, political economy, or geology, or astronomy, to the neglect of theology, the centre of all truth." "Right reason ... leads the mind to the Catholic faith ... But reason, considered as a real agent in the world ... is far from taking so straight and satisfactory a direction. It considers itself from first to last independent and supreme; it requires no external authority; it makes a religion for itself. Even though it accepts Catholicism, it does not go to sleep; it has an action and development of its own Divine grace ... does not by its presence supersede nature; nor is nature at once brought into simple concurrence and coalition with grace. Nature pursues its course, now coincident with that of grace, now parallel to it, now across, now divergent ..." The Church should have jurisdiction over Theology, but sometimes the institution is subject to a particular bias or drift: "We have an instance of such a case in the Spanish Inquisition—here was a purely Catholic establishment, devoted to the maintenance, or rather the ascendancy of Catholicism, keenly zealous for theological truth, the stern foe of every anti-Catholic idea, and administered by Catholic theologians; yet it in no proper sense belonged to the Church. It was simply and entirely a state institution, it was an expression of that very Church-and-King spirit which has prevailed in these islands; nay, it was an instrument of the State, according to the confession of the acutest Protestant historians, in its warfare against the Holy See. Considered "materially," it was nothing but Catholic; but its spirit and form were earthly and secular, in spite of whatever faith and zeal and sanctity and charity were to be found in the individuals who from time to time had a share in its administration."

"We have, it is true, a Protestant literature; but ... in the case of at least half of a dozen ... of the most popular authors, it comes to us with very considerable alleviations. For instance, there is a call on us for thankfulness that the most illustrious among English writers has so little of a Protestant about him that Catholics have been able, without extravagance, to claim him as one of their own, and that enemies to our creed have allowed us that he is only not a Catholic, because, and as far as, his time forbade it ... Whatever passages may be gleaned from his drama disrespectful to ecclesiastical authority, still these are but passages; on the other hand, there is in Shakespeare neither contempt for religion nor scepticism, and he upholds the broad laws of moral and divine truth Whatever indulgence he may allow himself in light thoughts or unseemly words, yet his admiration is reserved for sanctity and truth." 301-2 (Newman probably influenced here by Simpson with whom Newman was associated on The Rambler.)

"in the medieval ... unbelief necessarily made its advances under the language and the guise of faith; whereas in the present, when universal toleration prevails, and it is open to assail revealed truth Unbelief in consequence throws off the mask ... and confronts us ... with a direct assault. And I have no hesitation in saying ... that I prefer to live in an age when the fight is in the day, not in the twilight; and think it a gain to be speared by a foe, rather than to be stabbed by a friend."

****1859****

Prayer of thanksgiving over Gunpowder Plot removed from Anglican Prayer Book.

John Stuart Mill, On Liberty: on need of hearing contrary opinions: "The most intolerant of churches, the Roman Catholic Church, even at the canonization of a saint, admits ... a 'devil's advocate'." Also, it allows a clerical elite, not laity, to read forbidden books. "History teems with instances of truth put down by persecution. To speak only of religious opinions: the Reformation

broke out at least twenty times before Luther, and was put down,” etc. “If the intellect and judgment of mankind ought to be cultivated, a thing which Protestants at least do not deny ...”

****1860****

Chetham Society prints the Hoghton Will in Lancashire and Cheshire Wills, by Rev. G. J. Piccope (see 1923), without commenting on “Shakeshafte.”

George Eliot, The Mill on the Floss: Maggie awed by A Kempis, “here was a sublime height to be reached without the help of outward things ... It flashed through her ... for the first time she saw the possibility ... of taking her stand out of herself, and looking at her own life as an insignificant [!] part of a divinely-guided whole... She had not perceived ... the inmost truth of the old monk’s outpourings, that renunciation remains sorrow, though a sorrow borne willingly ... I suppose that is the reason why the small old-fashioned book ... works miracles to this day ... it remains to all time a lasting record of human needs and human consolations ... with the same passionate desires, the same strivings, the same failures, the same weariness” (4.3); “provides only a formalization, if not a rationalization, of her almost masochistic willingness to subordinate herself to the wishes, first of her father, and then of Tom” (Philip Rule, Coleridge and Newman, 2004).

Burckhardt, The Civilization of the Renaissance in Italy (trans. 1878). “In the Middle Ages both sides of human consciousness -- that which was turned within as that which was turned without -- lay dreaming or half awake beneath a common veil. The veil was woven of faith, illusion and childish prepossession, though which the world and history were seen clad in strange hues. ... Man was conscious of himself only as member of a race, people, party, family, or corporation -- only through some general category. In Italy this veil first melted into air; an objective treatment and consideration of the State and of all the things in this world became possible. The subjective side at the same time asserted itself with corresponding emphasis; man became a spiritual individual and recognized himself as such.”

Hawthorne, The Marble Faun, Hilda still a “daughter of the Puritans” but seems to convert to Catholicism and becomes attendant of a Virgin shrine.

****1861****

Orestes Brownson, “Catholic Polemics,” denounces the quality of Catholic intellectual life, its complaisance, its lack of presence in modern research, its fear of creativity, its failure to address modern forms of thought.

****1863****

George Eliot, Romola: evokes Savanorola’s Rome, Romola becomes Mater Dolorosa. Eliot influences Simpson’s pioneering treatment of Shakespeare’s social backgrounds: “In ‘Romola’ the population of Florence is not only made the setting and background of the tale, but it takes a prominent part in the conduct of the story” (Simpson, “George Eliot’s Novels,” Home and Foreign Review 1863). Simpson told Lord Acton in 1874 that he got the idea for his Shakespeare work from Eliot.

Newman letter: “This age of the Church is peculiar; in former times, primitive and medieval, there was not the extreme centralization which now is in use. If a private theologian said anything free, another answered him. If the controversy grew, then it went to a Bishop, a theological faculty, or to some foreign university. The Holy See was but the court of ultimate appeal. Now, if I, as a private priest, put any thing into print, Propaganda answers me at once. How can I fight with such a chain on my arm? ... There was true private judgement in the primitive and medieval schools—there are no schools now, no private judgment (in the religious sense of the phrase), no freedom that is, of opinion. That is, no exercise of the intellect.”

Burne-Jones, painting, “The Merciful Knight,” attacked in 1864 Art Journal: “We cannot indeed but fear that such ultra manifestations of medievalism, however well meant, must tend inevitably, though of course unconsciously, to bring ridicule upon truths which we all desire to hold in veneration,” i.e. by making too Catholic and literal what Protestants hold more symbolically.

****1864****

A. F. Rio, Shakespeare; on Catholicism of Stratford area, and Ardens, Lucy issue, on John Shakespeare recusancy, Shakespeare defending Catholicism in his plays. (Rio had published History of Christian Art (trans. 1854, orig. French 1836-51), arguing that true art is impossible without Catholic piety and mysticism.

J. M. Jephson, Shakespeare: His Birthplace, Home, and Grave: discusses John S’s recusancy; cites 1614 Stratford Chamberlain account as “a very curious entry” (“Item, for on quart of sack, and on quart of clarrett winne, given to a preacher at the New Place, XXd”), usual if the town was sending preacher to “talk” to a resistant parishioner; if Shakespeare’s willing guest, Shakespeare would have paid.

Henry Manning, A Letter to the Rev. E. B. Pusey: “I rejoice with all my heart in all the workings

of the Holy Ghost in the Church of England ... the English people as a body are baptized ... is thereby placed in a state of justification ... to be out of the Church is no personal sin [unless knowledgeable] ... I am willing to call it [C of E] a teacher of truths, because many fragmentary truths ... still survive the Reformation ... I do not believe the alternative before us is Catholicism or Atheism;" "Seventeen or eighteen thousand men, educated with all the advantages of the English schools and University, endowed with large corporate revenues, and distributed all over England, maintain a perpetual protest ... against the catholic Church."

Newman, Letter to Pusey rejects union.

Pius IX issues Syllabus of Errors. Earlier language (anathematizing argument that church and state should be separated) replaced in favor of vaguer language binding Catholics to submit to Pope "not only in matters of faith and morals, but also in those which concern the discipline and government of the church dispersed throughout the world."

Newman's Apologia, on "the great revolution of mind, which led me to leave my own home, to which I was bound by so many strong and tender ties," thus the reverse of the first trauma; "it is the vast Catholic body itself, and it only, which affords an arena for both combatants in that awful, never-dying duel ... Every exercise of Infallibility is brought into act by an intense and varied operation of the Reason, both as its ally and as its opponent;" repelled Kingsley's attack that his Catholicism was un-English. "I trust that all European races will ever have a place in the Church, and assuredly I think that the loss of the English, not to say the German element, in its composition has been a most serious misfortune." : "The Liberalism which gives a colour to society now ... is the educated lay world ... it is nothing else than that deep, plausible scepticism ... as being the development of human reason, as practically exercised by the natural man."

Charles Reade, The Cloister and the Hearth.

Arnold, "The Function of Criticism at the Present Time": "after all, the criticism I am really concerned with,--the criticism which alone can much help us for the future ... is a criticism which regards Europe as being, for intellectual and spiritual purposes, one great confederation, bound to a joint action and working to a common result; and whose members have, for their proper outfit, a knowledge of Greek, Roman, and Eastern antiquity, and of one another."

****1865****

Dublin Review article on Rio, perhaps by Rev. John C. Earle, sets up issues, cites respect for old religion, on John Shakespeare Will "drawn up in the style of similar forms well known to Catholics."

Arnold, "Eugénie de Guérin," in Essays in Criticism: Catholicism's setting and outward circumstance have "a nobleness and amplitude which in Protestantism is often wanting ... have, from the antiquity of this form of religion, from its pretensions to universality, from its really widespread prevalence, from its sensuousness, something European, august, and imaginative; in Protestantism they often have ... something provincial, mean, and prosaic. In revenge Protestantism has a future before it ... while Catholicism appears to be bent on widening the breach between itself and the modern spirit." She and her brother, Maurice, had urbanity, "distinction."

Francis Parkman, Pioneers of France in the New World, one of many books tracing the struggle between the parties of freedom (British Protestantism) and authoritarianism (French Catholicism). Orestes Brownson, The American Republic, its religious destiny to respect freedom of church and state.

****1866****

Christopher Knight Watson, "Was Shakespeare a Roman Catholic?," Edinburgh Review, attacks the Catholic argument in Rio and Rambler, attacks issue of John Shakespeare's recusancy and Will, attacks Rio's Catholic plotting in plays, gives "evening mass" argument.

Henry Manning, archbishop of Westminster, The Reunion of Christendom: "theory that Christendom ... consists of three parts, the Roman, the Greek, and the Anglicans, is a heresy;" there is only one church in fact and in theory; "to pray for the reunion of the Church, is to assume that it can be divided." Nevertheless, "That an Association to promote the reunion of England ... are facts new in our history since the separation of England from Catholic unity ... We gladly recognize in it an influence and an impulse of supernatural grace. It is a wonderful reaction from the days within living memory when fidelity to the Church of England was measured by repulsion from the Church of Rome ... all this is as beautiful and fascinating as the image of the Heavenly Jerusalem which the Apostle saw coming down from Heaven." Nevertheless, "We can offer unity only on the condition on which we hold it -- unconditional submission to the living and perpetual

voice of the Church of God.”

Kingsley, Hereward the Wake: Hereward fights Rome which has subjected the Danes to superstition and weakened the Anglo-Saxons.

Elizabeth Gaskell, Wives and Daughters; Squire Hamley, his prejudice once over, takes in his deceased son's French Catholic wife and child.

****1867****

James Anthony Froude, “Times of Erasmus and Luther” (in Short Studies on Great Subjects, First Series): “Goethe thought that Erasmus, and men like Erasmus, had struck upon the right track; and if they could have retained the direction of the mind of Europe, there would have been more truth, and less falsehood, among us at the present time,” but Luther loosed theology to the “passions of the multitude.” “Never in all their history, in ancient times or modern ... have mankind thrown out of themselves anything so grand, so useful, so beautiful, as the Catholic church once was” (444), but “the body remained; the mind was gone away.” Thus the powerful reforming words of Erasmus might have solved the situation. But if Erasmus had prevailed, Europe would have ended up with educated skeptics, while the multitude remained superstitious; manly popular Protestantism is better.

“Revival of Romanism” (Fourth Series, 1883) “In my own boyhood it hung about some few ancient English families like a ghost of the past.”

Longfellow and Charles Eliot Norton found the Dante Society in Cambridge, Mass.; to these “the world had been going to the dogs since the time of Dante. Dante, to them, appeared as the perfect expression of a perfect state of society,” forecasting T. S. Eliot on Dante (Curtius).

****1868****

G. Eliot, The Spanish Gypsy.

Kingsley, The Hermits, perhaps regretting earlier extreme anti-Catholic works: “In this age, as in every other age of materialism and practical atheism, a revulsion in favor of superstition [i.e. Catholicism] is at hand.” 83

****1869****

Richard Simpson, “The Early Authorship of Shakespeare” (North British Review): “The task still remains, to trace his political correspondences and thus to discover his political, and even perhaps his philosophical and religious, affinities. It is only thus that we shall come to understand the true growth and the vital nature of the Elizabethan drama ... He is regarded rather as a mirror ... than as a person ... It would be a good deed to remove him from this Epicurean heaven of moral indifference, and to show that he took, as a reasoner, a decided part in the affairs which engrossed the highest minds of his day.”

Browning, The Ring and the Book (pub.): “And so I have the Papacy complete / From Peter first to Alexander last” (ll. 10-11). Pope “a priest who thinks”. Pompilia’s pregnancy like a virgin birth, she is likened to Our Lady of All Sorrows by priest, Caponsacchi’s Catholicism humanized, Guido like Gilbert Osmond. Pope: “what if it be the mission of that age / My death will usher into life, to shake / This torpor of assurance from our creed, / Reintroduce the doubt discarded ... As we broke up that old faith of the world, / Have we, next age, to break up this new.” Browning contemplating a Catholic-style saint in a context of pluralism and conflicting views.

W. H. Prescott: “Many, very many, all too many ways lead to Rome. Idleness leads there; for Rome saves the trouble of independent thought. Dissoluteness leads there, for it impairs moral vigor. Conservatism, foolish conservatism, leads there, in the hope that the conservatives of the oldest abuse will be a shield for all abuses. Sensualism leads there, for it delights in parade and magnificent forms. Materialism leads there, for the superstitious can adore an image and think to become purified by bodily torments, hair shirts, and fasting, turning all religion into acts of the physical organs” (qu. Franchot 57).

Arnold, Culture and Anarchy: important that the Episcopal and Presbyterian strands were both present in the Church of England at the Reformation, and that Presbyterianism was only extruded gradually” “Perhaps if a government like that of Elizabeth, with secular statesmen like the Ceciles, and ecclesiastical statesmen like Whitgift, could have been prolonged, Presbyterianism might, by a wise mixture of concession and firmness, have been absorbed in the Establishment;” thus nonconformists should be reunited with the mainstream of national life, vs. the provincial Puritan ideal, “The Dissidence of Dissent and the Protestantism of the Protestant religion,” as though these things were good in themselves.

****1870****

Disraeli’s Lothair: “He took refuge in the wild but beautiful thought of a reconciliation between Rome and England;” “I look upon our nobility joining the Church of Rome as the greatest calamity ... it is an abnegation of patriotism;” **about conversion of Marquis of Bute in 1868, and**

D. was witness for his marriage in 1872 at Brompton Oratory; admiration of religious power of Catholicism, yet opposed to political liberty and national loyalty. L. mightily attracted to Catholicism as only bulwark against atheism, plan cathedral. "He took refuge in the wild but beautiful thought of a reconciliation between Rome and England." Great empathy for Catholicism, but then sees it enmeshed in Vatican manipulation and plotting. L. persuaded by republican Theodora for whom her conscience is enough religion. At end it looks like Lothair will be invited to Vatican Council as prominent Anglican layman felt efficacy of Eucharist, much more than high church allowed.

First Vatican Council (1868-70) defined papal infallibility. Observing, Charles Eliot Norton wrote in The Nation that the world had become divided "between the principle of authority and that of freedom in matters of opinion, between faith and skepticism, between supernaturalism and science, between obscurantism and intelligence." In reaction, Döllinger left the church. Newman: "I saw the new definition yesterday, and am pleased at its moderation ... The terms are vague and comprehensive, and, personally, I have no difficulty in admitting it."

****1871****

Richard Simpson argues for Shakespeare's authorship of insurrection scene of Sir Thomas Moore; as does Spedding in 1872.

Swinburne, "Hymn of Man (During the Session in Rome of the Oecumenical Council)" (in Songs Before Sunrise) ending "Glory to Man in the highest! for Man master of things" one of series of anti-Rome poems. See Hopkins 1875.

Newman letter to Arnold: "in centuries to come, there may be found out some way of uniting what is free in the new structure of society with what is authoritative in the old, without any base compromise with 'Progress' and 'Liberalism.'"

****1872****

John Morris, ed. The Troubles of Our Catholic Forefathers Related by Themselves (1872-1877), prints many recusant documents, like the life of Fr. William Weston, etc., vivid painful accounts.

George Eliot, Middlemarch (1871-2), pref. on Dorothea as St. Theresa in post-Catholic world: "Many Theresas have been born who found for themselves no epic life ... for these later-born Theresas were helped by no coherent social faith and order ... Here and there is born a Saint Theresa, foundress of nothing, whose loving heart-beats and sobs after an un-attained goodness trembled off and are dispersed among hindrances, instead of centering in some long-recognizable deed." (See Leavis on Eliot.)

Charles Eastlake, A History of the Gothic Revival: An Attempt to Show How the Taste for Mediaeval Architecture Which Lingered in England During the Two Last Centuries Has Since Been Encouraged and Developed; still the classic work on the subject (pace Kenneth Clark); cites the influence of the taste for medievalism encouraged by Scott, Percy, Lingard, Chateaubriand, and Schlegel.

****1874****

Richard Simpson, "The Political Use of the Stage in Shakespeare's Time," "The Politics of Shakespeare's Historical Plays" (New Shakespeare Society's Transactions; this "Politics" essay played "a central role in the professionalization of Shakespeare studies" (see Hugh Grady, The Modernist Shakespeare 1991); one of the first historicist interpretations of English literature (Gary Taylor, "Forms of Opposition"); celebrated as "precursor" of historicist critics by Lily Campbell, Shakespeare's "Histories." After welcoming King James, Shakespeare was soon undeceived. "We see him in his earliest work choosing stock examples of weak princes ruined by their favourites and ministers ... Then we find him dilating on the miseries of the just rebellion ... Then, in Henry V, we have a manifesto of the political scheme of the friends of Essex ..." On King John pruning Protestant propaganda of earlier play, idealizing young Arthur who is made parallel to Mary, Queen of Scots, after whose death King John is like Elizabeth, many other contemporary parallels; moral is to avoid foreign intervention, whatever injustice you are suffering. On RII, the ruinous taxation evokes for Shakespeare ruinous recusant fines, language paralleling Verstegan's; on Elizabeth as in hands of selfish favorite. Henry IV evokes uprising of 1569. Henry V and Essex whose acts "point to a grand idea of a union of all parties ... equal justice to all, a general toleration in religion," believed war would create national unity. In Henry VI, Margaret is like Leicester, on political disaster that overtakes innocence in high places. "The only reproach which he [Shakespeare] allows himself to make against the old religion is connected with the political pretensions of the papacy. All the libelous satire against monks and nuns with which the old King John is filled, was cleared away by him. He gives us quite natural and touching pictures of the piety (superstitious in the eyes of his generation) of Richard II, and Henry

V ... This abstinence on his part places him in the strongest possible contrast to all his brother playwrights;" "as ... our knowledge of Elizabethan politics is very one-sided, through the victorious cause having thoroughly effaced the conquered, it will be necessary to understand the drift and pith of the opposition literature of this period."

Gladstone, The Vatican Decrees in their Bearing on Civil Liberty, responding to First Vatican Council, argues that Catholics's civil allegiance is questionable. Newman, "Letter to Norfolk ... on ... Gladstone" (Certain Difficulties, vol. 2): cites Paul V's excommunication of Elizabeth as example of fallible mistaken papal policy; cites Pre-Reformation papal corruption as resulting in Reformation; "I see no inconsistency in my being at once a good Catholic and a good Englishman."

Matthew Arnold's Higher Schools and Universities in Germany: "Long before the Reformation serious and intelligent Catholics, could, for their single selves separate these accretions [i.e. "its load of popular error" and "Ultramontanism"] from their religion" (vs. Literature and Dogma claim that Catholicism was all of a piece and must be jettisoned).

Arnold letter: "My ideal would be, for Catholic countries, the development of something like the Old Catholicism, retaining as much as possible of old religious services and usages, but becoming more and more liberal in spirit."

****1875****

Edward Dowden, Shakespeare: A Critical Study of his Mind and Art (3rd edn. c. 1880), "most influential Shakespeare biography in the history of literary criticism" (N. Wallace, ELH, 2005); pays tribute to Simpson. Pref to first edn. attempts "to observe ... in its several stages the growth of his intellect and character from youth to full maturity." Shakespeare illustrates "the Protestant type of character": "Energy, devotion to the fact, self-government, tolerance ... a resolution to judge all things from a purely human standpoint, these grow upon us as habits of thought and feeling" (i.e. proto-Bloom). Thus Henry V: "Henry's freedom from egoism, his modesty, his integrity, his joyous humour, his practical piety, his habit of judging things by natural and not artificial standards." Suggests four periods: "in the workshop," "in the world," "out of the depths," "on the heights."

Hopkins, The Wreck of the Deutschland: "Startle the poor sheep back! is the shipwreck then a harvest ... ?": climax of a long debate Hopkins is having with the radical anti-Catholic republican Swinburne whose rhythms Hopkins has been adapting in rebuttal style. Nuns had been thrown out as result of Bismarck's Kulturkampf against the church. (See Renée V. Overholser, "'Our King Back, Oh, Upon English Souls!': Swinburne, Hopkins, and the Politics of Religion," Religion and the Arts 5.1-2 (2001).)

Emile de Laveleye, Protestantism and Catholicism, in Their Bearing upon the Liberty and Prosperity of Nations (trans.): Catholicism impoverished its nations.

Tennyson, Queen Mary, an august character in Spanish Catholic toils, ends with triumphant ascendancy of Elizabeth: "God save the crown! the Papacy is no more;" followed by Becket in 1879, making Becket a spiritual hero versus social conformity, but also a non-papist Catholic.

Manning, the Vatican Decrees in their bearing on Civil Allegiance, answering Gladstone, arguing that Catholic allegiance was "as full, perfect and complete since the Council as it was before."

****1876****

George Wilkes, Shakespeare from an American Point of View; Including an Inquiry as to His Religious Faith, on family Catholicism, on Catholic importance of relation to Essex and Lucy persecution; speculates that "Shakespeare's 'Confession of Faith,' if he made one, was quietly buried with him," on reasons for "evening mass;" on reverence for old religion and contempt for Protestants in plays.

Edward Russell, "The Religion of Shakespeare," The Theological Review: "In the graver passages of Shakespeare we have many hints of what our national literature of imagination might have been if oneness and universality of religious feeling had been perpetuated after the Reformation, and imbued at the same time by that event and its consequences with a somewhat more earnest religious sensibility than existed in purely Roman Catholic times. In other words, the religion of Shakespeare is very much what the religion of all English men of good life would have been, if the Church of England had continued for the whole nation what its formularies and authoritative literature assumed that it would be;" otherwise a general discussion.

Daniel Deronda: Gwendolyn visiting Diplow Abbey: "I suppose the old generations must be angry with us because we have altered things so much."

Cardinal James Gibbons, The Faith of our Fathers, crisp, clear, influential apologia for

Catholicism. [Consider “Anglican assumption that ... both these distinctive affiliations might limit Roman Catholic and Jewish loyalties to English national identity” (C. Scheinberg, in *Camb Companion to Vict. Poetry* 2000).

Edward Dering, Freville Chase, pro-Catholicism.

****1877****

Charles Peirce, “The Fixation of Belief,” pragmatic science vs. priest-ridden authority.

Persons, “Of the Life and Martyrdom of Father Edmond Campian,” unfinished ms. at Stonyhurst, pub. in Letters and Notices 11 (1877): Sidney as Ambassador to Prague “had diverse large and secret conferences with Fr. Campian about matters of religion; in which he seemed to go away fully persuaded ... that the only truth was with the Catholics, albeit not to lose these flattering hopes of the world which then fawned upon him he said it was necessary for him to hold on to the course which then hitherto he had followed, but yet promised never to hurt or injure an Catholics, which I think for the most part he performed.” Earlier, Persons describes Tarleson, Sidney’s tutor, arguing about biblical evidence with Campion, Tarleson’s arguments being so weak that they convinced Campion to decide for Catholicism; did Sidney witness this debate?

Lord Acton, lecture, “The History of Freedom in Christianity,” representing his unwritten grand opus, on the importance of the Church in historically protecting freedom against civil authority.

Henry Foley edits Records of the English Province of the Society of Jesus (7 vols., 1877-84).

****1878****

[Johannes Janssen, Geschichte des deutschen Volkes seit dem Ausgang des Mittelalters, 8 vols., 1878-94, trans. 1896-1910: stressed flourishing of pre-Reformation Catholicism in Germany; because of Janssen, no one could now write of the Reformation without weighing the Catholic side (Taine). Provided “a dominant historical framework for Catholic interpretation of the Reformation during subsequent generations;” used archives extensively; interested in Kulturgeschichte; acc. to Janssen, “Luther’s error was not that he saw the need for reform, but that he failed to see that all the necessary means were at hand and already at work. He therefore undid past achievements and nipped new reform in the bud” (A. Dickens et al, Reformation in Historical Thought).]

Matthew Arnold: The Catholic Church, along with the Church of England, “kept in great measure the traditional form of Catholicism and thus preserved its link with the past, its share in the beauty and the poetry and the charm for the imagination of Catholicism ... I persist in thinking that Catholicism has, from this superiority, a great future before it; that it will endure while all the Protestant sects (in which I do not include the Church of England) dissolve and perish. I persist in thinking that the prevailing form for the Christianity of the future will be a form of Catholicism; but a Catholicism purged, opening itself to the light and air, having the consciousness of its own poetry, freed from its sacerdotal despotism and freed from its pseudo-scientific apparatus of superannuated dogma” (“Irish Catholicism and British Liberalism,” rpt. in Mixed Essays, 1880).

Third Lambeth Conference defines “the Lambeth Quadrilateral,” as “the basis on which approach might be ... made toward Reunion” (Scripture has all things necessary; Apostles’ Creed, etc.).

Richard Watson Dixon, History of the Church of England: “The old system had already, at the opening of the Reformation, shewn itself expansive enough to contain the new ideas which were transforming literature and art: and need never have become irreconcilable with the religious developments of the age.” Dixon writes as high Anglican insisting on Catholic roots: “A Reformation was needed in many things; but it was carried out on the whole by bad instruments and attended by great calamities.”

****1879****

S. A. Harper, “Was Shakespeare a Catholic?,” American Catholic Quarterly Review: intelligent discussion of some crux passages.

[Leo XIII’s Aeterni Patris, urged recovery of medieval heritage vs. modern heresy, launched neo-Thomism.]

****1880****

[Wilhelm Maurenbrecher, Geschichte der katholischen Reformation, emphasized and coined term, “Catholic Reformation,” not just counter-Reformation.]

Matthew Arnold, “The Study of Poetry”: “The future of poetry is immense ... Our religion has materialized itself in the fact, in the supposed fact; it has attached its emotion to the fact, and now the fact is failing it ...”

Dostoyevsky, The Brothers Karamazov, “the last major Christian artist to possess fully the sacramental knowledge of man alive in a society that moves” (Malcolm Ross, 1954). Grand Inquisitor portrays Catholic church as using miracle, mystery, and authority, and condemning the

burden of freedom that Christ offers.

****1881****

James's Portrait of a Lady; begins with quasi-eucharist ritual like Ulysses; Isabel in love with "liberty" and self-development, finds old life and "historic consciousness" in Europe, and a decision she commits to, a freely chosen version of what Osmond will prate about as the sacrament of marriage ("he spoke in the name of something sacred and precious—the observance of a magnificent form"); sees the ghost at Gardencourt (50), earned by suffering, sees ghost of Ralph; Ralph as unwitting Iago ("I should like to put money in her purse"); vs. Henrietta on easy divorce ("nothing is more common in our Western cities, and it's to them, after all, that we must look in the future"). Isabel in grief communes in Rome: "There was no gentler nor less consistent heretic than Isabel; the firmest of worshippers, gazing at dark altar-pictures or clustered candles, could not have felt more intimately the suggestiveness of these objects nor have been more liable at such moments to a spiritual visitation." Contrast Protestant Dorothea's similar meditation on the "weight of unintelligible Rome" in Middlemarch. At end, Mother Catherine in charge of Pansy and a "woman with whom benevolence was a habit and whose conception of duty was the acceptance of every care. It fell with a leaden weight on Isabel's ears ... it seemed to represent the surrender of personality, the authority of the Church". At end, Henrietta marrying Bantling says "he appreciated intellect" but "doesn't exaggerate its claims. I sometimes think we do so in the United States". Isabella to Henrietta: "I shall never make another promise. I made such a solemn one four years ago, and I've succeeded so ill in keeping it." Also, "almost anything seemed preferable to repudiating the most serious act—the single sacred act of her life. That appeared to make the whole future hideous ... an admission that their whole attempt had proved a failure ... Once they missed it nothing else would do; there was no conceivable substitute for that success": combine American accomplishment and sacrament. Isabel returns to Rome, the American committed to union with Europe, liberty with history, etc.

Joseph Henry Shorthouse, John Inglesant (privately printed 1881): ancestor guiltily took over dispossessed abbey given him by HVIII; Fr. Sancta Clara, Jesuit, hopes Inglesant will be instrument to unite the churches, since Laud is so close and was offered cardinalship; at end Inglesant is "prompted by the most sincere desire to find out a way both for himself and for others, in which the highest spiritual walk ... might be possible within the Church of Rome;" but General of the Jesuits demands absolute obedience to Rome. Inglesant sees all this as inner conflict between obedience/faith and freedom/reason; pleads for preservation of the English church (though "illogical") where these two things are in balance. Made Little Gidding a tourist attraction. (R. Knox in 1913: "what I held to be a duty myself -- namely, to remain in communion with the Church of England and to work and pray for a final corporate 'reunion' with the Holy See. To show that such a reunion was not impossible, I recommended the reading of my old friend John Inglesant").

Verlaine, Sagesse (major poetic volume, reflecting his Baudelairian Catholicism, see Symons below, 1899).

****1882****

Herbert Thurston, S. J., "The Religion of Shakespeare," The Month: answers Malone (see 1790) on the John Shakespeare testament; cites Simpson and earlier writers; cites Arden Catholicism, Shakespeare's unregistered marriage, possible religious conflict with Lucy.

Wagner, Parsifal, first performed: Amfortas, king of the grail, is wounded by yielding to sexual temptation, and the spear (that pierced Christ's side) stolen. Parsifal, pure of heart, regains spear and heals king, and holds the Grail aloft in final epiphany.

Nietzsche, The Gay Science: "After Buddha was dead, his shadow was still shown for centuries in a cave—a tremendous, gruesome shadow ... God is dead; but, given the way of men, there may still be caves for thousands of years in which his shadow will be shown—and we—we still have to vanquish his shadow, too." "The event itself is far too great, too distant, too remote from the multitude's capacity for comprehension even for the tidings of it to be thought of as having arrived as yet;" "how much must collapse now ... for example, the whole of our European morality."

"We philosophers and free spirits feel, when we hear the news that 'the old god is dead,' as if a new day shone on us; our heart overflows with gratitude, amazement, premonitions, expectation." (Kaufman trans. based on 2nd edn. of 1887)

****1883****

Arnold: Newman "has adopted, for the doubts and difficulties which beset men's minds to-day, a solution, which, to speak frankly, is impossible."

****1885****

Arnold, "Emerson": on Newman at St. Mary's: "Who could resist the charm of that spiritual

apparition, gliding in the dim afternoon light through the aisles of St. Mary's ... a 'last enchantment of the Middle Age'."

Pater, Marius the Epicurean: cites "the aesthetic charm of the catholic church, her evocative power over all that is eloquent and expressive in the better mind of man, her outward comeliness, her dignifying convictions about human nature."

****1886****

[Ludwig von Pastor, Gesichte der Päpste (History of the Popes: From the Close of the Middle Ages) (16 volumes, 1886-1933, trans. 1891-1953), that Catholic reforms were active in late middle ages, established firmly the notion of "Catholic Reformation," not just counter-Reformation.]

In letter, Hopkins seems to interpret Wordsworth's "have sight of that immortal sea" as sight of old Catholic England: "I shd. think St. George and St Thomas of Canterbury wore roses in heaven for England's sake on the day that ode, not without their intercession, was penned."

****1887****

Rev. John Pollen S.J. begins writing articles on Elizabethan Catholicism; argued that English government caused Reformation by forcefully imposing it from above.

Francis Aidan Gasquet, Henry VIII and the Monasteries: "doing much to rescue a crucial aspect of late medieval religion from the calumny of centuries" (Duffy, Historical Research, 2004); but in 1900's Gasquet's scholarship became sloppy and was discredited by Protestant C. G. Coulton. "Gasquet's strength and originality lay in his setting of institutional history in a rich social and intellectual context, and this was certainly a healthy corrective to biased Protestant views of the dissolution. On the other hand, he was flagrantly inaccurate in his transcription and citations of sources ..." (A. Dickens et al, Reformation in Historical Thought).

John M. Robertson, The Religion of Shakespeare: "no religious habit of mind whatever." "As yet the religious temperament was in the main the temperament of mediaeval lay Catholicism, unpsychological, childlike, openminded, taking creed in the concrete, and seeing the main part of the life of faith in the ceremonial of the church. Pre-Puritan England was not concerned about its soul ... the great difference wrought by Protestantism was that it drove the spirit of religion in to the common life, which it made at once darker and more conscientious ... But in Shakespeare's day the shadow had not yet fallen. The aftershine of the mediaeval day-dream still hung over the land ..."

J. O. Halliwell-Phillips, Outlines of the Life of Shakespeare, 7th edn., first to give the full Malone documentation surrounding the Shakespeare testament, though H-P thinks "the whole ... a modern fabrication." Yet, according to Chandler (2006,) H-P says that Davies's 1688 note was "the testimony of a sober clergyman, who could have had no conceivable motive for deception" and that Shakespeare "had a leaning to the faith of his ancestors" ("Halliwell-Phillips was no Catholic"—Chandler, 2006)

Cardinal James Gibbons, of Baltimore, chief cleric of U.S., gives speech accepting his titular church in Rome; citing Leo XIII that church is committed to no particular form of government, Gibbons said: "I belong to a country where the civil government holds over us the aegis of its protection without interfering in the legitimate exercise of our sublime mission as ministers of the Gospel"; will support Hecker who praised speech as "the best expression of the good of civil freedom as a favorable human environment for the development of the religious character."

****1889****

John Taylor, "Shakespeare's Religion" (Shakespeariana): "That there was a sentimental leaning of Shakespeare toward the unreformed faith may be fairly admitted, but there are insuperable difficulties in allowing that he was an adherent to its doctrines and forms."

Pater, Appreciations: "The character of Henry the Sixth ... has done much to fix the sentiment of the 'holy Henry'."

****1890****

Pater, "Art Notes in Italy": in Romanino's beautiful saint, "Beauty and Holiness had 'kissed each other' ... At the Renaissance the world might seem to have parted them again. But here certainly, once more, Catholicism and the Renaissance, religion and culture, holiness and beauty, might seem reconciled." On Raphael: "the age of the Renaissance, through all its varied activity, had, in spite of the weakened hold of Catholicism on the critical intellect, been still under its influence, the glow of it, as a religious ideal, and in the presence of Raphael you cannot think it a mere after-glow."

****1891****

Walter Elliott, The life of Father Hecker, trans. into French in 1897, translation precipitated condemnation of "Americanism" by Leo XIII in letter of 1899 (vs. modifying doctrines for modern consumption, rejection of celibacy, extolling of natural over supernatural virtues, etc.). At

Brook Farm, Hecker “was there equipped with the necessary external guarantee of his inner consciousness that man is good, because made so by his Creator -- inclined indeed to evil, but yet a good being, even so inclined. Nothing is more necessary for one who is to be a teacher among a population whose Catholicity is of blood and family tradition as well as of grace, than to know that there is virtue, true and high in its own order, outside the visible pale of the Church.” Hecker’s *Journal* (1843): “Catholicism is solidarity; Protestantism is individuality. What we want, and are tending to, is what shall unite them both.” “I was walking along the road and Emerson joined me. Presently he said, ‘Mr. Hecker, I suppose it was the art, the architecture, and so on in the Catholic Church which led you to her?’ ‘No,’ said I ‘but it was what caused all that.’ I was the first to break the Transcendental camp.” c. 1887: “Brownson was firmly persuaded, and so am I, that the great fault of men generally is that they deem the life their souls, thoughts, judgments, and convictions, yearnings, aspirations, and longings to be too subject to illusion to be worthy their attentive study and manly fidelity; that even multitudes of Catholics greatly undervalue the divine reality of their inner life, whether in the natural or supernatural order.” For Hecker, “the problem transcending all others is where to find that divine external order demanded for the completion of their inner experience.” 1844: “Emerson and his followers... are the narrowest of men, yet they think they are extremely ‘many-sided’ ... The Catholic accepts all the good they offer him and finds it comparatively little compared to that which he has.” “It was Anglicanism that engaged Isaac Hecker’s last efforts to adjust a Protestant outside to his inner experience ... it seemed possible that Anglicanism might be the union of historical Christianity with manly freedom.” Powerful satire of the “transcendentalist, ‘all nerve and no blood’ etc. 1844: “Jesus Christ came to introduce a new life ... This life makes no war against the good and true that already existed in men, but it embraces, includes, and fulfills it all, and then adds more than men had dared to dream before His coming.” “It is for this that we are created; that we may give a new and individual expression of the absolute in our own peculiar character.” “The Ripleys, the Alcotts, the Lanes, the Emersons ... possessed the highest activity of the natural faculties; they were all but the only class of American who loved truth for its own sake, that trait which is the peculiarity of the Catholic mind, and the first requisite for real conversion.” Hecker proposed to Thoreau that they go to Rome, but Thoreau said he had outlived that dream and had now “retired from all external activity in disgust, and his life was Brahminical, Artesian-well, Inner-Temple like.” Hecker writes “Present Condition and Future Prospects of the Catholic Faith in the United States” arguing that “the freest nation in the world was the most inviting field of the Catholic propagandist.” “This government leaves me a larger margin for liberty of action, and hence for co-operation with the guidance of the Holy Spirit.” [see Tocqueville] Paulists founded 1858, a “main aim, the conversion of the non-Catholic people of the country.” “Individuality is an integral and conspicuous element in the life of the Paulist. This must be felt. One of the natural signs of the true Paulist is that he would prefer to suffer from the excesses of liberty rather than from the arbitrary actions of tyranny.” “The problem is to make the true synthesis [of community and individualism] . ‘If men are yearning to be free, however blindly, because God by their freedom would make them holier, then let us hail the new order as a blessing.’ “The essential mistake of the transcendentalists is the taking for their guide the instincts of the soul instead of the inspiration of the Holy Spirit ... But true spiritual direction consists in discovering the obstacles in the way of the Divine Guidance.” (Ignatian) “The way out of our present difficulties is to revert to a spirituality which is freer than that which Providence assigned as the counteraction of Protestantism in the sixteenth century.” “The goodness of nature is often indistinguishable from the holiness of the supernatural life; and, indeed, as a rule, impulses of the Holy Spirit first pour their goods into the channels of natural virtue, thus rendering them supernatural [i.e. prudence justice, fortitude, temperance]... [but] When they have done their utmost they leave a void in the heart that still yawns for more” [faith, hope, love] . On Protestant direct access to God, “Father Hecker longed to tell his fellow-countrymen that the Catholic Church gives them a flight to God a thousand times more direct than they ever dreamed of.” “The stupid Döllingerites do not see or understand that what they pretend to desire -- the renewal of the Church -- can only be accomplished by the reign of the Holy Spirit throughout the Church, and that this can only be brought about by a filial submission to her divine external authority.” “I cannot express what an attraction I have always felt for St. Catherine of Genoa. She knew how to reconcile the greatest fidelity to the interior attract and guidance of the Holy Spirit with perfect filial obedience to ... the

Holy Church.” Newman letter of 1889: “I was sorrowful at hearing of Father Hecker’s death. I have ever felt that there was this sort of unity in our lives -- that we had both begun a work of the same kind, he in America and I in England, and I know how zealous he was in promoting it ... I received a vigorous and striking proof of it in the book he sent me “ [The Church and the Age] . Abbé Dufresne’s Recollections: “Father Hecker believed that it would finally be discovered that the Protestant spirit is contrary to the political spirit of the American republic ... that man is born free, reasonable, and capable of self-government ... The Constitution of the United States has formulated the political principles most conformable to the Canons of the Council of Trent.” “To be truly Catholic and to believe truly in freedom was, and remains, extremely difficult ... Hecker believed in both; then and now that was no small achievement” (David O’Brien, Isaac Hecker (1992)).

****1895****

Cardinal Vaughan begins construction of Westminster Cathedral.

****1896****

Leo XIII’s bull, Apostolicae Curae, that Anglican orders were invalid, a blow to high church Anglicans like Lord Halifax who had recently been raising the question of reunion.

Thomas Hardy, Jude the Obscure, horrified at Sue’s self-immolation in St. Barnabas Church (a theme addressed more positively in Waugh’s Brideshead Revisited and Greene’s The End of the Affair.)

Harold Frederic, The Damnation of Theron Ware: Methodist minister’s contact with Catholics shakes his Protestant certainties, and he eventually leaves ministry for real estate and politics.

Santayana on Shakespeare: “remarkable among the greater poets for being without a philosophy and without a religion.” “In Shakespeare’s time and country, to be religious already began to mean to be Puritanical; and in the divorce between the fullness of life on the one hand and the depth and unity of faith on the other, there could be no doubt to which side a man of imaginative instincts would attach himself.”

John Pym Yeatman, The Gentle Shakespeare: “Shakespeare was tolerated, though a Catholic, because of his inimitable wit and lively humour, which pleased even the proud Protestant Queen, and curiously several of the players ... were Catholic like him, and were driven to this life probably from the fact that no other was open to them.” Campion’s description of Walpole from Holinshed closely followed by S. Much on Arden/Shakespeare family lines.

Richard Simpson, Edmund Campion. A Biography: discusses Campion’s meeting with Sidney in Prague, and Sidney’s openness to Catholicism. See Woodhuysen, Sir Philip Sidney and the Circulation of Manuscripts 1558-1640 (1996) for Sidney’s connection with recusant music-lovers.

Mark Twain, Personal Recollections of Joan of Arc by The Sieur Louis de Conte (serialized 1895): “One of the first really popular attempts at a rationalist rehabilitation came, of all people in the world, from Mark Twain” (Chesterton 1926)

****1897****

Dracula: only the old religion, w/ crucifixes, hosts, etc., has power to cope with tremendous evil.

John Gerard, What was the Gunpowder Plot?, suggested it was government conspiracy, no viable cellar in Parliament, all participants killed off, etc.; argument resumed by Hugh Ross Williamson, Gunpowder Plot (1951).

****1898****

Ward, Helbeck of Bannisdale, written while she was considering conversion and yearning for Eucharist; Laura’s liveliness versus Helbeck’s “substituted life and ... vicarious obedience” abhorrent to this “daughter of a modern world which finds in the development and ennobling of our human life its more characteristic faith;” fervent Methodist comes close to accepting purgatory; Dr. Freidland defends Reformation as popular uprising but acknowledges romance of the Catholic imagination; yet Protestantism needs to draw on Catholic spiritual riches; Laura’s suicide shows great gap still, despite Ward’s profound fairness to Catholicism; questionably labeled an anti-Catholic novel.

Joseph Darlington, S. J. “The Catholicity of Shakespeare’s Plays,” New Ireland Review 8 (1897-8), cites Catholicity of Hamlet ghost, bland general article, but notable for being cited satirically by Joyce in the Scylla and Charybdis chapter (“Your dean of studies holds he was a holy Roman”).

****1899****

Rev. Sebastian Bowden (Oratorian, see Newman 1858), The Religion of Shakespeare: Chiefly from the Writings of the Late Mr. Richard Simpson, edits and expands Simpson’s unpub. notes, including his reply to Edinburgh Review attack; tends to simplify Simpson’s approach. Discusses Arden family, John’s recusancy, Malone and the Will, Lucy, contrast with other Renaissance plays, reverence for old religion in the plays; King John’s “sacred king” no argument -- consider

the source; Catholics also critique their clerics. Henry VIII, Act 5, “the only piece of unquestionable Protestantism in Shakespeare’s plays” but consensus of critics gives it to Fletcher; cites phenomenon of “Church Papists;” compares plight of persecuted Catholics to Edgar. Simpson’s work on Shakespeare was done in consultation with Lord Acton (Correspondence 1864-8).

Arthur Symonds, The Symbolist Movement in Literature: “It [Symbolism] is all an attempt to spiritualise literature, to evade the old bondage of rhetoric ... that beautiful things may be evoked, magically ... in speaking to us so intimately, so solemnly, as only religion had hitherto spoken to us, to become itself a kind of religion, with all the duties and responsibilities of the sacred ritual.” “The Church is his [Villiers’] favourite symbol of austere intellectual beauty.” “Verlaine’s conversion ... while he was in prison ... All that was simple, humble, childlike in him accepted that humiliation with the loving child’s joy in penitence.” “this love of God ... the only unending intoxication in the world ... more instinctive than any poet since the mediaeval mystic has found.” Huysman’s Catholicism influences his view that “art is the only clean thing on earth, except holiness.”

Mrs. Wilfrid Ward’s Catholic novel, One Poor Scruple, countering Helbeck; Catholic argument for renunciation like Waught’s Brideshead, vs. Hardy’s Jude.

****1900****

William Gildea, “The Religion of Shakespeare” (American Catholic Quarterly Review), cites Bowden, on grace, King John, Catholic clerics, Henry VIII, Henry V’s piety.

Mrs. Humphrey Ward’s Eleanor, redoing Helbeck plot, this time Puritan Lucy marries Lord Manisty (a disbeliever who argues for Catholicism, reflecting Chateaubriand), while Eleanor, Manisty’s soul mate, performs the ultimate self-sacrifice, a Catholic Pauline equivalent, of surrendering her own claim (forecast James’s Wings of the Dove). Chateaubriand praised for “re-creating a church, and regenerating a literature.”

Gasquet, The Eve of the Reformation: Erasmus regretted Lutheranism as blocking reform within Catholic church; “part of the price paid [for the Reformation] was the destruction of a sense of corporate unity and common brotherhood, which was fostered by the religious unanimity of belief and practice in every village in the country, and which, as in the mainspring of its life and the very central point of its being, centred in the Church with its rites and ceremonies” (“if it is perilous to accept Gasquet noncritically, it is foolish utterly to neglect or despise him” -- David Knowles) (“now seems remarkably prescient,” N. Tyacke 1998).

Wilfrid Ward letter to wife: “I have been reading a great deal of Dante ... I feel in him that independence of thought combined with reverence for the Church which the habits fostered by post-reformation Scholasticism have done much to destroy.”

****1901****

Edward VII begins reign.

Yeats, “At Stratford-on-Avon”: “Shakespeare ... saw ... in Richard II the defeat that awaits all, whether they be artist or saint, who find themselves where men ask of them a rough energy and have nothing to give but some contemplative virtue ... The courtly and saintly ideals of the Middle Ages were fading, and the practical ideals of the modern age had begun to threaten the useless dome of the sky; Merry England was fading ...” Henry V, “the reverse of all that Richard was,” “is as remorseless and undistinguished as some natural force ... That boy he and Katherine were to ‘compound’ ... ‘that’ was to go ‘go to Constantinople and take the Turk by the beard,’ turns out a saint and loses all his father had built up at home and his own life.”

John Churton Collins, “The Religion of Shakespeare,” in Ephemeria Critica: review of Bowden. But Shakespeare was “an uncompromising and intolerant Royalist,” thus unlikely to be Catholic sympathizer. John Shakespeare listed absent for debt; Shakespeare “has no sympathy with pious recluses” etc.

George Moore, Sister Teresa (continuation of Evelyn Innes, 1898): intense meditation on conflict between call of the world and call of the cloister; near fatal depression over disbelief in Eucharist; ends broken but resigned; inspired by perhaps by the conversion of Mrs. Craigie (John Oliver Hobbes).

****1902****

Vincent McNabb, “Is Macbeth a Study of Queen Elizabeth?” (Dublin Review): execution of Queen Mary the inspiring source for the major murders in the tragedy (Julius Caesar, Desdemona, King Hamlet, Lear, Duncan); Lady Macbeth mirrors Elizabeth’s final agonized moments; proto-Milward interpretation (“it was from Fr McNabb’s article that I got the idea of Lady M as a prototype of Elizabeth,” Milward private communication, Oct. 25, 2001).

R. Warwick Bond, ed. Complete Works of John Lyly, vol. 3 with essay, "On the Allegory in Endimion": Lyly no longer "impersonal allegory "of moral principles as before, but now "a personal allegory ... of contemporary men and women," reflecting court personalities: thus Endimion is Leicester, Cynthia Queen Elizabeth (widely agreed), and Tellus Mary Queen of Scots; Endimion finally faithful to Cynthia, while Mary marries her gaoler. [Compare masques.] Bond acknowledges N. J. Halpin, Oberon's Vision in the Midsummer Night's Dream. Illustrated by a comparison with Lylie's Endymion (1843) for pioneering study of political allegory (Tellus is Countess of Sheffield).

William James, The Varieties of Religious Experience: on religion as contributing to mental health: "Protestantism has been too pessimistic as regards the natural man. Catholicism has been too legalistic and moralistic..." Today's "Protestantism, however superior is spiritual profundity" is less attractive than Catholicism which "offers a so much richer pasturage and aid to the fancy, has so many cells with so many different kinds of honey, is so indulgent in its multiform appeals to human nature ... To intellectual Catholics many of the antiquated beliefs are ... as childish as they are to Protestants. But they are childish in the pleasing sense of 'childlike.'—innocent and amiable, and worthy to be smiled on in consideration of the undeveloped ... dear people's intellects. To the Protestant ... they are ... idiotic falsehoods. He must stamp out their delicate and lovable redundancy, leaving the Catholic to shudder at his literalness." Earlier, "the annals of Catholic saintship ... make us rub our Protestant eyes. Ritual worship in general appears to the modern transcendentalist ... as if addressed to deity of an almost absurdly childish character ... just as on the other hand the formless spaciousness of pantheism appears quite empty to ritualistic natures, and the gaunt theism of evangelical sects seem intolerably bald and chalky and bleak." Late chapter, "Mysticism," includes many Catholic examples (John of the Cross, Teresa, Ignatius) along with Symonds, Whitman, Upanishads, etc.

****1903****

Bertram Dobell, in Athenaeum, article on Alabaster.

Henry James, The Ambassadors, i.e. Strether negotiating with Mme. Vionnet, Chad's lover. "The Catholic church, for Waymarsh—that was to say the enemy, the monster of bulging eyes and far-reaching, quivering, groping tentacles—was exactly society, exactly the multiplication of shibboleths, exactly the discrimination of types and tones, exactly the wicked old Rows of Chester, rank with feudalism; exactly in short, Europe." Strether in Notre Dame where he will see Mme. Vionnet: "The great church had no altar for his worship, no direct voice for his soul; but it was none the less soothing even to sanctity ... she had lost herself, he could easily see as he would only have liked to do"; Strether insists Chad be faithful to Vionnet (make adultery into a sacrament of commitment), and Strether will retain his American integrity by returning. Also see Fussell 1993.

****1904****

W. S. Lilly, "What was Shakespeare's Religion?" in Studies in Religion and Literature defends Bowden and Simpson on the reverence for the old religion in Shakespeare's plays; answers Mahon by noting persistent custom of evening Masses, notably in Verona.

Founding of the Catholic Record Society to research Catholic sources in Reformation period. Lord Acton had earlier recommended founding of a "Lingard club."

Henry Adams, Mont-Saint-Michel and Chartres (2nd edn. 1912): "A Church which embraced, with equal sympathy, and within a hundred years, The Virgin, Saint Bernard, William of Champeaux and the School of Saint-Victor, Peter the Venerable, Saint Francis of Assisi, Saint Dominic, Saint Thomas Aquinas, and Saint Bonaventure, was more liberal than any modern State can afford to be ... Such elasticity long ago vanished from human thought." Neither love nor freedom, nor order can be at the heart of the universe, however much we want them there.

James's The Golden Bowl. Maggie represents "American good faith"; evokes her crisp pristine "New England grandmothers"; in her apartment, "she looked as is she had been carried there prepared ... like some holy image in a procession, and left, precisely, to show what wonder she could work under pressure. Her friend felt ... as the truly pious priest might feel when confronted, behind the altar, before the fiesta, with his miraculous Madonna". "She asked herself at times if he suspected how more than subtly, how perversely, she had dispensed with him [Fr. Mitchell]". Later, since "priests were really, at the worst, so to speak, such wonderful people that she believed him for an instant on the verge of saying to her, in abysmal softness:" 'Go to Mrs Verver, my child—you go: you'll find that you can help her.". Union of new American Catholic with old

European Catholic (see Prince on Catholic), American idealism and dark history, etc. Prince on keeping Maggie happy: "Only it's almost terrible, you know, the happiness of young, good, generous creatures. It rather frightens one. But the Blessed Virgin and all the Saints, ... have her in their keeping." Also see Fussell 1993.

****1906****

Mrs. Humphrey Ward begins to write story on a powerful religious experience at Assisi.

Ford Madox Ford, The Fifth Queen, on Henry's Catherine Howard, from Catholic Howards, trying to turn Henry toward Catholicism, framed as adulteress by Protestant party. See 1540 for the source of this view.

****1907****

Henry Birt, The Elizabethan Religious Settlement, early statement of the revisionist view of Reformation (see 1993).

H. C. Beeching, "The Religion of Shakespeare" argues against puritan and papist interpretation of Shakespeare, for his membership in C of E.

Henry Adams, The Education of Henry Adams, w/ chap. "the Dynamo and the Virgin;" Middle Ages as "the point in history when man held the highest idea of himself as a unit in a unified universe;" also see 1905. Adams "was trying to get at the roots of the civilization to which he belonged ... an offshoot of Romanized Europe [when] From the close of the eleventh century to the first third of the thirteenth, northern France and England were more or less united politically" (Curtius).

Chesterton, "On Writing Badly": "How can we discuss how we should have written Shakespeare. Shakespeare has written us. And you and I (I am sure you agree) are two of his best characters"; see Bloom 1998.

****1908****

Baron Friedrich Von Hügel, The Mystical Element of Religion as Studied in Saint Catherine of Genoa and Her Friends (rev. edn. 1923): "that ampler pre-Protestant, as yet neither Protestant nor anti-Protestant, but deeply positive and Catholic, world," versus Protestant which is "unjust and sectarian" and "post-Tridentine type of Catholicism, with its regimental Seminarism, its predominantly controversial spirit, its suspiciousness and timidity;" Catherine as example of those in which "Universality, Obligation, Uniformity and Objectivity, of the second stage ... take the form of a Spiritual Individuality, Liberty, Variety, and Subjectivity." See 1932, Yeats.

Newman Smyth, Passing Protestantism and Coming Catholicism: the former's "crowning achievement is the victory which it has won forever for the spiritual liberty of the individual man". But we also need authority; "the ideal of the one Church wanders among us, like an unembodied spirit, from church to church, until we almost cease really to believe in it". Modernism may help bring the two together. "Voices of peace which were hushed in the tempest of ... the Reformation ... (the voices of Melancthon, Erasmus and his friends ... of Sir Thomas More, and John von Staupitz, Luther's teacher, and Cassander, Bossuet, Spinola, Molanus, Leibnitz, and Grotius, and other irenic spirits), may be heard again in these evening hours ..."

****1909****

Henry James, "The Jolly Corner:" Spencer Brydon, returning from life in Europe, sees specter of American entrepreneur he might have been, a New York capitalist, spreading his hands, one with "lost two fingers, which were reduced to stumps, as if accidentally shot away." But Alice will say: "'You came to yourself,' she beautifully smiled".

****1910****

George V begins reign, decrees that "Windsor" will be name of royal household.

World Missionary Conference at Edinburgh marks beginning of 20th century ecumenical movement among Protestants.

****1910****

Charles Wallace, "New Shakespeare Discovery," Harper's Monthly Magazine (March), records show Shakespeare living at the house of the French Huguenot, Christopher Mountjoy.

****1911****

Thurston answers Malone's doubt and cites practice of confession of faith in illness, in The Month ("The Spiritual Testament of John Shakespeare").

****1912****

Thurston, "The Religion of Shakespeare," Catholic Encyclopedia, defends John Shakespeare testament, doubts Shakespeare's loyalty to Catholicism, but agrees with Simpson, Bowden, et al about the Catholic tone of the plays; notes afternoon masses were said even in Verona (see above, 1866).

Thomas Hardy's "The Abbey Mason: Inventor of the 'Perpendicular' Style of Gothic Architecture," celebrates this anonymous medieval architect "Whose symmetries salute the sun ... While others boom a baseless claim, / And upon nothing rear a name."

Rilke, Life of the Virgin Mary, poetic sequence. Also "Every angel is terrifying" (Duino Elegy 2) (1912). (Letter 1903: "I abandoned the violent Catholic piety of childhood, made myself free of it

in order to be even more, even more comfortlessly alone; but from things, from their patient bearing and enduring, a new, greater and more devout love came to me late, some kind of faith that knows no fear and no bounds.” “The Angel of the Meridian,” first poem in New Poems (1907), reflecting Chartres; The Book of Hours (1905) written in persona of Russian monk.)

Pound, “Portrait d’une Femme”: French woman like Sargasso sea, with multiple rich disconnected treasures, “yet this is you”: “one ... takes strange gain away.” A 19th century Protestant writer had compared old world Catholic indolence to “the weedy, motionless Sargasso sea” (Franchot).

Henry James, “The Novel in ‘The Ring and the Book’” (pub. in Notes on Novelists 1914): describes poem as a “gothic ... structure;” “the hand of Italy is ... with that of the great glare and of the great shadow-masses, heavy upon us, heavy with that strange weight, that mixed pressure, which is somehow, to the imagination, at once a caress and a menace”; “my Italy of the eve of the eighteenth century—a vast painted and gilded rococo shell roofing over a scenic, an amazingly figured and furnished earth, but shutting out almost the whole of our own dearly-bought, rudely-recovered spiritual sky.” “There they are ... Florence, as sleepy to my recollection as a little English cathedral city clustered about a Close, but dreaming not so peacefully nor so innocently; there is the great fretted fabric of the Church on which they are all swarming and grovelling, yet after their fashion interesting parasites, from the high and dry old Archbishop, meanly wise or ignobly edifying, to whom Pompilia resorts ... down through the couple of Franceschini cadets .. mere minions, fairly in the verminous degree, of the overgrown order or too-rank organism; down to Count Guido himself and to Canon Caponsacchi ... who lead their lives under some strangest profanest pervertedest clerical category.” Cites the “sinister scene ... where Pompilia’s inspired little character, clear silver hardened, effectually beaten and battered, to steel, begins to shine at the blackness with a light that fairly outfaces at last the gleam of wolfish fangs.”

****1913****

Francis Cardinal Bourne’s introd. to 1914 edn. of William Allen’s A True, Sincere and Modest Defence (see 1584): “this treatise gives us an answer to the charge, still sometimes renewed, that those who gave their lives for the Catholic Faith in England in the sixteenth century were in reality men disloyal to Queen and country. More valuable still ... is the light thrown upon the recently discovered continuity that, we are told, exists between the Established Church of England and the Catholic Church in England before the Reformation. To such a groundless theory the lives and deaths of our Blessed Martyrs are the best and most conclusive reply. They knew, and they gave their lives because they knew, that a fundamental change was being wrought in the religious condition of our country.”

Robert Hugh Benson, Confessions of a Convert, on transition from Anglicanism to Catholicism, by this son of the Archbishop of Canterbury.

****1914****

S. A. Blackmore, The Riddles of Hamlet, makes case, now accepted, that “herald of the morning” speech in Hamlet echoes the Hymn of St. Ambrose, Aeternae Rerum Conditor, in Sunday Lauds liturgy.

Pierre Imbart de la Tour, L’Evangélisme: identified “the diverse spiritual and intellectual movements at work in Catholic Europe, and especially in France, in the uncertain, fluid period (1520s and 1530s) before Reformation and Counter-Reformation secured dominance in their respective territories. The subject of ‘Evangelism’ (in the special sixteenth-century sense of a search for the renewal of religion through direct contact with the scriptures, while, on the one hand, retaining a sense of Catholicity and, on the other, being sensitive to the issues of sin and grace and justification) has been of great interest to historians in the last generation” (Mansfield, Man on His Own: Interpretations of Erasmus c 1750-1920.)

****1915****

James J. Walsh, “Was Shakespeare A Catholic?,” Catholic Mind (1915) on Catholic evidences, especially in Romeo and Juliet, King John, Henry VIII, and on biographical matters.

Ford Madox Ford, The Good Soldier: innocent Catholic Nancy goes mad when unwittingly occasioning the death of her beloved Edward Ashburnham, the likable adulterous husband caught (Graham Greene style) between her and his more Jesuitical Gothic wife, Leonora.

****1916****

J. B. Wainewright in N&Q notes, without comment, that Simon Hunt “matriculated at the University of Douay when Dr. Thomas Stapleton was Rector.”

Sir E.M. Thompson’s Shakespeare’s Handwriting in 1916 confirms Shakespeare’s authorship of insurrection scene of Sir Thomas Moore (see 1871) (issue summed up by E. K. Chambers in 1930).

Wilhelm Creizenach, The English Drama in the Age of Shakespeare, trans. from German: "We find, nevertheless, in him a delicate appreciation for the poetic element in some Catholic institutions which perished under the régime of the Reformation." "The arguments brought forward by Rio, Simpson, Raich, etc., in favour of Shakespeare's Catholicism can hardly need refutation to-day;" cites Harsnet, equivocator, love-sick nun in Lover's Complaint.

Henri Bremond, Histoire littéraire du sentiment religieux en France depuis la fin des guerres de religion jusqu'à nos jours (11 volumes, 1915-1933; first volume L'Humanisme dévôt. Trans. as A Literary History of Religious Thought in France from the Wars of Religion Down to Our Own Times, first 3 volumes only, trans. K. L. Montgomery (London, 1928-1936): on history of Catholic devout humanism, integrating humanism and Catholic piety, à la urbanity of Francis de Sales, against Jansenism, "Our Humanists ... deduce that devotion, even perfection, ought to be easy to the natural magnanimity and the supernatural resources of the true Christian man;" embody "the best traditions of the Renaissance."

Stephen Hales, Shakespeare's Religion: agrees with "Mr. G. K. Chesterton, that Shakespeare was 'spiritually a Catholic.'" A Catholic modified ... by two potent influences: (a) his patriotism, which induced submission to the English government rather than to that of Rome (in the same spirit that impelled good Catholics to fight against the Spanish Armada; and (b) his study of the Scriptures, which enlightened his religious thought, widened its outlook, and extended the application of it, without destroying the Catholic mould which shapes its most natural expression for himself, as in all likelihood it had shaped the piety of his Mother."

****1917**

J. B. Pollen in Month ("A Shakespeare "Discovery") traces Simon Hunt's Jesuit career, and probable conversion from Protestantism.

Paul Mestwerdt, Die Anfänge des Erasmus: Humanismus und "Devotio Moderna": discusses the connections between the two movements, the universalism, historical-critical method, and ethical emphasis of the first, the deepened personal piety and inwardness, bible for edification, of the second (Mansfield, vol. 2).

Rudolf Otto, The Idea of the Holy, trans. into English in 1923: "In Catholicism the feeling of the numinous is to be found as a living factor of singular power. It is seen in Catholic forms of worship and sacramental symbolism, in the less authentic forms assumed by legend and miracle, in the paradoxes and mysteries of Catholic dogma, in the Platonic and neo-Platonic strands woven into the fabric of its religious conceptions, in the solemnity of churches and ceremonies, and especially in the intimate rapport of Catholic piety with mysticism ... Catholic orthodoxy has been subjected to a strong rationalizing influence [by Aristotelian scholasticism], to which, however, actual living religious practice and feeling never conformed or corresponded." "By the continual living activity of its non-rational elements a religion is guarded from passing into 'rationalism.' By being steeped in and saturated with rational elements it is guarded from sinking into fanaticism or mere mysticality." Appendix I: "Chrysostom on the Inconceivable in God." Appendix III: "Original Numinous Sounds," i.e. "om". Appendix VIII: "Silent Worship": "Our" "communion service is emphatically not a Mass, and the Mass has grown to be a distortion of its true form."

Chesterton, A Short History of England, early revisionist anti-Whig history, praised especially for tracing the oppression of the small share-holders by the oligarch capitalists. Chesterton will be celebrated by Waugh, Marshall McLuhan, Empson (for style and philology), Hugh Kenner, Anthony Burgess, John Gross, W. H. Auden, T. S. Eliot (at least on the Dickens book, "no better"), V. S. Pritchett, David Lodge, Garry Wills, etc. (see G. K. Chesterton: A Half Century of Views, ed. D. J. Conlon, OUP (1987).

****1918****

Strachey's Eminent Victorians, lead chapter on Cardinal Manning (eminent Victorian!): compared to a redoing of Cardinal Wolsey; satire, though with some admiration, of religious intensity, assumption that Anglicanism is a hollow shell.

Weber, "Science as a Vocation" (1918-1919): "The fate of our times is characterized by rationalization and intellectualization and, above all, by the 'disenchantment of the world' [quoting F. Schiller]. Precisely the ultimate and most sublime values have retreated from public life either into the transcendent realm of mystic life or into the brotherliness of direct and personal human relations."

Wilhelm Worringer, Form Problems of the Gothic (trans. 1918, orig. German 1910): while classical man is at home with nature, "The Gothic soul, however, lacks this harmony. With it the inner and the outer world are still unreconciled."

Hopkins's poem, selected edition, first published by Robert Bridges; expanded and corrected edition, in 1930, ed. Charles Williams.

****1920****

T. S. Eliot's "Dante" in The Sacred Wood, on Dante's framework for presenting the full picture of Francesca and Brunetto; reflecting a Chesterton emphasis on the way the medieval world insisted on a larger picture.

Hilaire Belloc, Europe and the Faith: "the defection of Britain from the Faith of Europe three hundred years ago is certainly the most important historical event in the last thousand years ... its spiritual result -- an isolation of the soul; its political result -- a consequence of the spiritual -- the prodigious release of energy, the consequent advance of special knowledge, the domination of the few under a competition left unrestrained, the subjection of the man, the ruin of happiness, the final threat of chaos." Does Catholicism in Chesterton, and Belloc, and later the Inklings, become English nostalgia?

Jacques Maritain, Art and Scholasticism (trans. 1930). In post World War disillusion, Maritain argues thomistic notion of hylomorphic form, Aristotelian principle of intelligible determination, underlying artistic work, and so influences various artists and writers including Cocteau (converts in 1925); thus reconciling tradition and modernity.

J. Thomas Looney, "Shakespeare Identified", begins intense Lord Oxford school of Shakespeare authorship, claiming that otherwise Shakespeare's familiarity with aristocracy, his Lancastrian partiality, "of probable Catholic leanings, but touched with skepticism, cannot be explained.

****1921****

Lynn Winstanley, Hamlet and the Scottish Succession ... and the Essex Conspiracy: Shakespeare writes in favor of Scottish succession by James, which was the imprisoned Southampton's only hope. Hamlet is a combination of James and Essex, the former, Protestant, son of murdered Catholic Darnley, faced with mother Mary and her new husband, Bothwell. Also parallels Essex whose "irresolution in his last years bordered on fitfulness of insanity." Essex's last words on scaffold: "And when my soul and body shall part, send thy blessed angels to be near unto me which may convey it to the joys of heaven." Polonius like Burghley, Essex's enemy; Burghley's son was a wayward youth to whom Burghley wrote letters full of wise maxims, remarkably similar to Polonius's.

Tucker Brooke, "Shakespeare Apart" (Yale Review): not a revolutionary or explorer or experimenter like others and yet -- . "He was distinctly a traditionalist in politics and social theory. His attitude towards the state and sovereign was not Tudor, but Plantagenet; not renaissance, but feudal ... There is not good reason for believing that he was an actual recusant, a convinced disciple of the Roman faith; but the religious penumbra of his mind was certainly archaic. For poetic purposes at least religion still connoted for him friars, masses, vigils, extreme unction, and purgatory. It came natural to him to invoke angels and ministers of grace, to swear by Our Lady and Saint Patrick."

T. S. Eliot, "The Metaphysical Poets": "Jonson and Chapman ... incorporated their erudition into their sensibility; their mode of feeling was directly and freshly altered by their reading and thoughts. In Chapman especially there is a direct sensuous apprehension of thought, or a recreation of thought into feeling, which is exactly what we find in Donne ... In the seventeenth century a dissociation of sensibility set in, from which we have never recovered; and this dissociation ... was aggravated by ... Milton and Dryden." See Ross and Bethell below.

Malines Conversations (-1926), between Catholics and Anglicans at Malines (Mechelen), Belgium, promoted by Viscount Halifax and catholic abbé Fernand Portal.

****1922****

Sidney Lee, "Shakespeare and the Inquisition: A Spanish Second Folio" (NY Times, reprinted in Elizabethan and Other Essays (1929): on the Valladolid folio, censored by Holy Office, tears out Measure for Measure, deletes Gloucester stamping cardinal's hat and exposing St. Alban miracle in HVI, King John defying Pope, and Bastard's sarcasms, praises of Cranmer in HVIII and praises of Elizabeth, deletes various ribaldry including kissing like "touch of holy bread" and "nun's lips to friar's mouth." "But he fails to apply his principles with any strict uniformity, and much that one would expect to fall under either his dogmatic or ethical ban escapes his attack." Approves of Lennox in Macbeth on "swift blessing ... return to this our suffering country." "The discovery of the Second Folio in the English College at Valladolid may best be regarded as proof of Shakespeare's early popularity among his fellow-countrymen, whatever their religious creed." See Frye and Milward below.

Eveline Feasey, "The Licensing of the Mirror for Magistrates"(Library), on its political allegory

which led to its initial banning under Mary Tudor.

Mackenzie's The Altar Steps begins his trilogy The Parson's Progress (-1924) which ends with Anglican hero converting to Rome.

Thomas Hardy's "Apology" to Late Lyrics and Earlier, calls on English church, with its "sufficient dignity and footing, such strength of old association, such scope for transmutability, such architectural spell" to do what poetry might now do, form "alliance between religion, which must be retained unless the world is to perish, and complete rationality, which must come, unless the world also is to perish," a forlorn hope, especially since "the historical and once august hierarchy of Rome some generations ago lost its chance," i.e. by condemning the modernists.

****1923****

Herbert Thurston, in Dublin Review, "A Controverted Shakespeare Document," publishes **discovery of Cardinal Borromeo testament**, in a Spanish version, some English version probably being the template used by John Shakespeare and other English Catholics; notes that Borromeo entertained Campion and Persons and the English missionaries; answers Malone doubts; cites scholarship showing John Shakespeare was literate; notes that Joan Shakespeare (sister, second Joan) lived in house until 1646.

E. K. Chambers, discussing "small travelling companies" in Elizabethan Stage, footnotes the Shakeshafte will but only queries ambiguously: "Was then William Shakeshafte a player in 1581?", with the slightest of implications about Shakespeare.

****1924****

Thomas Carter, Shakespeare, Puritan and Recusant, nevertheless argues Lucy as persecuting religious antagonist.

Maura Power, Shakespeare's Catholicism, on reverence for Catholic things in Shakespeare.

John Masfield, Shakespeare and the Spiritual Life (Romanes lecture at Oxford): "His father was a middle-class Protestant, who attended Church of England services as long as he could do so without fear of arrest for debt. His mother was a conforming Protestant with some Catholic relatives. Shakespeare was bred and remained a conforming Protestant ... Though he had little learning and less faith, he had much superstition."

Maurice Baring, C, hero torn between Catholic Beatrice and earthy Leila.

Anglican Primate of Ireland, C. F. D'Arcy, on Malines: "My personal conviction is that if reunion succeeds in creating or restoring a universal hierarchical system dominating all spheres of human life and dictating doctrine and morals ... it will be the greatest disaster that could befall humanity ... The only kind of reunion we ought to desire is one which will assure full liberty not only to individuals but all types of organized Christian life" Times, Jan 4., quoted by M.J. Congar, 1939.

Karl Adam, The Spirit of Catholicism (in German, trans. 1929): On protestants: "Their churches are built not only of their own un-Catholic materials, but also of Catholic stuff from the original store of salvation. And in so far as they are genuinely Catholic in their faith and worship, it can and will and must happen that there should be, even outside the visible Church, a real growth and progress in union with Christ", cites Mk 9:38-40 ("not against you is for you"); thus Church upheld against the Donatists the validity of baptism by heretics. "Nor are saints and martyrs impossible, on Catholic principles, even in the Protestant churches." "Nay, it is Catholic teaching that the grace of Christ operates, not only in the Christian communions, but also in the non-Christian world, in Jews and in Turks and in Japanese," i.e. baptism of desire. Quotes Jesuit Cardinal de Lugo (cited from von Hügel): "God gives light, sufficient for its salvation, to every soul that attains so the use of reason in this life ... the soul that in good faith seeks God, his truth and love, concentrates its attention, under the influence of grace, upon these elements of truth, be they many or few, which are offered to it in the ... assemblies ... in which it has been brought up."

Thomas Mann, The Magic Mountain (trans. 1927): the nursing sister "had the look of a Protestant sister—that is to say, one working without a real vocation and burdened with restlessness and ennui." Hans Castorp, secular hero, hears extended debates between humanist Freemason Settembrini who celebrate "Prometheus ... Satan hymned by Carducci." Castorp: "the devout and the free-thinking... both have their good sides; what I have against Settembrini's—the free-thinking line—is that he seems to imagine it has a corner in human dignity. That's exaggerated, I consider, because the other has its own kind of dignity too, and makes for a tremendous lot of decorum and correct bearing and uplifting ceremony," i.e. Mann much concerned with "order" in this disintegrating pre-WW I civilization. Naphta, Jew converted into Catholic and Jesuit, stresses dilemma between individualism that becomes subordinate to state, and transcendent religion. Settembrini: "I protest against the dilemma in which you seek to place us, between Prussianism and Gothic reaction." Naphta says youth ultimately want not freedom but obedience; preaches Catholic communism brought by force. "Only out of radical scepticism, out of moral chaos, can the Absolute spring, the anointed Terror of which the time has need." "Hans Castorp chose to regard his own poor soul as the object of their dialectical rivalry." S. and N. duel, and N. shoots himself when S. refuses to fire. Both personalities momentarily eclipsed by exuberant personality of Mynheer Peeperkorn. Cipolla in Mario and the Magician (1929) enforces dilemma between fascistic 'worship me' and ordinary self. Aschenbach in Death in Venice (1911) lured by Venetian decadence perhaps into abyss of formlessness.

****1926****

Founding of journal, Irénikon: Bulletin mensuel des moines de l'union des églises.
Oswald Spengler, The Decline of the West, trans. C. Atkinson; orig. German 1918. "Each culture has its own new possibilities of self-expression which arise, ripen, decay, and never return." Map of "Spiritual Epochs": "Western (from 900)": Spring ("Super-personal unity") (c. 900-1300s) ("New God-feeling") (Bernard of Clairvaux, Francis of Assisi, etc.); (followed by "Mystical-Metaphysical shaping," i.e. Aquinas, Dante); Summer ("Ripening consciousness ... urban") (c. 1300-1700 ("Reformation" (Hus, Luther, Savonarola) followed by philosophical form, with idealism and realism opposed (Galileo, Leibniz), followed by mathematics (Descartes, Pascal), followed by "rationalistic-mystic impoverishment of religion" (Puritans, Jansenists, Port Royal)); Autumn (zenith of intellectual creativeness) (c. 18th-early 19th centuries), (great rationalistic systems (Locke to Hegel)); Winter ("Extinction of spiritual creative force"; irreligious ethical systems) (Materialism) (Bentham to Marx), completion of mathematics, "Degradation of abstract thinking into profession lecture-room philosophy ("Kantians"); Socialism). Thus nostalgia for older epochs, and acknowledgement of their obsolescence.

G. K. Chesterton, The Catholic Church and Conversion, in tradition of Newman's The Present Position of Catholics in England which it acknowledges ("Newman's interesting lecture on Blanco White"): on the narrow nationalism of Protestantism, versus the universal humanity of Catholicism which makes the nation an important subset ("men must have intimate and individual ties"). "The return of Catholic ideas to the separated parts of Christendom was often indeed indirect ... through the Romantic movement ... thorough the instinctive reaction of ... Johnson or Scott or Cobbett, wishing to save old elements that had originally been Catholic against a progress that was merely Capitalist ... from the Pre-Raphaelites or the opening of continental art and culture by Matthew Arnold and Morris and Ruskin ..."

Chesterton, The Thing: Why I am a Catholic: "the modern world ... is living on its Catholic capital. It is using, and using up, the truths that remain to it out of the old treasury of Christendom; including, of course, many truths known to pagan antiquity but crystallized in Christendom. But it is not really starting new enthusiasms of its own. The novelty is a matter of names and labels ... It is not starting fresh things that it can really carry on far into the future. On the contrary, it is picking up old things that it cannot carry on at all. For these are the two marks of modern moral ideals. First, that they were borrowed or snatched out of ancient or mediaeval hands. Second, that they wither very quickly in modern hands." "On practically every essential count on which the Reformation actually put Rome in the dock, Rome has since been acquitted by the jury of the whole world ... the legend that Rome is wrong anyhow, is still a living thing, though all the features of the monster are now entirely altered in the caricature." "Shakespeare ... was a certain real and recognizable Renaissance type of Catholic; like Cervantes, like Ronsard." Critiques Newman's concession that English literature is Protestant: "Bunyan ... was not so much a Puritan as a Christian." "It is very difficult to find, at least after the doubtful case of Bunyan and the deadly case of Cowper [driven mad by Calvinism], anything that can be called a purely literary inspiration coming from the purely Protestant doctrines." Milton's War in Heaven "would have been much more convincing, if it had been modelled more on the profound mediaeval mysteries about the nature of angels and archangels, and less on the merely fanciful Greek myths ... I suppose nobody will dispute that the pageantry of Scott might have taken on a tenfold splendour if he could have understood the emblems of an everlasting faith as sympathetically as he did the emblems of a dead feudalism." "'English literature will always have been Protestant' [Newman]; but it might have been Catholic; without ceasing to be English literature, and perhaps succeeding in producing a deeper literature and a happier England."

Pius XI, encyclical Mortalium animos: "it would be erroneous and foolish to say that His Mystical Body could consist of divided and scattered limbs" (i.e. the Anglican theory).

****1927****

Willa Cather, Death Comes for the Archbishop; Georgic idyll where Catholic missionaries negotiate relation between eternal Roman church and the indigenous southwest, connect native and Catholic piety, desert and mystical stillness and peace. Also see My Antonia (1918) with heroine from Bohemian Catholic background; Irish Catholic maid saves skeptical professor, in The Professor's House (1925).

****1928****

John Semple Smart, Shakespeare Truth and Tradition, debunks various myths, but forcefully argues John Shakespeare's recusancy.

Edgar Fripp, Shakespeare's Stratford, details the various Catholic inhabitants of Stratford: T. Barber, host of the "Bear," "'suspect' on account of the recusancy of his first wife, and then of his second;" Rafe Cawdrey, butcher and tenant of the "Angel" inn, who was Catholic along with wife and daughters, and his son a fugitive Jesuit priest; Alderman George Whateley, on Henley Street, two brothers fugitive priests, whom he supported. Also on Henley Street, George Badger, woollen-draper, well-connected townsman, "obstinate on the Catholic side;" also Alderman Wheeler, listed as recusant (Fripp thinks Puritan recusant like John S.). John Lane, "held to the Old Faith, was presented with the Cloptons, Reynolds' and other Romanists who paid their monthly fine for absence from church." George Badger, owner of house next to J. S., "staunch Catholic convictions. He was a rebel in his puritan environment, paid fines and went to prison for his recusancy, refused to obey orders at meeting of the Corporation and was deprived of his alderman's gown," etc. Also various dedicated Puritans, including William Wyatt, who raided Clopton House in 1605, "carrying off chalices, crucifixes, crosses, vestments, pictures, Latin prayer-books, beads, a pax, and other damning evidence of 'papistry'." On Chapel St., Hugh Reynolds, prosperous yeoman, large household of servants, "He and his wife were stout Roman Catholics ... Their eldest son ... enjoyed the friendship of Shakespeare." Sir Hugh Clopton builds New Place opposite the Chapel, to say his prayers in one, and end his days in the other; taken over by Clopton's unscrupulous agent, William Bott, who took advantage of Clopton's Catholic difficulties. Physician, Philip More, his wife "a Catholic recusant."

Hilaire Belloc, How the Reformation Happened: "To a man acquainted with the Catholic Church and the society it produces, nothing is clearer than that the plays of Shakespeare were written by a man steeped in the Catholic social tradition and for audiences in the same mood;" distinguishes the fossilization of the institutional Church from the people's Catholic piety; stresses English reformation as government movement.

Henry Bremond, A Literary History of Religious Thought in France, see above, 1916.

****1929****

E. I. Fripp, Shakespeare's Haunts Near Stratford, notes Robert Arden's Catholic will, discovers John Cottom, Shakespeare's teacher, is elder brother of priest Thomas Cottom, and that Debdale was schoolfellow of Richard Quayney and possibly of Shakespeare; notes that John Frith, the Temple Grafton priest, was labeled "an old priest and unsound in religion" by puritan censor; that Shakespeare has an aunt, Isabella, in convent, and thus perhaps paralleling Isabella in Measure for Measure.

Hugh Kingsmill, The Return of William Shakespeare (novel): conspirators need to remodel old weepy Shakespeare: one suggestion is "to make him a Catholic which would appeal to both Protestants and Catholics in this time of secularization."

[Lateran Treaty, between Pope Pius XI and Mussolini, accepts fact that Pope's temporal dominions are gone.]

****1930****

Chambers in his William Shakespeare: A Study of Facts and Problems (Oxford, 1930); accepts authenticity of John Shakespeare testament; argues John Shakespeare's recusancy was Catholic, since recusancy returns were inspired by fears of Spanish invasion; notes "what has puzzled readers most is the courtesy of Shakespeare; his easy movement in the give and take of social intercourse among Persons of good breeding." Defends Richard Davies as a respectable witness (see 1688), and speculates that the romances show that Shakespeare converted to Catholicism. T. S. Eliot, "Ash Wednesday": Part 1 ends "Pray for us now and the hour of our death"; Part 2 addresses a Lady: "Because of the goodness of this Lady / And because of her loveliness, and because / She honours the Virgin in meditation, / We shine with brightness"; then "The Lady is withdrawn / In a white gown, to contemplation." Then prayer, "Lady of Silences / Calm and distressed ..." Part 4 begins: "Who walked between the violet and the violet / Who walked between / The various ranks of varied green / Going in white and blue, in Mary's colour ... In blue of larkspur, blue of Mary's colour," like a nun; Part 4 ends "And after this exile" from "Salve Regina." Part 5 includes: "Will the veiled sister pray for / Those who walk in darkness" and "Will the veiled sister between the slender / Yew trees pray for those who offend her ..." Part 6 includes: "Blessèd sister, holy mother, spirit of the fountain, spirit of the garden, ... Teach us to care and not to care ... Suffer me not to be separated / And let my cry come unto Thee" (from 14th century communion prayer, "Anima Christi").

Max Weber, The Protestant Ethic and the Spirit of Capitalism (trans. by Talcott Parson, orig. 1904-5. 1920), cites de Laveleye (1875), Calvinist asceticism necessary for capitalist advance; "the pursuit of riches, which once had been feared as the enemy of religion, was now welcomed as its ally" (Tawney intro); illustrations drawn mostly from late 17th cent. English Puritans -- and then Franklin; "one thing was unquestionably new: the valuation of the fulfillment of duty in worldly affairs as the highest form which the moral activity of the individual could assume" (80); "a feeling of unprecedented inner loneliness" resulted from man now "forced to follow his path alone to meet a destiny ... which had been decreed for him from eternity;" "God requires social achievement of the Christian because He wills that social life shall be organized according to His commandments;" "This worldly Protestant asceticism ... acted powerfully against the spontaneous enjoyment of possessions; it restricted consumption, especially of luxuries. On the other hand, it had the psychological effect of freeing the acquisition of goods from the inhibitions of traditionalistic ethics."

****1931****

T. W. Baldwin, William Shakespeare Adapts a Hanging, that "The Comedy of Errors" refer to the executions performed in 1588, in the "ditches" separating Holywell Abbey from the gibbets at Finsbury Fields (executions no longer confined to Tyburn in order to terrorize the population), and also near two of the theatres where Shakespeare's companies performed.

Leslie Hotson, Shakespeare Versus Shallow: Shallow and Slender based on Justice Gardiner, a papist hunting judge in Southwark (with coat of arms of a griffin mounted with three white luces (from his wife, Frances Luce or Lucy)), and his henchman Wayte.

Cumberland Clark, Shakespeare and the Supernatural: "a conforming Protestant of the Church of England, obediently following his sovereign down the middle course between Rome and Geneva;" "Shakespeare's attitude is not proof of Catholic sympathies but of the true Christian charity which was his by nature;" "There is no record that he ever came into conflict with the Church authorities ..." his chronicle plays are "fiercely anti-Catholic," because "at the time of the Armada patriotism was not consistent with Catholicism."

K. C. Macdonald, "Blessed Robert Southwell, S.J., and William Shakespeare" (The Month): Southwell's "Still finest wits are 'stilling Venus' rose" alludes to Shakespeare, and poem on St. Peter is in same metre and manner as "Venus and Adonis."

Helen White, English Devotional Literature 1600-1640, on Catholic classics of spirituality influencing the English.

T. S. Eliot, "Thoughts after Lambeth": cites "that oddest of institutions, the Church of England." Some of the educated young have "a respect for the Church springing from a recognition of the intellectual ability which during two thousand years has gone to its formation." "The Roman view ... seems ... to be that a principle must be affirmed without exception; and that hereafter exceptions can be dealt with, without modifying the principle ... the Anglican Church can admit national ... differences in theory and practice which the more formal organization of Rome cannot recognize ... The admission of inconsistencies ... of which the English mind is often accused, may be largely the admission of inconsistencies inherent in life itself." [thus the source of the New Criticism]. "I prefer to think of the Church as what I believe it is more and more coming to be, not the 'English Church,' but national as 'the Catholic Church in England'." "with all due respect, the Roman Church is in England a sect. It is easier for the Church of England to become Catholic, than for the Church of Rome in England to become English; and if the Church of England was mutilated by separation from Rome, the Church of Rome was mutilated by separation from England. If England is ever to be in any appreciable degree converted to Christianity, it can only be through the Church of England." "For some souls, I admit, there is no satisfaction outside of Rome; and if Anglo-Catholicism has helped a few such to find their way to where they belong, I am very glad; but ... Anglo-Catholicism ... on the other hand ... has helped many more I believe ... to remain within the Anglican Church."

****1932****

John Dover Wilson (The Essential Shakespeare) speculates that Shakespeare may have "received his education ... in the service of some Catholic nobleman" (and may have been a schoolmaster at Titchfield, Southampton's seat), and thence made the transition to actor and playwright; John Shakespeare was "almost certainly" a Catholic recusant.

Chesterton, Chaucer: "That Shakespeare was a Catholic is a thing that every Catholic feels by every sort of convergent common sense to be true. It is supported by the few external and political facts we know; it is utterly unmistakable in the general spirit and atmosphere; and in nothing more than the scepticism, which appears in some aspects to be paganism"

Yeats's "Vacillation":

Must we part, Von Hügel, though much alike, for we
Accept the miracles of the saints and honour sanctity?

I -- though heart might find relief

Did I become a Christian man and choose for my belief

What seems most welcome in the tomb -- play a pre-destined part.

Homer is my example and his unchristened heart.

The lion and the honeycomb, what has Scripture said?

So get you gone, Von Hügel, though with blessings on your head.

Christopher Dawson, The Making of Europe, Catholic insistence on supremacy of spiritual over temporal made possible medieval unity, which we need to return to.

Franklin Roosevelt, in presidential campaign, quotes Pius XI's Quadragesimo Anno as "one of the greatest documents of modern times."

Allen Tate, "Emily Dickinson": "Shakespeare ... appeared at the collapse of the medieval system as a rigid pattern of life, but that pattern remained in Shakespeare what Shelley called a 'fixed point of reference' for his sensibility."

****1933****

Graham Greene, "Henry James: The Religious Aspect," on James's attraction for continental Catholicism, esp. its relation to the dead.

****1934****

Francis Yates, John Florio: Florio, his First Fruits, on Italian language, full of proverbs, model for Holofernes; probably one of Walsingham's spies, appointed as tutor to Southampton; perhaps also sent by Cecils as a spy in Essex's circle; Florio's diatribe against the "comedians" may be aimed at Shakespeare. "Southampton might have had reasons for distrusting Florio whilst fearing to get rid of him."

G. B. Harrison, in Companion to Shakespeare Studies: "Shakespeare's family was apparently Catholic, and his father was thereby obliged to abandon his public offices at Stratford during the zealous efforts of Bishop Whitgift in the 1570's; it follows that Shakespeare was brought up in the old faith, though there is no evidence of his practice in manhood."

Clara de Chambrun, Essential Documents: suggests that Phoenix and Turtle are Anne Line (Lyne)

and Father Mark Bosworth—see 1938).

M. J. Congar, Chrétiens Désunis: Principes d'un Oecuménisme Catholique, restates Catholic position but in view of ecumenical developments which believes “that others are Christian not in spite of their particular confession but in it and by it;” Catholicity is only imperfectly actualized so far, and Catholics have much to learn from their separated brethren.

****1935****

Pope Pius XI canonizes Thomas More and John Fisher.

****1936****

Edward VIII begins short reign, renounces throne for Mrs. Simpson. **George VI** begins reign.

Poulenc, converted after death of a friend in car accident, made pilgrimage to Sanctuary of Rocamadour in the Dordogne, “perilously situated alongside a winding road, and inspiring in those who have been privileged to visit it a feeling of unbelievable peace ... the humble chapel cut out of the rock mountainside, the courtyard surrounded by pink laurel trees and inside, the wonderful Virgin carved out of black wood ...”; began series of choral religious works until his death.

****1937****

Oliver Baker proposes Lancashire and Shakeshafte theory, citing Hoghton will, in Shakespeare's Warwickshire and the Unknown Years (see 1860, 1923).

John LaFarge, S.J., Interracial Justice, influential work.

Shostakovich, Fifth Symphony, following 1936 Pravda attack on his opera, “Lady Macbeth of Mtsensk,” for its muddle, and his consequent withdrawal of his expressionistic Fourth Symphony, in fear of Stalinesque repression; subtitled the Fifth, “A Soviet Artist's Reply to Just Criticism,” became pattern for many Soviet symphonies beginning in gloom and ending with victory parade; “probably the most frequently performed symphony of the century”. Bravado ending alludes to S's recent setting for a Pushkin poem, on how a barbarous artist's scrawlings over a work of genius will eventually flake away, and the original work stand forth again. (program notes, by Calum MacDonald, on 1994 CD, of a George Solti performance.)

****1938****

Clara De Chambrun's Shakespeare Rediscovered, with a preface dated 1937 by G. B. Harrison which said: “The most important chapters, to my mind, are the earlier, in which she sets out much evidence for supposing that John Shakespeare ... was a zealous Catholic, and that William Shakespeare was brought up in the Old Faith, which he never wholly deserted;” “It is no wonder that a conspiracy of silence seems to have been woven around this most important and fascinating book, for it belongs, with scholarly discretion, to what Belloc used to call ‘opposition history’” (Speaight, review Tablet, Dec. 14, 1957). De Chambrun on the John Shakespeare testament, Lucy, Southampton, Shakespeare's reputed copy of Holinshed. On Phoenix and Turtle as Anne Lyne, “with her self-imposed vows of chastity, poverty and obedience,” her dead body embraced by fellow martyred priest; prosecution said a man in white, probably a priest, was seen in her house; treble dated crow is Whitgift, screech owl is Popham the ‘hanging justice’ or Topcliffe; royal bird is King James.

Gerard Greenewald, Shakespeare's Attitude Towards the Catholic Church in “King John,” i.e. favorable.

Edgar Fripp, Shakespeare Man and Artist: John S. “beyond doubt an obstinate recusant, suddenly anxious to appear ... ready to plead ‘debt’” ; Debdale at Douai with Hunt who “probably took Debdale with him,” also at Rheims with Thomas Cottam.

Joseph Lortz, Die Reformation in Deutschland (-1940, trans. 1968): Luther is Catholic in insisting on justification by faith, but separated this out from the Catholic whole, and was wrong in his rejection of the “Catholic substance” safeguarded by the magisterium; a heresy necessary nevertheless to bring the Church back to true Catholicity. Criticized Erasmus, more than sincere Luther, for beginning of intellectual confusion, relativism, and individualism in the Church: “Essentially a restatement of a view first voiced by the sixteenth-century papal nuncio Aleander” (A. Dickens et al, Reformation in Historical Thought).

World War II will promote cooperation among Protestants and Catholics to protect a common heritage.

M. J. Congar, Divided Christendom: A Catholic Study of the Problem of Reunion: The Catholic Church “in actual practice realizes that Catholicity only in an imperfect degree ... That of which the separation of our brethren has deprived the Church ... is a loss to the outward actualization of its own Catholic capacities;” from them the Church can receive “a particular development which reveals the Church's treasures to herself, and in a true sense enriches her;” “they are not called to give up their real and positive religious values, but only the holding of them in separation.”

- **1939**** Douglas Bush, The Renaissance and English Humanism: “these lectures will be largely occupied with some Good Things which the Renaissance inherited from the Middle Ages.” On importance of Cicero and Seneca, allegorical reading of Bible (via Augustine), John of Salisbury integrating faith and classical culture, Petrarch, Ficino reconciling Plato/Potlinus with Christianity, Milton as climax of idea of educated Christian liberty, marred by Puritanism.
Arthur M. Schlesinger, Jr., Orestes A. Brownson: A Pilgrim’s Progress (Little, Brown): “he belongs to all Americans, not simply to Catholics. Perhaps an age more sympathetic to men who would not compromise and would not retreat will accord him his rightful place. He is a part of the national heritage.”
- **1940**** Graham Greene, The Power and the Glory, his version of a recusant priest.
Orwell dies, in midst of plans to write a study of Waugh, arguing against Marxist fallacy that art can only be good if it is progressive.
Ronald Knox, “King Henry the Sixth,” sermon in Captive Flames: A Collection of Panegyrics: “In our day there is some hope that his cause will be proceeded with a fresh after a long lapse of centuries.” “England did not lose her faith in King Henry until she lost her faith in the Catholic Church.” “The reopening of the cause at Rome after nearly four hundred years does seem to be practical politics just now.”
- **1941**** Maurice Powicke, The Reformation in England begins: “The one definite thing which can be said about the Reformation in England is that it was an act of State.”
- **1942**** Charles J. Sisson, “Shakespeare Quartos as Prompt-Copies with Some Account of Cholmeley’s Players and a New Shakespeare Allusion” (RES), on this Catholic company which presented King Lear and Pericles at recusant houses in 1609-10.
T. S. Eliot, Four Quartets (1939-42): “The great achievement .. is .. in the sacramental repossession of nature and time, things and history” (Malcolm Ross, 1954).
Camus, The Stranger (trans. 1946); Merseault on death row holds off the Catholic chaplain (“none of his certainties was worth one strand of a woman’s hair”).
- **1943**** E. K. Chambers argues the Shakeshafte, Hesketh, Lord Strange connection (“William Shakeshafte,” printed in Shakespearean Gleanings (1944)). “It was with this speculation that the case for the Hoghton connection rested for forty years, until Honigsmann [1985]” (Wilson 2004).
I. J. Semper, “Shakespeare’s Religion Once More” (Catholic World), good review of evidence for Shakespeare’s crypto-Catholicism.
Pope Pius XII encyclical, “Mystici Corporis Christi,” spoke of church as mystical body, “an improvement on previous juridical descriptions” (Pawley).
Pope Pius XII encyclical, “On Biblical Studies,” repudiated fundamentalism in Catholic exegesis and founded Catholic biblical study; writers use contemporary expression; only a few biblical affirmations have received authoritative interpretation
- **1944**** T. W. Baldwin’s William Shakspeare’s Small Latine ad Lesse Greeke, confirms Fripp’s suggestion that John Cottom is elder brother of priest Thomas Cottom, and develops Cottom’s Lancashire associations (first to trace him to Preston); argues Catholic influences on Shakespeare’s schooling.
G. Wilson Knight, “St. George and the Dragon” in The Olive and the Sword: “A personal centre [i.e. the Crown] is needed to safeguard the sanctity of personality, dramatize the greater self of each subject ... The king or hero [in Shakespeare] tries to identify himself with something that almost necessarily eludes personification ... The Crown is ... one bond of unity in an empire otherwise mainly composed of autonomous states ... is both heart and whole of the nation or empire; and therefore reflects at once its historic heritage, present soul-potentiality, and future destiny.” See also “New Dimensions in Shakespearian Interpretation” (1959): “As for politics, Shakespeare’s is a royal world, and his primary human symbol is the Crown, the King.” Also see “Shakespeare’s England” (1964): “He was a patriot; more, a Christian patriot. In the England of his time, he seems to have felt that State and Church, had, so far as was humanly possible, come together.”
Jacques Maritain, The Rights of Man and Natural Law (trans.), one of many such arguments that Catholicism was more consistent with founding fathers, Jefferson and Madison, than modern relativist liberalism.
- **1946**** John Henry De Groot (Presbyterian minister), in Shakespeare and the Old Faith, cites Thurston’s 1923 discovery of Borromeo testament and argues more fully for its importance, notes Campion-Persons-Allen connection, argues for John Shakespeare’s Catholic recusancy, for the Catholicism

of Shakespeare's teachers, and the plays's esteem for the old faith; notes how Shakespeare prunes anti-Catholicism of Troublesome Reign of King John.

Harold Gardiner, Mysteries' End: An Investigation of the Last Days of the Medieval Religious Stage: on "the popularity of the medieval drama in England even so late in the century of the Reformation," confirms the fact of the "dissatisfaction under Elizabeth, dissatisfaction and feelings even stronger over a considerable portion of the land."

Waugh, Brideshead Revisited (Orwell on Lord Marchmain's deathbed conversion: the "veneer is bound to crack sooner or later. One cannot really be a Catholic & grown-up"); Lord Marchmain reviews history of house, his conversion thus a conversion of England, crime of freedom of his divorce; Charles prays at bedside; miracle of the sign; chapel light, deplorable design, "something remote from builder's intentions; old knights saw it put out, now burns again." Sebastian joy as door to Catholicism; Julia their adultery "part of a plan;" Charles's first prayer, with Julia at Brideshead: "God and they are against us."

Thomas Nelan, Catholic Doctrines in Spenser's Poetry (cited by Weatherby 1999).

Robert Lowell, Lord Weary's Castle, "The Quaker Graveyard in Nantucket," Part 6, "Our Lady of Walsingham": "and the world will come to Walsingham."

Sister Mary Tarr, Catholicism in Gothic Fiction 1946: Gothic novel relies on fascination for Catholic materials, the allure of Catholic ceremonial; "pious terror," "solemn, yet delightful emotion" (quotes from novels) despite rational disapproval; the sublime, melodramatic sentimentality, religious awe. Private Catholic devotion "is an act beginning in the emotions and ending in morbidity." 107 out of 127 Gothic romances make use of Catholic things; 24 works of fiction bet. 1796 and 1828 had "monk" in the title, six had "friar," and eleven had "nun." In some instances monastic titles used for romances which had little Catholic material.

[Hubert Jedin, Katholische Reformation oder Gegenreformation, trans. "Catholic Reformation or Counter Reformation," emphasizing both, the former as self-reform beginning in 15th century, codified at Trent, continuing into 18th century, the latter as "defense" against Protestants. From Luecke trans., 1999: "By its bold claims to reestablish the true and original Christianity, the Protestant Reformation sapped valuable energies from the Catholic Reformation in northern Europe" (35); "the outbreak of revolution within the church struck the humanist reform movement too soon, before it had outgrown the radicalism of youth and achieved maturity in Saints John Fisher and Thomas More" (41). So though both were intertwined (i.e. Ignatius, Borromeo, de Sales, classics of both), we need to distinguish between Catholic Reformation and counter-reformation: "a spontaneous movement grounded in the continuities of spiritual life versus a dialectical process that emerged from a reaction against Protestantism" (44)].

Erich Auerbach, Mimesis, trans. 1953: Christianity, as in medieval theatre, led to collapse of high and low styles, fusion of high drama and ordinary; illustrated in Shakespeare's Prince Hal. "The dissolution of medieval Christianity ... brings out a dynamic need for self-orientation, a will to trace the secret forces of life," flourishes in Shakespeare but then this exploration cut down by the "restrictive countermovements Protestantism and the Counter Reformation, absolutistic ordering of society and intellectual life, academic and puristic imitations of antiquity, rationalism" etc. Figural interpretation in Augustine said the figure had as much reality as the events it prophesied, vs. Philo reducing historical OT events to purely spiritual happenings.

****1947****

C. S. Lewis: "Be assured that for me too schism in the Body of Christ is both a source of grief and a matter for prayers, being a most serious stumbling block to those coming and one which makes even the faithful weaker in repelling the common foe. However, I am a layman ... and least skilled in the deeper question of sacred theology. I have tried to do the only that I think myself able to do: that is, to leave completely aside the subtler question about which the Roman Church and Protestants disagree among themselves ... and in my own books to expound, rather, those things which ... are shared by us."

Frances Yates, The French Academies of the Sixteenth Century, on the academy ecumenical movement (see Veevers 1989), and their intervention in French wars of religion.

Camus, The Plague (trans. 1948): narrated by secular Dr. Rieu, with Jesuit priest Fr. Paneloux whose sermon "marks an important date in the history of the period": on plague as scourge of God, "works for your good" "leading us through the dark valley ... towards the holy silence;" "It is hard to say if this sermon had any effect on our townsfolk," vs. Rieu: "mightn't it be better for God if we refuse to believe in Him and struggle with all our might against death." Paneloux later

stunned by death of child (like Ivan K.), preaches on this great test of faith in God, “the agony of a child was humiliating to the heart and to the mind ... and since it was God’s will, we, too, should will it ... The sufferings of children were our bread of affliction, but without this bread our souls would die of spiritual hunger;” we should stay on in the plague like that last surviving monk; refuses medicine and dies looking at crucifix. At end, Rieu celebrates those “who, while unable to be saints but refusing to bow down to pestilences, strive their utmost to be healers.”

Graham Greene, “British Dramatists” in The Interpretation of Literature: “Religion was better left alone for the time (and afterwards found itself left alone for good) so that Shakespeare only allowed himself occasional glancing lines (Hamlet’s prayer, the papal nuncio rebuking Philip of France) which showed just the fin of the dangerous thoughts moving below the surface.”

****1948****

Richard Hanson and Reginald Fuller, The Church of Rome: A Dissuasive, on RC “power-complex.” “If the Churches of the Reformation have recovered new life in our day, it is precisely in so far as they have endeavoured to combine a loyalty to the true insights of the Reformation with a recovery of the heritage of their Catholic past” (123). “By cutting itself off from its Protestant fellow-Christians, it [RC Church] has closed its ears to their challenge ... the Church of Rome has become a denomination, separated from other Christian bodies.”

G.B.Harrison, “Shakespeare’s Religion” (Commonweal): Chambrun’s “Shakespeare Rediscovered” (1938) “did not perhaps receive the attention it deserved.”

Jacques Maritain takes post at Princeton’s Institute for Advanced Study (-1956).

World Council of Churches formally constituted in meeting at Amsterdam, and would adopt UN Declaration on Human Rights: “Everyone has the right to freedom of thought, conscience and religion ...” Toronto Declaration, made in 1950, noted that all churches recognize Christian elements in the others.

Thomas Merton, Seven Storey Mountain, making monasticism fashionable for intellectuals; “America is discovering the contemplative life.”

F. R. Leavis, The Great Tradition: George Eliot, Henry James, Joseph Conrad: “The principle of organization, and the principle of development, in her [Austen’s] work is an intense moral interest of her own in life that is in the first place a preoccupation with certain problems that life compels on her as personal ones.” “Mr. Winters discusses him [H. James] as a product of the New England ethos in its last phase, when a habit of moral strenuousness remained after dogmatic Puritanism had evaporated and the vestigial moral code was evaporating too. This throws a good deal of light on the elusiveness that attends James’s peculiar ethical sensibility.” “She [Eliot] exhibits a traditional moral sensibility expressing itself not within a frame of ‘old articles of faith’ (as James obviously intends the phrase), but nevertheless with perfect sureness, in judgments that involve confident positive standards, and yet affect us as simply the report of luminous intelligence.” “he [James] was in quest of an ideal society,” not available in England or America. “So we find him developing into a paradoxical kind of recluse, a recluse living socially in the midst of society.”

Ernst Curtius, European Literature and the Latin Middle Ages (trans. 1953): to the English trans. Curtius added an appendix, “The Medieval Bases of Western Thought”: “Medieval forms of life subsist until about 1750” climaxing in Goethe.

****1949****

Catholics (because of Irish immigrants) about 10%.

John Danby, Shakespeare Study of Nature. A Study of King Lear: “Henry VI is nearly blameless as a king can be. In accordance with sixteenth-century practice he is given a tragic fault (the manner of his marrying the ‘she-wolf of France’), but it is merely a token -- something as academic as Romeo jilting Rosalind, and as intrinsically meaningless. He behaves throughout the play [3 Henry VI] as the pious, pitiful, Christian-hearted King. Richard is at the opposite extreme ... Henry VI is the regulating principle of traditional society. He is mercy, pity, love, human kindness, reinforced by God’s ordinating fiat. It is this which Richard kills ... [Cordelia] is the norm by which the wrongness of Edmund’s world and the imperfection of Lear is judged.”

Paul Blanshard, American Freedom and Catholic Power: “the Catholic problem is still with us.”

****1950****

A. C. Southern’s Elizabethan Recusant Prose, on style of such books.

Christopher Devlin, “Robert Southwell and Contemporary Poets” (The Month): argues that Rape of Lucrece was written in response to his ‘cousin,’ Southwell’s, denunciation of pagan Venus and Adonis (builds on suggestion by Herbert Thurston quoting Hales in 1894).

Philip Hughes, The Reformation in England: “These English Catholics ... were a great

churchgoing people, and they had, above all else, a remarkable devotion to the mass.” “But you could hardly call Hughes a ‘revisionist,’ since there was so little of substance to revise” (P. Collinson, Historical Research, 2004).

Maritain, Three Reformers, hatchet job on Luther’s subjectivism. “In the social order, the modern city sacrifices the person to the individual; it gives universal suffrage, equal rights, liberty of opinion, to the individual, and delivers the person, isolated, naked, with no social framework to support and protect it, to all the devouring powers which threaten the soul’s life, ... to the infinite demands of matter to manufacture and use And it says to each of the poor children of men set in the midst of this turmoil: ‘You are a free individual; defend yourself, save yourself, all by yourself.’ It is a homicidal civilization.”

Theodore Adorno, The Authoritarian Personality, includes Catholics.

Herbert Butterfield, The Whig Interpretation of History, i.e. dividing the world into the friends and enemies of progress; fallacy of organizing history on basis of an unconscious assumption. “Instead of seeing the modern world emerge as the victory of the children of light ... it is at least better to see it emerge as the result of a clash of wills, a result which often neither party wanted or even dreamed of.” But in fighting the idea that Protestantism is the source of progress, Butterfield tends to fall into his own Whig version of secularization and growing tolerance. “I do not know who could deny that the Reformation provoked a revival of ... religious fanaticism ... and when we look at Erasmus and Machiavelli and the spirit of the Renaissance we must at least wonder whether freedom of thought and modern rationalism might not have had an easier course if Luther had never resuscitated militant religion.” “the real seat of the tragedy lay in the ideas which Lutheran and Calvin and the Pope held in common ... that society and government should be founded on the basis of the one authoritative religion.” The ideal of toleration came out of the tragic clash of Protestantism and Catholicism.

C. S. Lewis, The Lion, the Witch and the Wardrobe, followed by 6 more Narnia books, the final one, The Last Battle, in 1956. On Aslan, the lion, both Christ and a king, who consecrates-crowns the kids the new kings: romantic reflection of the Anglican unity of church and royalty.

Ronald Knox, Enthusiasm: A Chapter in the History of Religion: “Unless we see it against this background of mysticism, unless we realize that it was the exaggeration, at every point, of an existing and perfectly orthodox tendency, our judgement of Quietism will necessarily be at fault.” “Two types of enthusiasm ... ‘mystical’ and ‘evangelical enthusiasm. One, taking its point of departure from the Incarnation, rather than the Atonement, by-passes the theology of grace and concentrates on the God within; not repelling, necessarily the Unitarian. The other, more acutely conscious of man’s fallen state, thinks always in terms of redemption; to know, somehow, that your sins are forgiven, that you are new creature in God’s sign, is all that matter. Call the two tendencies if you will ... Platonist and Aristotelian, Johannine and Pauline...” “But my aim is to interpret enthusiasm, not to criticize it” (yeah right). Book’s last sentences: “Men will not live without vision; that moral we do well to carry away with us from contemplating, in so many strange forms, the record of the visionaries. If we are content with the humdrum, the second-best, the hand-over-hand, it will not be forgive us. All through the writing of this book I have been haunted by ...” L’inertie est le seul vice ... Et la seule vertu est ... L’enthousiasme.” But the damage is done.

****1951****

A. L. Rowse, The England of Elizabeth: the Structure of Society: “It is difficult for anyone without a knowledge of anthropology to appreciate fully the astonishing audacity, the profound disturbance to the unconscious levels upon which society lives its life, of such an action as the substitution of an English liturgy for the age-long Latin rite of Western Christendom in which England had been swaddled time out of mind ... nothing can detract from the revolutionary audacity of such an interference with the customary, the subconscious, the ritual element in life.”

The journal, Biographical Studies, later entitled Recusant History founded, promotes objective scholarship.

Graham Greene, introd. to John Gerard’s Autobiography, trans. Caraman: “Isn’t there one whole area of the Elizabethan scene that we miss even in Shakespeare ... The kings speak, the adventurers speak ... the madmen and the lovers, the soldiers and the poets, but the martyrs are quite silent.”

Greene, The End of the Affair.

Karl Adam, One and Holy trans. C. Hastings. 1947 lecture in German. With Imprimatur, Adam

gives scorching portrait of medieval abuse, urges reunion but strongly defends Petrine principle: “wide tracts of Luther’s thought were simply Catholic ... rapprochement between Catholicism and Protestantism will only be possible if it takes Luther as its starting point.” With separation of Protestants, the church “lost with them all those precious constructive powers, all those souls of deep religious aspiration who have since then worked so fruitfully and creatively within the separated communions, and who might have been called to cultivate the most perfect flowers of religious life upon Catholic soil.” Indeed, the church’s “most dazzling, most brilliant mark, her world-wide Catholicity, was in danger of losing its former triumphant splendour ... With each schism the question arose like a threat... Has she not become a sect like the others?” In controversy, theologians over-emphasize one truth, and don’t see core truth in heresy; thus Lutheran individualism caused overemphasis on Church authority, Luther emphasis on faith led to Catholic overemphasis on works. WWII impressed all Christians that the time for inter-confessional strife was over, and that Christ needed a unanimous witness. Cites Fr. J. Kopf that “reunion of the Church will not only repair the wrong of schism” but will mean “the building up of a new, more embracing, richer unity.”

****1952****

Elizabeth II begins reign.

Mutschmann and Wentersdorf, Shakespeare and Catholicism: argues Shakespeare’s Catholic friends and associates, Catholic importance of Blackfriars, importance of Catholic themes in the plays (purgatory, ghosts, indulgences).

William John Tucker, “Shakespeare, a Catholic?” (Catholic World), good summary of evidence.

John Berryman, Berryman’s Shakespeare, written, see pub. 1999.

****1953****

I. J. Semper, “The Ghost in Hamlet: Pagan or Christian?,” The Month, on the Catholicism of the Ghost.

Pope Pius XII excommunicates Father Leonard Feeney, a Boston Jesuit, for maintaining “No Salvation Outside the Catholic Church” without the proper qualifications, i.e. “God accepts even an implicit will, called by that name because it is contained in the good disposition of soul in which a man wills to conform his will to the will of God” (Holy Office decree).

Elizabeth Cole, “Seven Problems of the Fitzwilliam Virginal Book” (Proceedings of the Royal Musical Assoc.): its musicians and dedicatees a complex web of recusant relationships.

****1954****

Alan Keen and Roger Lubbock’s The Annotator; argues Lancaster connections, Arden family Catholicism, Shakespeare’s annotations, defending Catholic clergy, in connection with a copy of Hall’s Chronicle, putatively Shakespeare’s copy.

Maurice Quinlan, “Shakespeare and the Catholic Burial Services” (Shakespeare Quarterly), on allusions to the Catholic service in Hamlet and its “maimed rites.”

Louis Martz, The Poetry of Meditation, on the Ignatian and Franciscan meditative structures as an influence on English poetry: 17th century witnesses “reunion with the central tendency of continental Catholic spirituality” (a structure later applied in modified form to the “Structure and Style in the Greater Romantic Lyric” by Meyer Abrams in 1965); applies Bremond’s Salesian humanism to Herbert; notes likeness of poor Yorick speech to passage in Fray Luis de Granada.

Abraham Maslow, Motivation and Personality: “self-actualizing” people are unlikely to accept “supernatural” religion and “institutional orthodoxy” (one of many such, cited by McGreevy, 1997; also Riesman The Lonely Crowd (1950) on the importance of autonomous inner-directed individuals).

Bede Griffiths, The Golden String: an Autobiography: “It is difficult to describe the fear with which the Roman Church filled me. It was, no doubt, partly the fear of the unknown. The Roman Church had always been for us as a family, as my father once expressed it; outside the pale ... Behind this family feeling there was also a deeper feeling still, the prejudice which every Englishman inherits from the racial memory. The breach with Rome is a psychic event in all our lives, something which lies deep buried in the unconscious, but is ready to erupt into consciousness whenever circumstances force us to encounter it.”

Tolkien, The Lord of the Rings, “fundamentally ... Catholic ... consciously in the revision”; shire represents recovery of a pre-Reformation world, pre-Capitalism with its rootlessness, thus rejects ring of power; thus T. did not want book associated with triumphalist British imperialism after WWII. T: “the progress of the tale ends in [something] like the establishment of an effective Holy Roman Empire with its seat in Rome;” planting of fairy tree and protection of elf queen, is like return of England to Catholicism of Virgin Mary. But shire reflects post-Reformation

England in not remembering its past and needing to recover it (N. Boyle, 2005). Malcom Ross (Malcolm McKenzie Ross), Poetry and Dogma: The Transfiguration of Eucharistic Symbols in Seventeenth Century English Poetry: 17th century English poetry struggled with the consequences of the loss of Catholic corporate sacramentalism, loss of union of spiritual and material, of individual and society. There is a “movement of traditional Christian symbolism from the centre to the periphery of expression and experience, a movement, in other words from sacrament to ornament, the declension of symbol into metaphor.” Machiavellian materialism and neo-Platonic spiritualism split apart, with no sacramental grounding. Hooker transfers corporate loyalties from medieval church universal to church national (Hooker: “every Englishman is a Christian, and every Christian in England is an Englishman”). “The crown in Shakespeare’s symbolization of it remained to a degree impersonal, thereby serving as focus for deeply corporate intuitions of universal value.” For the cavalier Lovelace, the cult of Elizabeth the Virgin gives way to the cult of Charles the Christ, reduced to a ‘scandalous personal icon.’ Thus Milton in Paradise Lost achieves an individualist heterodoxy (see Ross on Milton above). Vaughan can only nod nostalgically to lost past, Herbert’s symbols lack analogical confidence. (Martz review: “There seems to be an tendency to regard any evidence of ‘religious interiorism’ as Protestant in its implications”). So called “via media” in fact “vacillates uncontrollably between Catholic and Zwinglian extremes.” “Without a recovery of this corporate sense, I suspect that Christian art can advance no further because it will have failed to cure the disease of alienation.” Cites S. L. Bethell’s The Cultural Revolution of the Seventeenth Century (1951). Bethell wrote: “Butler’s analogy works only in one direction, from the natural to the supernatural, but the earlier analogical thinking was ... a two-way street.” “Butler coolly elaborates by abstract reason a long analogy between the (scientifically understood) natural order and the supernatural, but here is none of the rapid back-and-forth play of analogy such as we find in Elizabethan writers. Butler argues from analogy; he does not think analogically.” Both Bethell and Ross cite Eliot on “dissociation of sensibility” (1921).

John Dillenberger and Claude Welch, Protestant Christianity

“The fact of diversity in belief and practice is a striking part of the Protestant heritage ... This may be due to human creativity and human finitude; even more it may be due to prideful men who think too highly of their own outlook upon life. Protestantism accepts this ambiguity as a part of its heritage. It accepts its diversity as a sign of health and sickness. ... The hoped-for reunion of many of the churches of Christ will not and ought not to bring men to one opinion, but it may provide a framework within which different nuances of life and thought may in effect be considered to strengthen rather than weaken the Christian cause.” “In fact the striking thing about Protestantism is not its diversity but its unity. Protestants claim that the vitality of their faith is nowhere more evident than in the stress upon each man’s own experience of the biblical faith which produces so many authentically similar expressions of faith.” Protestants affirm that this [Luther’s] renewed religious outlook, for all its relation to contemporary social, economic and political forces, can be finally explained only as an act of God, in which, for better or worse, the burden of a message was laid upon a human being.” For Luther emphasis on the Bible should result neither in subjectivism or relativism: “He was certain that there was a sufficiently clear and central body of material concerning Christ which would be common property to those who searched the Bible” and “would result in the emergence of God’s justifying work as the central point.” “The Roman Church refuses to allow the Reformation and its heritage, a positive place in its inner history. It is the conviction of Protestants that thereby Roman Catholicism is weakened and perverted---because the Reformation was a genuinely creative and restorative movement;” “the Roman Church precisely claims that it is infallible and irreformable ... Against every such claim to absoluteness (whether religious or social and political) Protestantism must protest.” Protestantism is essentially “self-critical.” “The doctrine of salvation by grace alone is in part a confession of the inadequacy and perverseness of all human claims to righteousness before God.” “The great temptation in Protestantism has not been the idolatry of particular forms, but the opposite, viz. the lack of concern for all religious forms and the consequent weakening of the sense of the sacred. A religious perspective which rejects all finite claims to ultimacy runs the risk of failing to see that the ultimate is known only through finite vehicles. This risk is taken, however, in order to maintain the freedom and spontaneity of the human encounter with God.”

M. D. H. Parker, The Slave of Life: A Study of Shakespeare, acknowledging Mutschmann and

Wentersdorf (1952), in appendix reviews and urges Catholic argument, cites Lucy issue, John Shakespeare's recusancy, Southampton Catholicism, etc.

Gabriel Le Bas, Études de sociologie religieuse, (-1956) (with his 1931 manifesto), pioneering sociological study of common people Catholicism in France.

Salvador Dali, "The Sacrament of the Last Supper," one of many paintings reflecting his influence by Spanish mystical Catholicism.

Will Herberg, Protestant-Catholic-Jew: "we may describe Protestantism, Catholicism and Judaism as three great branches or divisions of the 'American religion'."

David Knowles, The Religious Orders in England (Cambridge UP), on the 14th century: "The more orthodox men were, the more violently they criticized and demanded reform ... until towards the end of the century, no one had any suspicion that there might be anything disloyal or heterodox in criticism ... One of the most disastrous and blighting effects of Wycliffism was that, for the first time in the history of this country, it associated criticism with heterodoxy, and it must have tended to make orthodox reformers think twice about what they said."

William Pantin, The English Church in the Fourteenth Century (Cambridge UP): "The reason for the English bishops' slowness to condemn Wyclif (for which they were rebuked by the pope) ... was probably because for a long time the attacks of Wyclif seemed to belong to the second [bitter but orthodox] rather than to the less familiar third [heretical] category of controversies."

****1956****

Allison and Rogers's Catalogue of Catholic Books in English Printed Abroad or Secretly in England, 1558-1640, lists nearly a thousand books. Revised into two volumes, 1989, 1994.

Louis Bouyer, The Spirit and Forms of Protestantism, trans. of Du protestantisme à l'Eglise (1954): "Protestantism ... under no necessity to embody itself in schism and heresy [resulting "from external and adventitious factors"] ... should have initiated in the Church itself a powerful moment of regeneration." Protestant mistake in minimizing interior transformation out of fear of idolatry or works, provoked Catholic over-emphasis on church authority.

****1957****

Ian Watt, The Rise of the Novel: Studies in Defoe, Richardson and Fielding: English novel as fundamentally Protestant form, characterized by "Puritan individualism," also "the tendency to increase consciousness of the self as a spiritual entity, and the tendency to a kind of democratisation of the moral and social outlook." Ian Watt, The Rise of the Novel: Studies in Defoe, Richardson and Fielding: Novelistic realism developed out of rejection of medieval universals. "Economic individualism explains much of Crusoe's character ... but it is Puritan individualism which controls his spiritual being." Cites Troeltsch. "Two aspect of this new Protestant emphasis—the tendency to increase consciousness of the self as a spiritual entity, and the tendency to a kind of democratization of the moral and social outlook—are particularly important ... to ... the ... novel." "This 'internalization of conscience' is everywhere manifested in Calvinism In later generations the introspective habit remained even where religious convictions weakened." Given individualism, God signals his intentions for the person "in the events of his daily life Every item in his personal experience ... potentially rich in moral and spiritual meaning." "We can say of him [Defoe], as of later novelists in the same tradition, such as Samuel Richardson, George Eliot or D. H. Lawrence, that they have inherited of Puritanism everything except its religious faith;" "all have an intensely active conception of life as a continuous moral and social struggle ... they all seek by introspection and observation to build their own personal sense of moral certainty; and in different ways they all manifest the self-righteous and somewhat angular individualism of the earlier Puritan character." Defoe reflects "the Puritan insistence on the need of the individual to overcome the world in his own soul, to achieve a spiritual solitude without recourse to monasticism the Puritan insistence on possessing one's soul intact from a sinful world is couched in terms which suggest a more absolute, personal and secular alienation from society." Defoe's "inconclusive endings" show his devotion to "the disorderliness of life." Watt later revised by Michael McKeon's The Origins of the English Novel, 1600-1740 (1987) which argues, among other things, that the novel was influenced by "the anti-individualist and idealizing tradition of romance."

Raymond Williams, Culture and Society: "Burke was perhaps the last serious thinker who could find the 'organic' in an existing society. As the new industrial society established itself, critics like Carlyle and Ruskin could find the 'organic' image only in a backward look: this is the basis of their 'medievalism', and as that of others. It was not, in this tradition, until Morris that this image acquired a distinctively future reference—the image of socialism."

- **1958**** Christopher Hill, Puritanism and Revolution: “The Reformation in England was an act of state.” (but see Powicke earlier).
Robert Stevenson, Shakespeare’s Religious Frontier; argues Lancaster connection via. Stratford schoolmaster and Hoghton will; repeats Chambers’s Shakeshafte theory, argues Cottom connection.
- **1959**** The Sonnets of William Alabaster, ed. G. M. Story and Helen Gardner.
Frances Yates, The Valois Tapestries, on these 1582 artistic renderings of royal games aimed at celebrating reconciliation of Dutch Catholics and Protestants, “a pathetic monument to his [William of Orange’s] hopes of finding a solution to the problem of the Netherlands by putting his trust in the House of Valois” (see 1582, 1583).
Teilhard de Chardin, The Phenomenon of Man (orig. 1955 in French): applying evolutionary theory to man as culminating consciousness which will expand; a teleological quasi-Lamarckian theory, but integrating vast knowledge into Catholic humanism; admired by Flannery O’Connor for its integration of body and mind: “From a theological point of view Teilhard de Chardin’s work can be defined as an effort to shed light on the natural conditions and preparations leading to a supernatural consummation” (qu Feeley).
- **1960**** Secretariat for the Promotion of Unity among Christians established by Pope, with Cardinal Bea as president.
William Lynch, Christ and Apollo: The Dimensions of the Literary Imagination, often cited as an example of the Catholic incarnational approach. “I take ... the symbol of Apollo as a kind of infinite dream over against which was Christ’s definiteness and actuality ... rejected by every gnostic system since.” . Cites Allen Tate’s essays on the Angelic and Symbolic Imagination.
Dr. Geoffrey Fisher, archbishop of Canterbury and primate of England, visits Pope John XXIII, first such meeting since 1397.
John Kennedy, presidential campaign: “I believe in an America where the separation of church and state is absolute.”
Joseph Lecler, S. J., Toleration and the Reformation, trans. T. L. Westlow (orig. 1955): acknowledges W. K. Jordan (“rare and valuable”)
Peter Milward, “The Tragedy of Shakespeare” in Japanese; on political allegory, i.e. shadow of Henry VIII in Claudius, Othello and Macbeth.
John Courtney Murray, We Hold These Truths. Influenced Kennedy and Vatican II on Religious Liberty.
- **1961**** H. A. Shield, “A Stratford Schoolmaster,” in The Month argues John Cottom’s connection to Lancashire.
Christianity Divided, ed. Daniel J. Callahan et a. (Sheed and Ward), admired by Flannery O’Connor, with Max Thurian’s “The Real Presence” influencing “Parker’s Back”, and Barth’s “The Concept of the Church: “to take each other seriously means: mutually to bear the whole burden of our opposition, both as a burden and as the burden of our being opposed to each other ... It means to see the other over there ... in his whole, horrifyingly different faith, in his uncanny turning away from that which for us is the most central and unshakeable Christian truth; while at the same time we make clear to ourselves that he, on his part, is just as horrified about us Each side sees first and foremost the same reality so very differently,” but it is the same reality.
Hans Küng, The Council, Reunion and Reform (trans. 1965): “It is a hopeful omen for reunion that the latest presentation of Church history from both sides, on the subject of the Reformation and its causes, bear a strong resemblance to each other. Both sides nowadays see the good in the other and the evil in their own ... Protestants see the positive values in the Church of that age, and Catholics recognize the Church’s share in the guilt of schism;” “we see much of the Catholic reform of that time displaying itself as reaction, in the sense of a restoration aimed at maintaining what was established and restoring according to the pattern of a superior past, with the consequent danger of stunting and fossilizing the fullness of Catholicism ... It is impossible to overlook a dangerous hardening in all this from the time of Paul IV ...”
H. A. Anno van Gelder, The Two Reformations in the 16th Century, on the major religious revolution (as distinct from the minor revolution, Protestantism), influenced by humanism, stressing human freedom, earth as permeated by God, man as crowning creation , capable of approaching divinity, Christ not as sacrificial victim, but personified humanitas, typified in Erasmus, Colet as bridge figure, Spenser more Erasmian than Calvinist in notions of grace and

faith; this major revolution illustrated in **Shakespeare** (349) and Montaigne. See summary; calls this a revolutionary new emphasis, different both from orthodox Catholicism and Protestant radicalism. "Although the traditional terms continued to be used, and the Humanists consequently had the feeling of not deviating in any way from the accepted doctrine ... they only conform outwardly to the religious credos," great distance from church emphasis on death, devil, otherworldly salvation. [Helpful, though exaggerating the inconsistency with orthodox Catholicism, despite disclaimers of Erasmus, Montaigne, etc., in order to claim a middle way]

Robert McAfee Brown, The Spirit of Protestantism, mature analysis from Protestant point of view; "It is harder for the Roman Catholic to acknowledge that Roman Catholicism 'needs' Protestantism." "If there is any sure proof of the patience of God, it is in the fact that he has endured the varieties of Protestantism for four centuries ... If there is any sure sign of the power of God, it is in the fact that through the Protestant churches Jesus Christ has become a reality in countless lives."

Jean Leclercq, The Love of Learning and the Desire for God, classic portrayal of the rich spirituality, learning, and Christian humanism of the monks.

Raymond Biggar, Langland's and Chaucer's Treatment of Monks, Friars and Priests (diss. U. of Wisconsin): though Gower's views criticizing church corruption were "essentially the same as those of Wyclif, and considering also his strong views about the corruption of the Church ... it is curious to find how strongly he denounces 'lollardie' in his later writings" (G. C. Macaulay, ed. Works of Gower): not unusual, says Biggar, "when strong criticism was common among the orthodox ... but Wyclif and the Lollard movement called for a commitment of one's loyalty for or against the established church ... [Gower's] was a much more subdued voice in the nineties than it was in the eighties. In the interim, one age, an age of free criticism, had come to an end and another, of conservative reaction, had begun."

****1962****

Second Vatican Council begins, embodying principle of 'aggiornamento' or accommodation to the "needs of the times," reflecting Pope John XXIII's vision of integration: aims to end church's cultural isolation, initiate new freedom of expression, affirm dignity of laity, heal religious divisions, defend freedom of conscience, promote acculturation, affirm historical scholarship, take on responsibility for future of the world (John O'Malley's list); approve church-state separation, Protestants are members of body of Christ. Document on religious freedom, Dignitatis Humanae: "the right to religious freedom has its foundation in the very dignity of the human person;" "wrong is done when government imposes upon its people, by force or fear or other means, the profession or repudiation of any religion." Dignitatis humane ... was discontinuous not only with the long 'Constantinian era' but particularly with the condemnation of separation of church and state by the popes of the 19th and 20th centuries" (John O'Malley, Theological Studies 2006); "the age-old insistence of the Church on the obligation of Christian states to enforce and promote the Catholic religion was overturned" (Duffy, Faith of our Fathers).

Thomas Kuhn, The Structure of Scientific Revolutions, with chapters "The Nature and Necessity of Scientific Revolutions," "Revolutions as Changes of World View," "Progress Through Revolutions" (includes progress in filling out the paradigm). New paradigms develop as a result of anomalies afflicting the old paradigms. "Other creative fields display progress of the same sort." Reinforces idea of the obsolescence of old world views.

Marshall McLuhan, The Gutenberg Galaxy, "concerned to show why alphabetic man was disposed to sacralize his mode of being." 69

Hugh Ross Williamson, The Day Shakespeare Died: reviews John Shakespeare's persecution by Lucy; on John Robinson's continued tenancy at Blackfriars thus keeping it in recusant hands; Hermione's defence echoes Campion's defence; and description of Wolsey echoes Campion's History of Ireland; exposed by John Speed (see 1611), and so Shakespeare retired to Stratford.

****1963****

Fr. Christopher Devlin's Hamlet's Divinity and Other Essays: reviews previous evidence; cites parallel of Lear language to the Christian Directory; discusses Lord Strange's Catholic connections; speculates meeting with Persons and Campion.

Roland Frye, Shakespeare and Christian Doctrine: attacking generalized Christian interpretation, Frye argued: "We are repeatedly faced with assertions as to what sixteenth-century Christians would have thought of particular characters, actions, and speeches, but rarely -- indeed, almost never -- do we find evidence cited from the sixteenth century to buttress the assertions." Appendix discussing Catholic priest's censorship of Shakespeare plays at Valladolid, denying

Jesuit appropriation of Shakespeare (and religious interpretation generally), but: “At two points in Macbeth, however, lines have been drawn vertically down the margin by words which must have held special poignancy for the exiled priests” (3.5.48ff, 4.3.39ff); priest censors sexual, also anti-papal rhetoric, all of Measure for Measure, also Henry VIII’s joyful confidence in Elizabeth (5.564-69).

Helen C. White, Tudor Books of Saints and Martyrs, on the influence of saints’ legends, as in Caxton’s Golden Legend, on descriptions of Catholic martyrs.

Pope Paul VI addresses Vatican Council: “If we are in any way to blame for that separation, we humbly beg God’s forgiveness and ask pardon too of our brethren who feel themselves to have been injured by us.”

****1964****

J. Crehan, “Shakespeare and the Sarum Ritual,” The Month: Oberon’s blessing like a paraphrase of the Benedictio Thalami in Catholic Church’s old Sarum rite.

G. K. Hunter, “Six Notes on Measure for Measure” (Shakespeare Quarterly): portrait of Isabella reflects Shakespeare’s detailed knowledge of the rule of the Poor Clare sisters.

Hugh Hanley, “Shakespeare’s Family in Stratford Records,” (TLS 21 May); Stratford ecclesiastical records show Susanna was charged, with the Sadlers, for not receiving the sacrament, later dismissed; courts acted because of Gunpowder Plot six months previous.

Etienne Delaruelle, L’église au temps du Grand Schisme, and later books, emphasizing medieval “piety” crossing class lines, rejecting notion of a bilevel culture, helped bring ordinary people into mainstream of historical study.

A. G. Dickens’s The English Reformation argued that as early as the 1530s “English Catholicism, despite its gilded decorations, was an old, unseaworthy, and ill-commanded galleon,” and Protestantism greeted with enthusiasm; argued against earlier simple ‘act of state’ interpretations and emphasized local archival resources. “The ‘anti-Frouudian, neo-Tractarian reaction which swept across English Reformation studies between 1890 and 1940’ was over” (Haigh, Historical Research 2004). Dickens: “the vast majority of Elizabethan Englishmen who cared deeply about religion were either Roman Catholics or Anglican Puritans. Until 1600 or later that spirituality within the Anglican Church which could reasonably be described as non-Puritan remained rather exiguous.” See A. Mason, in Oxford Companion to Christian Thought “the Elizabethan settlement was a middle way, not between Geneva and Rome, but between Geneva and Wittenberg.”

Hans Küng, Justification: The Doctrine of Karl Barth and a Catholic Reflection (trans. from 1957 German original). Prefatory letter from Barth: “If what you have presented ... is actually the teaching of the Roman Catholic Church, then I must certainly admit that my view of justification agrees with the Roman Catholic view.” Küng’s intro. describes 16th century division as “a rupture which Christians regard as a punishment and non-Christians a scandal, down to this very day.”

Vatican Council’s “Decree on Ecumenism”: “men of both sides were to blame” for the separation of communities from the Catholic Church.” “We can say that in some real way they are joined with us in the Holy Spirit, for to them also he gives his gifts and graces, and is thereby operative among them with his sanctifying power.” “All those justified by faith through baptism are incorporated into Christ. They therefore have a right to be honoured by the title of Christian, and are properly regarded as brothers and sisters in the Lord by the sons and daughters of the Catholic Church.” “Nevertheless, our separated brethren ... are not blessed with that unity which Jesus Christ wished to bestow on all those whom He has regenerated.” “Furthermore, the Church herself finds it more difficult to express in actual life her full catholicity in all of its aspects;” “present divisions ... are a ‘ruga et macula’ ... The Church of Rome is thus doctrinally committed to seek unity.” “It is hardly surprising if sometimes one tradition has come nearer than the other to an apt appreciation of certain aspects of the revealed mystery or has expressed them in clearer manner. As a result, these varying theological formulations are often to be considered as complementary rather than as conflicting.”

Pope Paul meets with Patriarch Athenagoras, to promote Catholic-Orthodox reconciliation.

****1965****

Peter Milward, “Shakespeare and Christian Doctrine.” Shakespeare Studies (Shakespeare Society of Japan) (1965-6), expansion of 1960 article.

Robert Hunter, Shakespeare and the Comedy of Forgiveness (Columbia UP): Shakespeare comedies are in tradition of “those early plays of forgiveness ... commonly found among the type known as the Miracles de Notre Dame,” but in Shakespeare the relation of man and God is

secularized into human relations.

James McConica, English Humanists and Reformation Politics Under Henry VIII and Edward VI, on the Catholic humanism of Erasmus, and indigenous English Catholic humanism after 1500; its persistence in reign of Henry VIII, influence on Catherine Parr, and early Cranmer; but radical Protestantism under Edward VI diverged from Erasmianism, a radicalism increased by Protestant Marian exiles like Bale and Foxe who criticized Henry's lukewarm Protestantism; recusant exiles under Mary in turn separated More from Erasmus. Still this Erasmian tradition continued underground into Jewel (!) and Andrewes, and "recalls those secret streams of learning and evangelism which flowed beneath the more obvious landmarks of Reformation debate, which drew their vigour from the writings of Erasmus and his friends, and which coursed through England as through the rest of western Europe in the years of common effort before the disintegration of Christian unity in the west" (book's concluding sentence).

****1966****

Peter Milward, "The Homiletic Tradition in Shakespeare's Plays" (Shakespeare Studies, Japan), on echoes of Persons's Christian Directory, Southwell, Nashe Teares, Catholic bits from sermons of Henry Smith.

Oscar Campbell and Edward Quinn, The Reader's Encyclopedia of Shakespeare: "most authorities reject this idea" "that John Shakespeare's recusancy was a result of his Puritan, not Catholic, sympathies." "It is generally conceded that Shakespeare's father was a Catholic ... and it has recently been discovered that the poet's daughter was listed with a group of recusants in 1607. Stratford itself, in the 16th century, was fairly well divided in the matter of religious preferences." Pope Paul VI and Archbishop Michael Ramsey of Canterbury issue common declaration grateful for new dialogue, set up Anglican-Roman Catholic International Commission (ARCIC) (1966-1981). Their "Common Declaration": "in this city of Rome, from which Saint Augustine was sent by Saint Gregory to England and there founded the cathedral see of Canterbury ... they wish to leave ... all that in the past has been opposed to this precept of charity." They announced their goal of "restoration of complete communion in faith and sacramental life."

****1967****

English version of the Borromeo template-testament found, printed in 1638, which closely follows Malone's text. See John McManaway, "John Shakespeare's 'Spiritual Testament'," Shakespeare Quarterly; cites Malone-Chambers, Thurston's 1923 discovery, Mutschmann, Parker (1955), De Groot. Finds more Spanish edns. of the Borromeo testament; argues that Catholic missionaries brought testament into England. Also announces discovery of the Folger Library English version.

Helen Gardner, King Lear, compares last scene to Pieta (but Mack, 1965, gives slight hint.)

Frances Yates, Giordano Bruno and the Hermetic Tradition, on Bruno's hermetic neo-platonism, and its role in imagining religious reconciliation.

Robert Deming, "Robert Herrick's Classical Ceremony" (ELH), on the mixture of classical and Anglican/Roman Catholic ceremonies and their spiritual importance in which Herrick believed.

Patrick Collinson, The Elizabethan Puritan Movement (U of C Press): "The ideological differences which arose between English Puritanism and what we are almost forced, in spite of the anachronism, to call Anglicanism ... were differences of degree, of theological temperature so to speak, rather than of fundamental principle. 'The hotter sort of protestants are called puritans', explains a Elizabethan pamphleteer" (26-27).

****1968****

David Bevington, Tudor Drama and Politics: "Shakespeare's anticlericalism in no way contradicts his generous attitude toward the old religion." Includes chapter on John Heywood's reconciliatory drama (see 1527) and pages on Lyly.

The Malta Report, joint Anglican-Catholic recommending International Commission to oversee relations, a common declaration of faith, annual joint meetings, etc.

H. Outram Evennett, The Spirit of the Counter-Reformation (Cambridge UP), emphasizing spiritual reform in Catholic 'reformation' as well; notes "the systematization of the meditative form of mental prayer, which was much cultivated in the fifteenth century, in the first instance as a way toward the reform of monastic and clerical life. Thence it was adapted progressively to the requirements of the devout layman, to become eventually, through the agency of the great spiritual masters of the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries -- Ignatius, Scupoli, François de Sales, Bérulle, Vincent de Paul -- one of the cornerstones of the new and reinvigorated spirituality that was gradually diffused, by means of all the new apostolic techniques of the Counter-Reformation, through the whole Catholic Church". In earlier The Cardinal of Lorraine and the Council of Trent

(Cambridge UP, 1930), Evennett distinguished positive and negative elements, i.e. expansion and development, and yet defence of medievalism and counter-attack against revolution in the church (see Jedin, 1946).

****1969****

David Lake, N&Q, discovers that Shakespeare collaborated with Catholic George Wilkins on Pericles.

Peter Milward, "The Religious Dimension of King Lear" (Shakespeare Studies, Japan) (1969-70), comparing Edgar to Southwell's description of hunted priests (see Cecil 1584, Southwell 1591).

Milward, "The Religious Implications of The Merchant of Venice" (English Literature and Language (Eibungaku to Eigogaku)), on the play as a Puritan/Catholic allegory.

Robert Fitch, Shakespeare: The Perspective of Value: not Catholicism, but "Catholic Anglicanism."

Roy Battenhouse, Shakespearean Tragedy: Its Art and Its Christian Premises, praised by Milward for re-introducing Christian ideas into Shakespeare discussion.

Roger B. Manning, Religion and Society in Elizabethan Sussex, early modern study on the local "slow Reformation"

David DeLaura, Hebrew and Hellene in Victorian England: Newman, Arnold, and Pater, on how the Newman tradition continues in the cultural ideas of Arnold and Pater; exemplifying how Catholicism spills into a later secular culture. "No other figure in Arnold's development—not Goethe, not Wordsworth—is so frequently found at the center of Arnold's total humanistic vision." Describes how "the substance of dogmatic Christianity was transformed, within one of two generations, into the fabric of aestheticism" (cited in review, pp. xi-xii? of DeL?). "Arnold and Pater had derived the rationality and the tonality for their ideal of full consciousness ... from the older Oxford, and above all from the works of Newman's as the Idea of a University and the Apologia" (fr. review, p. 343 of DeL?). Arnold said the influence of Newman was "so profound, and so mixed up with all that is most essential to what I do and say, that I can never cease to be conscious of it." (Svaglic notes that Arnold also got his view of disinterestedness from T. Arnold, Sand, Sainte-Beuve; Allott notes Goethe). Arnold's veneration for Newman "is only comparable to Arnold's almost Hamlet-like affection for his dead father."

Kenneth Clark, Civilization: A Personal View, also public TV series; on how institutional Catholic church supported great art. "The wars of religion evoked a figure new to European civilisation, although familiar in the great ages of China: the intellectual recluse. Petrarch and Erasmus had used their brains at the highest level of politics. They had been the advisors of princes. Their successor, the greatest humanist of the mid-sixteenth century, retreated into his tower ... This was Michel de Montaigne."

Flannery O'Connor, Mystery and Manners: Occasional Prose: "In the past, Catholic imagination in this country has been devoted almost exclusively to practical affairs ... now that our existence is no longer in doubt, we are beginning to realize that an impoverishment of the imagination means an impoverishment of the religious life as well." "For the Catholic, one result of the Counter-Reformation was a practical overemphasis on the legal and logical and a consequent neglect of the Church's broader tradition. The need for this emphasis has now diminished, and the Church is busy encouraging those biblical and liturgical revivals which should restore Catholic life to its proper fullness. Nevertheless the scars of this legalistic approach are still upon us." "The opportunities for the potential Catholic writer in the South are so great as to be intimidating ... He lives in the Bible Belt, where belief can be made believable. He has also here a good view of the modern world. A half-hour's ride in this region will take him from places where the life has a distinctively Old Testament flavor to places where the life might be considered post-Christian."

****1970****

Henry Kelly, Divine Providence in the England of Shakespeare's Histories, that Tillyard's Providential Tudor theme does not work in Shakespeare.

Peter Milward, "The Shadow of Henry VIII in Shakespeare's Plays" (English Literature and Language (Eibungaku to Eigogaku)): basis of chapter 9 in 1973 book.

Douglas Hamer attacks Shakeshafte theory (RES), too many Shakeshaftes, bequest unlikely, etc.

Schoenbaum, Shakespeare's Lives, cites 1923 Thurston article and says the Spanish text "confirmed the authenticity" of the template for the original John Shakespeare testament, but "other John Shakespeares lived in Warwickshire ... all conjecture uncertain;" sees Hamer article as "effectively" rebutting the Lancaster theory (but see 1987 below, also 1975, 1977, 1985).

D. Douglas Water, Duessa as Theological Satire, i.e. in the "Mistress Missa" tradition connected

mass with whore of Babylon; parallels knight's physical and spiritual lust (for idols); Cranmer had warned: "Listen not to the false incantations, sweet whisperings, and crafty juggling of the subtle papists, wherewith they have ... bewitched the world."

Pope Paul VI canonizes 40 of the 136 beatified English and Welsh martyrs, a controversial act; prays that the blood of the martyrs would heal the old division. The Pope proclaimed: "on the day when—God willing—the unity of faith and of Christian life is restored, no offense will be inflicted on the honor and sovereignty of a great country such as England. There will be no seeking to lessen the legitimate prestige and the worthy patrimony of the piety and usage proper to the Anglican Church ..." canonized included Mayne, Campion, Walpole, Clitherow, Southwell, Owen, not Garnet.

Terry Eagleton, The Body as Language: Outline of a 'new left' theology. Note Literary Theory (1983): "The liberal humanist response ... is not weak because it believes that literature can be transformative. It is weak because it usually grossly overestimates this transformative power, considers it in isolation from any determining social contexts" (from "Conclusion: Political Criticism").

Charles Trinkaus, In Our Image and Likeness. Humanity and Divinity in Italian Humanist Thought, 2 vols. (1970): how Petrarch, Valla, Poggio, et al attempted integrations of classical and Christian thought, rooted in Augustine, with emphasis on rhetoric and will; contra Burckhardt's split of secular and religious. Major document in the revenge of the medievalists. On "what is possibly the most affirmative view of human nature in the history of thought and expression" (1.xiv), found precedent in the Church Fathers's attempted reconciliation of classical and Christian. "The assertion of an energetic, individualist drive for fulfillment as a major motif of Renaissance culture by Burckhardt thus found its theoretical statement and justification ... in a plea for a renewal of a theology of grace as the acceptance that divine force alone [that] was capable of restricting the naturally egotistical motivations of mankind" (1.xx). Also rely on Augustine's reconciliation of the personal and the Christian structure. "the Epicurean value of pleasure is transfigured into the Christian value of beatitude and fruition and love – all identical in Valla's view. The Stoic value of virtuous abstention becomes truly virtuous ... the product of the divinely infused love of God and neighbour that turns the soul away from inferior pleasure" (1.136). Salutati achieved "a revival of Augustinian theology—a theology of will, and subjectivity and spirituality" (1.147). For "Valla, 'Christianity enkindled the fire of charity in man which was pleasure sublimated into love—love of God, neighbour and self' (1.149). 'This recovery of personal energy, of virtù, in the Renaissance, is rightfully Valla's, although his reconciliation of the all-powerful human will and of charity as the highest form of personal fulfillment and social realization was anticipated by Salutati" (168). Valla's precedents lay "in the humanism of Petrarch and Salutati, in the eroding of the metaphysical and hieratic theology of the thirteenth-century scholastics by their nominalist successors, in the passionate life and theology of St. Augustine" (169). "Among intellectual movements, it seems to me, the humanists first grasped and were stunned by the mightiness of the human forces that surrounded them; and of those which they experienced within themselves" (169). "men ... might take pride ... in their high god-like dignity ... and might find joy in those activities ... fittingly consummated in their ultimate heavenly fruition of their Creator-God in whose image they so insistently repeated they themselves were created" (283). [cites John O'Malley on Viterbo, but not other "Catholic Reformation" classics nor does Wooding, etc. cite Trinkaus]. Geerken's review mentions Pastor in passing. John Geerken review, Journal of the History of Philosophy 12 (1974) calls it a "strained synthesis"; for the humanists that followed, the "heroic option" tended to pull away from the Christian and toward the "secular and Promethean". "In the final analysis ... we must recognize the ontological difference between arête or virtù on the one hand whose emphasis is on pride and pride-like values, and Christian virtue on the other, whose emphasis is on humility and the theological virtues" [Trinkaus may think that this religious humanism an elitist movement that eventually was cancelled out by counter-Reformation Catholicism; he does not seem interested in the topic of "Catholic" vs. "Counter" reformation.] c

Jesus Christ Superstar, rock musical by Andrew Lloyd Webber and Tim Rice, appears first as album, then on Broadway in 1971.

****1971****

Keith Thomas, Religion and the Decline of Magic: on folk connection of magic with Catholic ritual, promoted reexamination of this theme in Europe, parallels to undeveloped world.

ARCIC issues first agreed statement, "Eucharistic Doctrine" (see 1966): "Communion with Christ in the eucharist presupposes his true presence ... We believe that we have reached substantial agreement ..."

John Berryman, "Eleven Addresses to the Lord" in Love and Fame (1971), "Opus Dei" with "Lauds," "Matins," etc. in Delusions (1972).

Craig R. Thompson, "Erasmus and Tudor England" (Actes du Congres Erasme): "In polemics between Anglicans and Roman Catholics during the reign, Erasmus occupied a curious position. The Jesuits would not quite let him go, but to some Anglicans he seemed virtually one of themselves ... We do not yet have the synthesis the subject deserves."

Flannery O'Connor, The Complete Stories (1971). Key stories (previously pub.): "A Good Man is Hard to Find" (1953), "The River" (1953), "The Displaced Person" (1954), "A Temple of the Holy Ghost" (1954), "The Artificial Nigger" (1955), "The Enduring Chill" (1958), "Everything That Rises Must Converge" (1961), "Revelation" (1964), "Parker's Back" (1965).

Godspell, musical by Stephen Schwartz and John-Michael Tebelak, off-broadway.

****1972****

E.R.C Brinkworth, in Shakespeare and the Bawdy Court of Stratford, records show that Susanna, and Hamnet and Judith Sadler were probably church papists.

G. R. Elton, Policy and Police: The Enforcement of the Reformation in the Age of Thomas Cromwel: "The tasks of enforcement, from clarifying the new truths to dealing with irreconcilables ... were pressing, constant and pervasive;" discusses Cromwell's brilliant coordination of "propaganda and enforcement," including "a System of espionage, the most effective England had ever seen;" "depended in the last resort on the willingness, prejudices and private ends of men;" classic work on fast Reformation, imposed from above (Haigh), as in his later Reform and Reformation (1977); "contributed most to my own perception of the contested character of the Tudor Reformation" (Duffy, 2006).

****1973****

Milward's Shakespeare's Religious Background: reviews John Shakespeare recusancy, notes Shakespeare reverence for Catholic things in plays, Catholic schoolmasters, Shakeshafte theory; Hermione echoes Campion defense; notes Persons/Southwell/Hamlet parallels; traces echoes of Geneva Bible and Book of Common Prayer, Smith and Hooker. Chapter 9 parallels Henry VIII/Catherine to Leontes/Hermione, Cymbeline/Imogen, Lear/Cordelia, Othello/Desdemona; "what Hamlet says to Gertrude, Shakespeare ... says to England: 'Let me wring your heart';" interprets Jesuit Valladolid censor (see Frye 1963). Reviews: "Chapter IX, 'Henry VIII and Elizabeth', ... is historical allegorizing of the most irresponsible sort" (RES '75); "The chapter on 'Henry VIII and Elizabeth' is frankly controversial ... deserves further investigation" (Heythrop Jnl '74); "Much less ... will support be readily given to ... chapter ... IX" (Christian Scholar's Review '75); see Vanita, 2000. Milward is first "to recognize how all the 'Lancashire' clues in Shakespeare's biography support one another" (Honigsmann, 1985).

Glynne Wickham, "From Tragedy to Tragi-Comedy: 'King Lear' as Prologue" (Shakespeare Survey): revenge conflicts of Romeo and Hamlet reflect religious wars of the time, while the romances reflect James I's visions of union and peace; Marina, Imogen, etc. reflect Princess Elizabeth coming to court in 1608; and the marriages in the romances reflect the hope that the Princess might marry a Catholic European prince.

N. Tyacke, "Puritanism, Arminianism and counter-revolution" in C. Russell ed. The Origins of the English Civil War: "classic article which first established the undoubted importance of the dominance of English protestant divinity by a Calvinist view of the theology of grace" (Lake, Anglicans and Puritans (1988)).

****1974****

G. R. Elton, Reform and Reformation, England 1509-1558, that the reform succeeded only because of official enforcement (vs. Dickens's view that it succeeded because of popular support), "the first serious non-Catholic or non-Anglo-Catholic historian to present the English Reformation as a major struggle" (Haigh).

Bernard and Margaret Pawley, Rome and Canterbury through Four Centuries (new edn. 1981), classic Anglican review of the relationship: "the Reformation was for the Church of Rome a hardening experience, minimizing the benefit which might have come to her from the Renaissance if such as Erasmus, Colet and More had been allowed to guide her destinies;" "Where the two bodies could have edified each other, there was bigotry and prejudice. Rome had a strong, but sometimes naive sense of the supernatural; contemporary Anglicanism had a neurotic terror of superstition."

****1975****

Schoenbaum, William Shakespeare: A Documentary Life, complete edition, dedicated to McManaway (see 1967), settles for a “secular agnosticism” re. John Shakespeare’s signing of the testament though “the document is genuine;” notes fact of Campion and Persons bringing testament; reviews Stratford Catholic schoolmasters (Hunt, Cottom); William Shakespeare’s own will no argument because “testators, whether Catholic or Protestant, could use the same exordium ... without necessarily regarding it as an avowal of sectarian faith ... Moreover, one may conform outwardly as a matter of convenience, to avoid the law’s importunities;” notes minimal anti-papal rhetoric in King John by contrast with Bale; reviews Shakeshafte theory (“Lancaster had a sufficiency of Shakeshaftes”).

John Bossy, The English Catholic Community: 1570-1850, “in one giant stride drags the history of the Catholic community in England into the forefront of modern historiography” (L. Stone, NY Rev of Books, 2/3/77); but Bossy minimizes importance of continuation of pre-Reformation Catholicism and insists on novelty of the Catholic sect created by Jesuits, etc. A. G. Dickens had earlier distinguished “survivalism” and “seminarism.”

Haigh’s Reformation and Resistance in Tudor Lancashire, on the network of Catholic families in Lancashire, and the thriving of Catholicism there, resisting Protestant encroachment; this continues a series of studies by Haigh on “slow Reformation.”

David Kaula, Shakespeare and the Archpriest Controversy, linking of Shakespeare plays to factional Catholic tracts, but unconvincing because the subjects are so different; still, the verbal parallels are many, and evoke other such studies of echoes in Shakespeare.

Roger Howell, Jr. “The Sidney Circle and the Protestant Cause in Elizabethan Foreign Policy,” Renaissance and Modern Studies: Sidney’s patriotic Protestantism qualified by his attraction to the ecumenical Christian hermetism of Giordano Bruno, a development of neo-Platonic and cabalistic philosophy which, while denying magic, emphasizes elements in the philosophy of Ficino and Mirandola that argued for a religious synthesis in which all Gentile philosophers pointed toward a unified Christian Doctrine.” Also admired Mornay, and others connected with the Pléiade, thus his friendship with Campion, and remark to Greville about joining with Papacy in common cause. His hatred of Spain made him hope that France, and even the Pope, might join in anti-Spanish coalition. Also interested in New world exploration for the faith, like John Dee; and was interested in the Peckham plan for a American colony for Catholics (see 1582).

Leavis, The Living Principle: on Eliot’s “Ash Wednesday,” “Under a juniper-tree...”: “So we have ... the liturgical diction, canorousness and phrasing and the unmistakable invocation of a given Catholic tradition. Such a heuristic poise was of its nature momentary; it couldn’t be maintained for long.”

****1976****

David Kaula, “Autolykus’s Trumpery” (SEL) interesting article, associating Autolykus’s “trumpery” and hallowed trinkets with attack on papist trumpery and tokens, by Harsnet and others, versus Perdita’s true spiritual worth.

Willem Schrickx, “‘Pericles’ in a Book-List of 1619 from the English Jesuit Mission ...” (Shakespeare Survey) on Pericles performed before visiting Catholic ambassadors, item discovered in Continental Saint-Omers Jesuit book-list: “the inclusion of such a play ... lends significant support to ... Hoeniger ... that this drama is a Saints’s play in which Shakespeare emphasizes the themes of patience and redemption.”

David Frey, The First Tetralogy: Shakespeare’s Scrutiny of the Tudor Myth: “Shakespeare challenges the efficacy of divine justice ... by presenting Henry VI, throughout his suffering, as completely good ... by altering, underplaying, or redirecting the few negative aspects of Henry’s behaviour found in the sources, and at the same time emphasizing and strengthening his piety.”

ARCIC statement: “Communion with the see of Rome would bring to the churches of the Anglican Communion not only a wider koinonia but also a strengthening of the power to realize its traditional ideal of diversity in unity. Roman Catholics, on the their side, would be enriched by the presence of a particular tradition of spirituality and scholarship, the lack of which has deprived the Roman Catholic Church of a precious element in the Christian heritage.”

****1977****

Emrys Jones, The Origins of Shakespeare, demonstrates that climactic scenes of Richard III exploit Catholic beliefs about All Soul’s Eve.

Schoenbaum, William Shakespeare: A Compact Documentary Life (see 1970), adds section on Shakeshafte theory ; “I have also profited from ... Milward ... although the latter, a work of special pleading, should be consulted with caution;” in this edn., notes Speed’s coupling of

Persons and Shakespeare (see 1611).

R. Chris Hassel, "Love versus Charity in Love's Labour's Lost" (Shakespeare Survey), noting the Protestant satire of Catholic monasticism but argues that the play confirms "More's and [Gregory] Martin's Catholic belief that erring man needs sacramental means to reach that supernatural selflessness which characterizes charity."

Kathleen Davies, Social History, argues that though Catholic priests considered marriage second best, "their advice on marriage is remarkably similar in tone to that given by Puritan writers," similar advice about equality of regard, sharing of goods, right to follow conscience, mutual involvement, etc.

Archbishop Coggan of Canterbury visits Pope John Paul II, declare they "have come to recognize, to value and to give thanks for a common faith in God our Father ... common baptism ... Apostles' and Nicene Creeds;" "Our call to this [restoration of complete communion in faith and sacramental life] is one with the sublime Christian vocation itself, which is a call to communion."

****1978****

Catholics estimated to be 11% of English population (5% in 1850); more enrolled Catholic church members than in all Protestant churches.

Edward Said, Orientalism; see Franchot, 1994.

****1979****

Barbara Lewalski, Protestant Poetics and the Seventeenth-Century Religious Lyric, emphasizes scriptural Calvinist election-justification-sanctification-scrutiny basis of these lyrics, vs. Martz and White: "emphasis upon the constant scrutiny of personal emotions ... is a primary cause of that introspective intensity." But see R. V. Young, 2000.

Alice-Lyle Scoufos, Shakespeare's Typological Satire: A Study of the Falstaff-Oldcastle Problem. Exhaustive study, showing that S's satire of Cobham is a complex satiric intervention in a long history of the Oldcastle controversy and "two centuries of the Cobham family," Shakespeare siding with Cobham-critics (More, chroniclers, Stow) against his defenders (Tyndale, Bale, Foxe).

Catherine Belsey, "The Case of Hamlet's Conscience" (Studies in Philology): On "not to be": "Opposition to Claudius is treason ... and in plotting against him Hamlet risks his own death ... There is no need to suppose that Hamlet is himself contemplating suicide ... His own problem is the opposition between 'suffering,' 'conscience,' 'thought' on the one hand, and 'opposing,' 'resolution,' 'enterprises of great pitch and moment' on the other" (128), the latter involving the temptation of "wrath."

Mark Gnerro, "Easter Liturgy and the Love Duet in Merchant of Venice V, 1" (ANQ): love duet of Lorenzo and Jessica echoes "This is the night" etc. of Sarum Eastern Liturgy.

Nils Clausson, "English Catholics and Roman Catholicism in Disraeli's Novels" (NCF): "For Disraeli the true hold of the church is best represented by Sybil, who resolves against a conventual life and enters the political world to work with Egremont for the improvement of society." "Only by returning to the ideals of England's past would Victorians solve the problems of the present. Foreign panaceas, whether ultramontane Catholicism or continental liberalism, were not the answer."

Flannery O'Connor, The Habit of Being: Letters: "My mamma asked me the other day if I knew Shakespeare was an Irishman. I said no I didn't. She said well it's right there in the Savannah paper; and sure enough some gent from the University of Chicago had made a speech somewhere saying Shakespeare was an Irishman. I said well it's just him that says it, you better not go around saying it and she said listen SHE didn't care whether he was an Irishman or a Chinaman." "I write the way I do because (not though) I am a Catholic ... However, I am a Catholic peculiarly possessed of the modern consciousness, that thing Jung describes as unhistorical, solitary, and guilty." consciousness* "The priest is right, therefore he can carry the burden of a certain social stupidity. This may be something I learned from Graham Greene." "At some point reading them [Catholic writers, Bloy, Bernanos, Mauriac, Greene] reaches the place of diminishing returns and you get more benefit reading someone like Hemingway, where there is apparently a hunger for a Catholic completeness in life, or Joyce who can't get rid of it no matter what the does." "You know it ["the Sisters at the cancer home"] was founded by Hawthorne's daughter? My evil imagination tells me that this was God's way of rewarding Hawthorne for hating the Transcendentalists." "The Church would as soon canonize a woman as a man and I suppose has done more than any other force in history to free women ..." Misfit on Christ as fulcrum ("thrown everything off balance"): "I'm a Catholic but this is in orthodox Protestantism also,

though out of context -- -which makes it grow into grotesque forms. The Catholic, using his own eyes and the eyes of the Church (when he is inclined to open them) is in a most favorable position to recognize the grotesque” “All these moralists who condemn Lolita give me the creeps. Have you read Lolita yet? I go by the notion that a comic novel has its own criteria.” “The Church’s stand on birth control is the most absolutely spiritual of all her stands and with all of us being materialists at heart, there is little wonder that it causes unease.” “You are right that enjoy is not exactly the right word for our talking about religion. As far as I know, it hurts like nothing else. We are at least together in the pain we share in this terrible division. It’s the Catholic Church who calls you ‘separated brethren,’ she who feels the awful loss” “I don’t think you should write something as long as novel around anything that is not of the gravest concern to you and everybody else and for me this is always the conflict between an attraction for the Holy and the disbelief in it that we breathe in with the air of the times.” “The times do seem a bit apocalyptic for anything so sane [as “Christian humanism”]. “St. Catherine of Genoa said ‘God is my best self,’ by which she realized probably what Jung means but a great deal more.” “One of the effects of modern liberal Protestantism has been gradually to turn religion into poetry and therapy, to make truth vaguer and vaguer and more and more relative, to banish intellectual distinctions, to depend on feeling instead of thought, and gradually to believe that God has no power, that he cannot communicate with us, cannot reveal himself to us, indeed has not done so, and that religion is our own sweet invention;” “Our Catholic mentality is great on paraphrase, logic, formula, instant and correct answers. We judge before we experience and never trust our faith to be subjected to reality because it is not strong enough. And maybe in this we are wise. I think this spirit is changing on account of the council but the change will take a long time to soak through.” “the only difference ... is that if you are a Catholic and have this intensity of belief you join the convent and are heard from no more; whereas if you are Protestant and have it, there is no convent for you to join and you go about in the world getting into all sorts of trouble and drawing the wrath of people who don’t believe anything much at all down on your head. // This is one reason why I can write about Protestant believers better than Catholic believers -- because they express their belief in diverse kinds of dramatic action ... His kind of Christianity may not be socially desirable, but it will be real in the sight of God;” “I am more and more impressed with the amount of Catholicism that fundamentalist Protestants have been able to retain. Theologically our differences with them are on the nature of the Church, nor on the nature of God or our obligation to him.” “I thought it [Küng’s The Council, Reform & Reunion] was wonderful.” [In 1961 review of Küng, O’Connor wrote: “Küng distinguished “the restoration that took place during ... the Council of Trent and a genuine reform which would imply creative growth through a real understanding of the Protestant Reformer’s demands.” “I don’t agree much ... about suffering teaching you much about the redemption. You learn about the redemption simply from listening to what the Church teaches about it and then following this to its logical conclusion.” “The declaration on the Jews and on religious liberty seems to have got sidetracked at the [Vatican] Council. I hope they manage to get it going again.”

Bruce Mansfield, Phoenix of His Age: Interpretations of Erasmus c 1550-1750: “Only when the Europeans drew back from the abyss and attempted a mutual accommodation of the religious differences could the recovery of Erasmus’ reputation begin” (see Mansfield and Erasmus refs. throughout chronology).

1979 cont.

Christopher Haigh, “Some Aspects of the Recent Historiography of the English Reformation” (The Urban Classes, ed. Mommsen): critiques Elton and Dickens (“rapid Reformation from below”), argued for slow Reformation imposed from above. “I called what was coming ‘revisionism’” (Haigh, Historical Research 2004).

****1980****

Peter Milward, “Shakespeare and Elizabethan Exorcism”(English Literature and Language (Eibungaku to Eigogaku)): All’s Well reflecting perhaps Low Countries 1604-5 controversy over miracles of Virgin Mary at Montaigu and Halle.

R. Chris Hassel, Faith and Folly in Shakespeare’s Romantic Comedies: on Love’s Labour’s Lost: “This elusive play and pull of Catholic versus Protestant positions has permeated the play, sometimes favoring one side, sometimes the other, but neither too seriously nor too long ... Such syncretism, such charitable humor is truly a joyful achievement in any disputatious age.”

Louis Montrose, “The Purpose of Playing: Reflections on a Shakespearean Anthropology” (Helios); see Montrose, 1996.

John Chinnici, The English Catholic Enlightenment: John Lingard and the Cisalpine Movement, 1780-1850, on enlightenment reformed devotional tradition, in line with à Kempis, rejuvenated by Lingard and colleagues in these years, see esp. 185ff.

Stephen Greenblatt, Renaissance self-fashioning : from More to Shakespeare: “the simplest observation we can make is that in the sixteenth century there appears to be an increased self-consciousness about the fashioning of human identity as a manipulable, artful process.” On how certain political and religious forces in fact created the illusion of individual autonomy.

****1981****

Haigh, “The Continuity of Catholicism in the English Reformation” (Past and Present), contra Bossy: “the Marian clergy ... initiated lay recusant Catholicism, which was already well established before the mission from the Continent ... If the new priests did not create post-Reformation Catholicism, they were nevertheless essential for its continued existence.”

Laurence Stone, 1981, The Past and the Present Revisited, responding to Elton’s Policy and Police: “the [small] list of executions is ... only the moraine thrown up and drifting on a great invisible glacier of repression and punitive actions, of floggings, tortures, imprisonments, public humiliations, harassments, etc., carried out by lesser authorities all over the country;” “the challenge of Protestantism forced Rome to adopt a rigid and reactionary posture of centralized authoritarianism from which it is only emerging today.”

****1982****

Pope John Paul II makes historically first papal visit to England: “With profound emotion I remember praying together with the Primate of the Anglican Communion at Canterbury Cathedral; in that magnificent edifice I saw ‘an eloquent witness both to our long years of common inheritance and to the sad years of division that followed’;” they prayed together at site of Becket’s martyrdom.

Peter Holmes, Resistance and Compromise: The Political Thought of the Elizabethan Catholics, argues, contra Bossy, for continuity between old and new Catholicism, appellants and Jesuits.

ARCIC Final Report pub.: “the maintenance of visible unity at the universal level includes the episcopate of a universal primate ... Though it is possible to conceive a universal primacy located elsewhere than in the city of Rome, the original witness of Peter and Paul and the continuing exercise of a universal episcopate by the see of Rome present a unique presumption in its favour.”

Vatican Congregation for the Doctrine of the Faith makes interim reaction to final (1981) ARCIC report, critical of much, but: “This work achieved in common is a singular event in the history of the relations between the two Commissions, and is at the same time a notable effort towards reconciliation,” but “does not yet constitute a substantial and explicit agreement on some essential elements of Catholic faith.”

John Wasson, “The Morality Play: Ancestor of Elizabeth Drama?” in The Drama of the Middle Ages, ed. Davidson et al: more than the morality play, the medieval saints’ plays, especially about Becket, were a major influence on the history plays. “More plays on Thomas à Becket were performed than on any other subject except the traditional Christmas and Easter plays.” “Becket plays are historically specific not fabulous.”

Patrick Collinson, The Religion of Protestants: “In so far as this book is contentious, two perceptions are contended for. One concerns the unreservedly protestant character of the Elizabethan and Jacobean religious establishment.” Then by Peter Lake, expressing the “revisionism” of “recent research,” on the “basic protestant consensus” of the Elizabethan period, correcting “views of ‘puritanism’ as an entirely oppositionist force” (in Moderate Puritans and the Elizabethan Church (1982)). Relate this “revisionism” to the revisionism of Haigh and Duffy.

At a Lutheran church, Pope John Paul II: “We believe, in the year of the remembrance of the birthday of Martin Luther five centuries ago, that we see as if in a distance the dawning of the advent of a reconstruction of our unit and community. This unity is a fruit of the daily renewal, conversion, and penitence of all Christians.”

****1984****

D. Thomas and N. Evans, “John Shakespeare in the Exchequer” (SQ) reveals that John Shakespeare was rich all along, and so debt excuses must have been a cover.

John L. Murphy, Darkness and Devils: Exorcism and King Lear: on Shakespeare’s Catholic incorporation of Harsnett’s vocabulary, reflecting Catholic life driven into darkness and devils; discusses Pericles and King Lear in papist repertoire of recusant players; exorcists were connected with Babington conspiracy, thus religion not disassociated from politics. “Shakespeare accepts the weight of Harsnett’s attack as being, in a sense, justified, and yet writes King Lear in part as an answer.”

Roland Frye, The Renaissance Hamlet: Hamlet's conflict reflects the agonizing Catholic conflicts over loyalty to Pope (with his assassination plots) and Queen.

Uncein Tamayo and Luis Alberto, "La tumba misteriosa de Shakespeare" (Boletín de la Acad. Nacional de la Historia (Venezuela): curse on Shakespeare's tomb may protect proof that he was Catholic (article summarized in SQ bibliography for 1987).

Charles Nicholl, A Cup of News: The Life of Thomas Nashe: "Time and again, Nashe's satirical stance has a Catholic tinge -- the denunciations of Leicester and Raleigh, drawing on Parsons' Catholic invectives; the oblique celebrations of the Catholic Howard family; the involvement with Strange and Southampton, with Marlowe and Watson; the appearance of Marie Magdalenes Love and Jesus Psalter during his association with [publisher] Danter; the endless abuse of Puritanism, which won him the suspicion of Puritan officials like Beale and the applause of Catholic poets like Campion."

Kevin L. Morris, The Image of the Middle Ages in Romantic and Victorian Literature: on the "genuinely religious" dimension of "religious medievalism." "The cuckoo's egg of religious medievalism [was] . . . laid in the nest of romanticism," thus straining away from romantic faith in progress and individualism; protestantism seen as gateway to rationalism and enlightenment. Morris cd. have benefited from many recent syncretic synthesizers as ... Frye ... Bloom, ... Hartman ... Wasserman, and ... De Man (Pattern, rev., AHR 1986).

Tillich, The Protestant Era: "The decrease in sacramental thinking and feeling in the churches of the Reformation and in the American denominations is appalling. Nature has lost its religious meaning and is excluded from participation in the power of salvation ... The Protestant protest has rightly destroyed the magical elements in Catholic sacramentalism but has wrongly brought to the verge of disappearance the sacramental foundation of Christianity." Tillich popularized distinction between Catholic spiritual embodiment, and Protestant critical principle protesting such embodiment. "Christianity, he held, is essentially constituted by a Catholic substance and Protestant principle, each needing the other as its own counterpoint": Tillich's distinction has "had an enormous influence on authors of many traditions" (But, distinction tends to make Protestantism too negative a principle, and to deny criticalness to Catholicism--Dulles). "Lutherans of our day, such as Jaroslav Pelikan ... continue to warn that the Protestant principle is needed to prevent Catholicism from becoming ossified, magical, demonic, and idolatrous" (these last quotes, from Dulles, Catholicity 1985).

J. J. Scarisbrick, The Reformation and the English People, famous for its epigrammatic opening, "on the whole, English men and women did not want the Reformation and most of them were slow to accept it when it came;" "the English Reformation came primarily from 'above' ... rather than from a groundswell of popular discontent and resentment toward the old religion."

Yves Congar, Diversity and Communion: "Even if one could point out some hitches, we would have to say that the Catholic church has ceased to see and above all to commend union purely in terms of 'return' or conversion to itself."

Recent_Scholarship

****1985****

Ernst Honigmann, Shakespeare: the 'lost years' (Manchester UP): on Lancaster years (does not acknowledge Stevenson (1958)); shows Cottom was Hoghton associate, clinches links with Heskeths and Thomas Savage; reviews plays's esteem for old religion; answers Douglas Hamer's 1970 attack on "Shakeshafte" theory. D. Kastan: "I remain unpersuaded that Shakespeare was a Catholic, though for a provocative argument making a case for a "Catholic Shakespeare," see ... Honigmann" (Shakespeare After Theory).

Schoenbaum review of Honigmann (TLS): "I touched upon this [Shakeshafte/Lancaster] history ... I must confess, dismissively -- in my Compact Documentary Life (1977). Now Honigmann ... makes us uneasy about previous confident appraisals."

Gary Taylor, "The Fortunes of Oldcastle" (Shakespeare Survey), summarizes strength of Catholic case, emphasizes Shakespeare's Catholic profile, in satire of Protestant Oldcastle, family background, Purgatory of Hamlet, mockery of Puritans in the plays, performances for recusant

households, etc.

Patrick Collinson, "The Church: Religion and its Manifestations," in William Shakespeare: His World, ed. John F. Andrews, on John Shakespeare as unreconstructed old Catholic (agrees with De Groot on John Shakespeare's Catholic recusancy and the Catholic Ardens), on Shakespeare's early Catholic influences, agrees with Milward and Schoenbaum on the John Shakespeare testament, makes no conclusions about Shakespeare himself; rept. and slightly revised in 1994, as "William Shakespeare's Religious Inheritance," in Elizabethan Essays.

Greenblatt's "Shakespeare and the Exorcists," in Shakespeare and the Question of Theory ed. Parker and Hartman: Greenblatt argues that King Lear is a post-Christian defense of the play's theatricality as doing what religion, used by exorcists, used to do; but at least Greenblatt joins Murphy, whom he acknowledges, in agreeing that Shakespeare intends to subvert Harsnett; indeed, Greenblatt concedes the "possibility" of the play being "an allegory in which Catholicism is revealed to be the persecuted, legitimate elder brother forced to defend himself by means of theatrical illusions against the cold persecution of his skeptical bastard brother Protestantism," and that recusant households saw the play as "strangely sympathetic even, to the situation for persecuted Catholics."

Avery Dulles, The Catholicity of the Church: "Never since the Reformation has there been such readiness on the part of Protestants, Anglicans, and Orthodox to acknowledge the value of the papacy as a bond of unity." "In a reunited Church the catholic elements of all the uniting churches would be included, not destroyed."

1985 cont.

Robert Bellah, et al, Habits of the Heart: Individualism and Commitment in American Life (University of California): "We thus face a profound impasse. Modern individualism seems to be producing a way of life that is neither individually nor socially viable, yet a return to traditional forms would be to return to intolerable discrimination and oppression. The question, then, is whether the older civic and biblical traditions have the capacity to reformulate themselves while simultaneously remaining faithful to their own deepest insights;" had traced individualism out of the Reformation via Locke. "Our ontological individualism finds it hard to comprehend the social realism of the church -- the idea that the church is prior to individuals and not just the product of them."

1986

C. L. Barber, and R. P. Wheeler, The Whole Journey: Shakespeare's Power of Development: "It is almost certain that John Shakespeare had Catholic sympathies, at least briefly," cites the Borromeo testament; "his tragedies dramatize the post-Christian situation ... but without God and the Holy Family, with only the human family."

Paul Scott Stanfield, "Yeats and Irish Catholicism" (Greyfriars).

1987

Schoenbaum, William Shakespeare: A Compact Documentary Life, revised edn. with new postscript (see 1970), expands remarks on Shakeshafte "taking into account ... Honigsmann ... which has stirred considerable interest;" notes that Honigsmann effectively demolished much of Hamer's argument though the Lancaster theory is "not ... the most plausible of scenarios;" notes that John Shakespeare's partner, Edward Grant, was a Catholic landowner to whose home recusants resorted; and Grant's nephew John Somerville plotted against Queen, and grandson would be implicated in Gunpowder Plot. Shakespeare would have been no more than fifteen or sixteen in Lancaster, but "there is precedent for such precocity;" notes David George's discovery that Hesketh inventory shows he did receive instruments; "play-clothes" suggests actors, not musicians.

Brownlow connects Southwell's bird in cage speech from Epistle of Comfort to Lear (KM 80: A Birthday Album for Kenneth Muir).

Arthur McGee, The Elizabethan Hamlet, sees ghost as demonic, and Hamlet as "Every-Catholic who was ipsa facto a follower of Satan;" but notes various Catholic resonances; quotes 1876 Elliot Browne that "Bernardo Bandini and Francesco de' Pazzi were the assassins of Giulano de' Medici in the cathedral of Florence;" Wittenberg evoked Faustus rather than Luther who did not much interest English Calvinists; the "matins" had disappeared as part of church ritual by 1552; Ophelia singing "old lauds" in Q2, Lauds also gone by 1552; driving soul to hell part of medieval Italian revenge; poison traditional means of Italian vengeance; many associations of Ophelia with nun (her holding a book, like Annunciation pictures); "rose of May" parallels Virgin as "Mystical Rose," "Flower of May;" requiem refused Ophelia is Catholic since the "prayer Book makes no provision for a requiem mass" (R. Noble); her flowers like nun's wedding garment, and her

farewell with a Catholic blessing; buttercup symbolizes chalice, and daisy was symbol of humility of nuns, nettle used penitentially, her coronet weeds like crown of thorns, clothed with flowers like a nun at her profession; Laertes "cut his throat i' the church" evoke assassins of Becket.

1987 cont.

Christopher Haigh, The English Reformation Revised: "The long-term causes of the Reformation -- the corruption of the Church and the hostility of the laity -- appear to have been historical illusions;" instant obedience by the parishes caused by "local recognition of the power and prestige of the monarchy ... Cromwell instituted, if not a reign of terror, at least a reign of nervousness;" "'Anti-clericalism'... was not a cause of the Reformation; it was a result;" "the imposition of the Reformation by installments implies, as Professor Scarisbrick has noted, that the Tudor State had a formidable coercive capability;" "But the Reformation ... needed some enthusiastic proponents;" "The Reformation had created not a united Protestant England but a deeply divided England" (last sentence). "The revisionist position takes its name, I suppose, from ... The Reformation Revised" (Duffy, Ren Qu 2006).

Margo Todd, Christian Humanism and the Puritan Social Order, acknowledging McConica's work (1965), sees Catholic Erasmian humanism continuing in the social welfare emphasis of the Puritans. (About their religious doctrines like human depravity, Puritans "would either ignore the contradiction ... or add it to the other theological paradoxes with which they lived.") Catholic humanist emphasis on marriage as a state of intellectual and spiritual companionship, as in Erasmus and Juan Vives, Mary Tudor's tutor, influenced the Puritans: "There is no evidence that protestants in the sixteenth century were saying anything about women and their role in the household which Catholic humanists had not already said;" cites Davies, 1977, with qualification. "The protestant emphasis on conscience was actually one aspect of Erasmian social ideology, a "'grass roots' approach to the problem of order in the commonwealth." Laud's Anglicanism and Tridentine Catholicism rejected these social reform ideals.

1988

Patrick Collinson, The Birthpangs of Protestant England: begins "If I were to be asked when Protestant England was born I would answer ... after the accession of Elizabeth I, some considerable time after." "Collinson has been responsible for a work of revision every bit as momentous as the revisions I have been describing," i.e. on Puritanism as "a far from marginal minority, the advance-guard of mainstream Protestantism" (Duffy, 2006).

Richard Finn OP, "The Value of Literature:--Shakespeare and the Tudor Homilies," (New Blackfriars): Shakespeare uses phrases from the Homilies, in a parodic way, to undercut the politicized use of such religious phrases in Elizabethan England, undoing Tudor propaganda, on the lines of Southwell's accusation of "heretics ... who change the faith of God's Church into the fables of their own fantasy and seek to set forth their follies with the authority of God's word, wrested by their perverse spirits against its true meaning." "What is taught is a certain scepticism of the black-and-white categories that the Homilist employed and enjoined." The use of anti-Catholic rhetoric in Margaret's condemnation of Henry VI's "Ave-Maries" is an example.

1989

F. W. Brownlow, "John Shakespeare's Recusancy" (Shakespeare Quarterly).

Robert Whiting, The Blind Devotion of the People: Popular Religion and the English Reformation, on slowly attenuating Catholicism in Devon/Cornwall, brought about by government force, financial inducement, etc., general decline of religious sense: thus middle way between Dickens/Elton and Haigh/Scarisbrick emphases.

Susan Brigden, London and the Reformation: "Though many hated the changes, the great majority silently repined ... The world of shared faith was broken by the Reformation and the Christian community divided" (last sentence).

Lambeth Conference Resolution: "Recognizes the Agreed Statement of ARCIC 1 on Eucharistic Doctrine, Ministry and Ordination, and their Elucidations, as consonant in substance with the faith of Anglicans and believes that this agreement offers a sufficient basis for taking the next step forward toward the reconciliation of our Churches grounded in agreement in faith."

W. S. F. Pickering, Anglo-Catholicism: A Study in Religious Ambiguity, on the distinction between High churchman, Tractarian, Anglo-Catholic.

C. L. Barber and R. Wheeler, "Shakespeare in the Rising Middle Class," in Shakespeare's Personality, ed. Holland: on Henry VI, "Conceivably the connection between Henry's weakness and his gullible piety is partly shaped by recollections of John Shakespeare's Catholic profession of faith."

1989 cont.

Richard Dutton, William Shakespeare: A Literary Life: "the most persistent piece of speculation

about his early years notes the possibility that he was brought up a Roman Catholic;" "but ... nothing of the struggle ... presumably registers in a discernible way in the poems and plays."

R. Waddington, "Lutheran Hamlet" (ELN), on parallels to Luther's character.

Louise Clubb, Italian Drama in Shakespeare's Time: Shakespeare influenced by the Nova Comedia, or commedia grave, which opposed fate (and Calvinist predestination) with Counter-Reformation emphasis on Providence and free will, with the "idea of a peripety that is not merely another turn of fortune's wheel but the revelation and unexpected result of a plan for human happiness made by a power greater than luck." The Italian "figure of the woman as wonder" reflected in Helena; Isabella illustrates free will and choice; tragedia sacra, on saints's lives, were seen by audience as representing Reformation issues, i.e. Elias and Jezebel representing papacy and Reform forces.

Eric Griffiths, The Printed Voice of Victorian Poetry, chapter 4, "Hopkins: the Perfection of Habit," on Newman and Hopkins's deformation of language to convey an alien Catholic idiom in a Protestant culture: "For writers such as Newman and Hopkins, the reciprocal adjustments of sociable locution and liturgical forms make up a central part of learning to live as English Catholics rather than as Anglo-Catholics. Know ways of speaking linguistics habits, had to be faced, and turned in a new direction ... but equally, the unfamiliar language of Catholicism had to be seen and heard as truly an English speech, not as something untenably alien, if the convert's voice was to be persuasive to the as yet unconverted; converted eloquence had also to be the perfection of habit."

Erica Veevers, Images of Love and Religion: Queen Henrietta Maria and court entertainments, on the use of masques by Queen Henrietta to promote religious union.

****1990****

Milward, "Thomas More and William Shakespeare" (Shakespeare Yearbook): "all his plays ... constitute a crescendo of allegorical lament over the departure of Catholic 'merry' England ... in the last plays the dramatists look to an ideal reconciliation."

Debora Shuger, Habits of Thought in the English Renaissance (UCBerkeley): mature book on the internal complications of Protestant theology; move to inwardness secularizes history and the socio-political, though the king is divinized; thus Herbert, inwardness versus emptied out social world.

****1991****

Katherine Duncan-Jones, Sir Philip Sidney: Courtier Poet (Yale UP): on Sidney's continuing associations with Campion, especially in Prague in 1577, and lingering loyalty and self-division about his Catholic friends; Philanax's harsh prosecution in penultimate scene of Old Arcadia may reflect racking of Campion; argument later developed in Duncan-Jones's "Sir Philip Sidney's Debt to Edmund Campion" (Reckoned Expense, ed. McCoog, 1996), which notes turn in Fourth Act of Arcadia toward themes of political chaos, grief, confusion; then in fifth book, Arcadia, previously a ideal place, becomes place of "dangerous division of men's minds" and "ruinous renting of all estates;" then prosecutor Euarchus condemns his own son and nephew to death, after perfunctory evidence of intended regicide of which the princes, accused of disguise and deception, are most probably innocent; Philanax like Campion's persecutors (noted in 1947-9 by K. T. Rowe); at end, only miraculous recovery of supposedly dead Duke, Basilius, leads to happy ending. Duncan-Jones also discusses Sidney's relation to the Gilbert expedition (see 1582).

Ted Hughes, introd., The Essential Shakespeare: Shakespeare's mythos "incorporates the violently deadlocked forces of the Reformation in England ... The clairvoyant depth of Shakespeare's involvement in the national trauma can be estimated from two of his dominant themes: the horror of civil war, and the figure of the regicide who rules as a doomed tyrant ... To understand the 'fury', then, of Shakespeare's works, this lost world of religious war, internalized and expressed in dramatic fictions, has to be taken into account ... Prospero is ... an exemplary Occult Neoplatonist," i.e. who "promised to resolve the Catholic/Protestant quarrel in a union of love."

Peter Milward, "The Morean Counsellor in Shakespeare's Last Plays" (Moreana), More as model for Camillo, Gonzalo and his "utopia."

Thomas M. Greene, "Ritual and Text in the Renaissance" (Canadian Review of Comparative Literature), on the growing self-consciousness and emptiness and nostalgia (and perhaps creative recovery) associated with ceremony, illustrated in Henry V's "And what art thou, thou Idoll Ceremonie?"

Huston Diehl, "Observing the Lord's Supper and the Lord Chamberlain's Men: The Visual

Rhetoric of Ritual and Play in Early Modern England" (Renaissance Drama): on how "the institution of the Protestant Lord's Supper might have shaped -- in a constructive way -- the new drama and its audiences;"; thus theatre-goers "must recognize ... that what they see is representation, and not the literal presence of what is represented." Anti-Montrose.

Official Roman Catholic Response to ARCIC: "it constitutes a significant milestone ... however ... it is not yet possible to state that substantial agreement has been reached."

****1992****

Ted Hughes, Shakespeare and the Goddess of Complete Being, relying on Milward, argues the importance of Shakespeare's Catholic roots: Shakespeare "committed to Catholicism with an instinct that amounted to fanatic heroism ... his whole career can be seen as Shakespeare's record of the suffering of the Goddess, and his heroic, lifelong patient attempt to rescue the Female;" his mind encompassed both;" "the Goddess suffering, and the Puritan that makes her suffer but destroys himself in the process."

Tom Paulin, review of Hughes: cites Hughes's "way of shouldering England's history as a burden of desperate Protestant guilt," believes Shakespeare "was a deep, secret, committed Catholic," sees England haunted by "a buried national neurosis ... that is the result of ... the Reformation;" Lucrece about Protestant rape of a religion, Venus and Adonis about Puritan rejection of the Catholic goddess; "an enabling interpretation of Shakespeare which hopefully will inspire scholars to apply it;" "Taken together Hughes and Milward promise a welcome counter-reformation in Shakespeare studies."

Donna Hamilton, Shakespeare and the Politics of Protestant England: in the Abbess at the end of Comedy of Errors Shakespeare appeals to concept of broad universal church (i.e. in Anglican sense) which takes everyone in, and critiques condemnatory Elizabeth who would condemn nonconformists. In Cymbeline, Belarius, the conflicted subject who finally comes forward and supports the king, is the English Catholic who fights for king, and also surrenders back his sons, i.e. supports the succession by James's heirs. In return Catholics hoped James would tolerate their connection with Rome.

Bruce W. Young, "Ritual as an Instrument of Grace: Parental Blessings in Richard III, All's Well That Ends Well, and The Winter's Tale," in True Rites and Maimed Rites, ed. Woodridge and Berry: frequency of such parental blessings, increasingly associated with popery, in the plays.

Richard Helgerson, Forms of Nationhood: The Elizabethan Writing of England: "An important move [for relating Shakespeare to his contemporaries] was Helgerson's analysis of the institutions by means of which England fashioned a national identity, a thematized organizational structure that placed Shakespeare both within and in relationship to the larger building blocks -- law, church, theatre, epic, cartography -- of English culture" (Hamilton, "Shakespeare and Religion," 1999). Helgerson emphasizes the land a alternative source of national identity; thus nature poetry could be subversive, anti-royal.

Patricia Finney, Firedrake's Eye (novel), with empathy for the old Catholicism, via the narrator Tom O'Bedlam, and its consistency with English patriotism; suggests that Sidney was involved, unclear how wittingly, in the assassination plot against Elizabeth.

1992 cont.

Eamon Duffy's The Stripping of the Altars : Traditional Religion in England, classic work in revisionist Reformation history.

Charles Nicholl, The Reckoning: The Murder of Christopher Marlowe, on the network of Catholic anti-agents and turncoats, probably including Marlowe.

David Bevington, "Lyly's Endymion and Midas: The Catholic Question in England" (Comparative Drama): on political allegory in these plays (see 1591): "Reformation issues are fully engaged." "By the climactic theatrical gesture of Cynthia's kiss, Lyly implicitly urges Elizabeth to recognize the essential goodness of loyal English Catholics like Oxford and to forgive their indiscreet attachment to the Catholic faith." In tradition of such interpretations of Endymion, see Bond 1902, Bevington 1968. Also see Bevington, ed., Endymion (1996): "I now wish to argue that Lyly's play also enfold in itself a particular issue of great moment in 1587-88," i.e. Oxford's possible support for Mary Queen of Scots. If the play followed her execution, "the difference between fact and fiction [i.e. Cynthia pardoning Tellus] may be little more than idealization of what Elizabeth clung to emotionally after acceding to the hard realities of international politics."

Paul Giles, American Catholic Arts and Fictions: on Catholicism as "ideological force" in American literature, a "residual cultural determinant and one aspect of the social context,"

whether concealed or explicit, emphasizing the communal and material against individual autonomy and isolation. Discusses Dresier, Fitzgerald, John Ford, Scorsese, etc., etc.

Linda Colley, Britons: Forging the Nation 1707-1837: "The absolute centrality of Protestantism to British religious experience in the 1700s and long after is so obvious that it has proved easy to pass over. Always reluctant to be seen to be addressing the obvious, historians have preferred to concentrate on the more subtle divisions that existed within the Protestant community itself;" "many ordinary Britons who signed anti-Catholicism petitions in 1828-9 saw themselves, quite consciously, as being part of a native tradition of resistance to Catholicism which stretched back for centuries and which seemed, indeed, to be timeless." Emancipation-era pamphlets "show just how recent -- and just how precarious -- the Protestant Reformation still seemed to many of its poorer British champions."

Bruce Mansfield, Man on His Own: Interpretations of Erasmus c 1750-1920: Erasmus now (1992) "appears as a Catholic Christian but, more broadly, as a figure ecumenical, devout, theological."

Richard Rodriguez, Days of Obligation: An Argument with my Mexican Father: on the conflict between Southern Spanish Catholicism and northern individualist Protestantism: "I am lonely. I tell you I see the disintegration of Catholicism in America and I tell you the Catholic Church does not attend to the paradox of American Catholic lives. We confess a communal faith; we live in an individualistic culture."

****1993****

Ian Wilson's Shakespeare: The Evidence, full review, with some additions, of Catholic evidence: "not originally intended" but encouraged by "discovery ... of pioneering and little-known studies by ... Bowden ... Devlin ... Milward and ... Thurston;" but doesn't believe Shakeshafte theory; valuable on Lord Strange and Southampton connections.

F. W. Brownlow, Shakespeare, Harsnett, and the Devils of Denham, that Shakespeare tried to counter Harsnett's inventive energy, use seriously his images of human suffering, initiate audience into realities signified by signs of possession, and defend his friends and relations; fills in network of Shakespeare relations: Robert Dibdale from Stratford recusant family, his sister Agnes witnessed Richard Hathaway's will which left money to Anne Hathaway, Dibdale and Simon Hunt probably associated; at Douay Dibdale met Thomas Cottom (executed with Campion and attacked by Harsnett), younger brother of John Cottom, Shakespeare's teacher; Harsnett also attacked Edward Arden, a distant cousin of Shakespeare.

Daniel Wright, The Anglican Shakespeare.

Paul Voss, "The Antifraternal Tradition in English Renaissance Drama," i.e. only Shakespeare deviates from the tradition.

Alexandra Walsham, Church Papists: Catholicism, Conformity and Confessional in Early Modern England: cryptic Catholics often obtained burial in Anglican consecrated ground.

Francis Edwards, S.J., "Still Investigating the Gunpowder Plot" (Recusant History): "By 1605 it had been evident for some time that any use of force to get toleration for English Catholics was out of the question. ... The only hope for the persecuted, as all from the pope downwards realized, was that James's government might be persuaded to make some voluntary concession in the direction of liberty of conscience. So it might have, had not the State been directed by Robert Cecil. With the complete logic of his position he saw this not as a time for conciliation, still less reconciliation, but for delivering the final coup de grace to the longstanding enemy within." "Robert Cecil took a long chance in organizing the 'gunpowder plot' and even perhaps even now there is room for doubt if he did so; but by this time, even his most ardent admirers and defenders must surely admit an element of doubt in their own position."

Edwin Fussell, The Catholic Side of Henry James (Cambridge UP): on among other things, "The Catholic Ménage as Literary Space;" on Turn of Screw's implicit horror at Catholic other; "The Ambassadors features nice tolerant easygoing nondoctrinal Strether vis-à-vis nice tolerant easygoing nondoctrinal Madame de Vionnet, two different kinds of church-goer, equally yet differently civilized" (150); also how The Golden Bowl attempts a "reconciliation" of "the Catholic-Protestant and American-European antitheses."

Christopher Haigh, English Reformations, classic in revisionist history, seeing Reformation as "an act of state;" the last years of the sixteenth century created "a Protestant nation, but not a nation of Protestants."

John O'Malley, The First Jesuits, on the Jesuits's complex of integration of Erasmian humanism

with Catholicism and *devotio moderna*.

1993 Karen Armstrong, History of God, on the Reformation: "Great reformers gave voice to this disquiet and discovered new ways of considering God and salvation. This split Europe into two warring camps—Catholic and Protestant—which have never entirely lost their hatred and suspicion of one another." 257

Aidan Nichols, The Panther and the Hind: A Theological History of Anglicanism, proposes an "Anglican Uniate Church," "united with Rome but not absorbed."

Margaret Aston, "The Northern Renaissance," in Faith and Fire: Popular and Unpopular Religion 1350-1600: on the early sixteenth humanist Catholic network of Erasmus, Colet (influenced by Ficino and Mirandola), More, Lefèvre, the Brothers of the Common Life (*Devotio Moderna*), Grocyn, Linacre: "it is impossible to assess the achievement of the Northern Renaissance because it was overtaken at a critical moment by another more impetuous movement ... The delicate, easily, altered balance between the scholarly and the evangelical was pushed down hard on the evangelical side ... The whole Lutheran affair appeared to him [Erasmus] a tragedy which had sprung from 'hatred of liberal studies' and threatened the ruin of such work."

****1994****

Gary Taylor, in "Forms of Opposition" (English Literary Renaissance) comprehensively assembles the evidence arguing for Shakespeare's Catholicism.

J. Hope confirms Cyrus Hoy's argument for Fletcher's hand in Henry VIII.

Ronald Hutton, The Rise and Fall of Merry England. The Ritual Year 1400-1700 (Oxford): "as during the early years of Edward, the actions of the [Elizabethan] regime were considerably less moderate than its words ... the impact ... upon ritual was very swift, apparently sweeping away that of the former Church even faster than Edward's measures had done."

Peter Milward, "Tudor Drama and the Reformation" (Renaissance Bulletin), on the plays favoring Catholicism; Hamlet's "anguish ... may well be seen in the contemporary anguish of Elizabethan Catholics;" final romances show "interesting movement ... to an ideal of reconciliation and reunion, such as King James himself professedly aimed at."

K. Abraham, "Notes on the Phantom: A Complement to Freud's Metapsychology" and "The Phantom of Hamlet" (1975), in The Shell and the Kernel by Abraham and Maria Torok, trans. N. Rand (orig. 1987): "It is the children's or descendants' lot to objectify these buried tombs through diverse species of ghosts. What comes back to haunt are the tombs of others. The phantoms of folklore merely objectify a metaphor active in the unconscious: the burial of an unspeakable fact within the love-object ... It [the phantom] passes -- in a way yet to be determined -- from the parent's unconscious into the child's ... The special difficulty of these analyses lies in the patient's horror at violating a parent's or a family's guarded secret, even though the secret's text and context are inscribed within the patient's own unconscious." King Hamlet's ghost secret is "merely a subterfuge. It masks another secret ... resulting from an infamy which the father, unbeknown to his son, has on his conscience;" "Hamlet's fits of indecision tussle with both a fallacious 'truth' forced upon him and a 'true' truth his unconscious has long since guessed."

Daniel Westberg, "Thomistic Law and the Moral Theory of Richard Hooker" (American Catholic Philosophical Quarterly), that Hooker's Protestant emphasis on law and voluntaristic obedience, differs from Aquinas's philosophy of virtue and attraction of the good.

Jenny Franchot, Roads to Rome: The Antebellum Protestant Encounter with Catholicism; on Catholicism in American Protestantism, as self-defined by its horror of and fascination with Catholicism; note 2: "My investigation of what Catholicism meant to the antebellum Protestant imagination is indebted to ... Said's Orientalism;" on how orientalism constitutes "a certain will or intention to understand, in some cases to control, manipulate, and even to incorporate, what is a manifestly different (or alternative and novel) world." First sentence: "This book argues that anti-Catholicism operated as an imaginative category of discourse through which antebellum American writers of popular and elite fictional and historical texts indirectly voiced the tensions and limitations of mainstream Protestant culture." Franchot's theme will be applied to Britain in Susan Griffin's Anti-Catholicism and Nineteenth-Century Fiction (Cambridge UP, 2004).

Annabel Patterson, Reading Holinshed's Chronicles (U. of Chicago): on the diverse religious allegiances of the writers (which included Catholic-leaning Stanyhurst and Stow) against the monovocal Tudor mythology; the book implicitly defends multivocality and liberty of conscience, verbatim documents, anti-censorship.

Lisa Hopkins, John Ford's Political Theatre (Manchester UP), on Ford's Catholic connections and

sympathies (but see Wymer review, 1998).

1994 cont.

Pope John Paul II, Crossing the Threshold of Hope: "divisions ... to a great degree result from the idea that one can have a monopoly of truth;" "over the centuries contact with different political and cultural climates ... led believers to interpret Christ's message with varying emphases. Nevertheless, these different approaches to understanding and living out one's faith in Christ can, in certain cases, be complementary." "I will never forget the statement I heard during an ecumenical gathering with ... the Protestant community in Cameroon: 'We know we are divided, but we do not know why'." "The road to unity ... is a process ... It is necessary, therefore, to rid ourselves of stereotypes." "Could it not be that these divisions have also been a path continually leading the Church to discover the untold wealth contained in Christ's Gospel ... It is necessary for humanity to achieve unity through plurality, to learn to come together in the one Church, while presenting a plurality of ways of thinking and acting, of cultures and civilizations" (author's italics).

****1995****

Eric Sams, The Real Shakespeare, on John Shakespeare's Catholic recusancy, his testament, the Lancashire connection, the Lucy issue; suggests that Hamlet's ghost quotes come from John Shakespeare's testament.

Katharine Maus, Inwardness and Theater in the English Renaissance: the distinction between interior and exterior, so common later, was highlighted as though a novel thing, "an almost inevitable result of religious oppression;" cites Holinshed story of Friar Forrest swearing to Henry VIII's supremacy: "he answered that he took his oath with his outward man, but his inward man never consenteth thereto;" thus the need for equivocation; provoking an "unprecedented domestic espionage system" under Walsingham. "For the English Renaissance ... spectacle depends upon, sometimes betrays, but never fully manifests a truth that remains shrouded, indiscernible, or ambiguous;" theater is "a form of display that flaunts the limits of display."

David Beauregard, Virtue's Own Feature: Shakespeare and the Virtue Ethics Tradition, on Shakespeare using Aristotle and Aquinas as basis for his characterizations of passion, virtue, and vice, "sheds no light on his personal religious affiliation," but see Westberg 1994.

S. M. Buhler, "'By the Mass, our hearts are in trim': Catholicism and British Identity in Olivier's Henry V" (Cahiers Elizabethains), on Olivier promoting a synthesis of British patriotism and Catholic liturgy in his script (somewhat reduced in film), reflecting his belief in intersection of sacramental and theatrical.

C. Richard Desper, "Allusions to Edmund Campion in Twelfth Night" (Elizabethan Review), discusses Feste allusions to old hermit of Prague (see 1991, Sidney), etc.

David Remnick, "Hamlet in Hollywood," New Yorker Nov. 20, on the dispute between scholar Mary Ann McGrail and Hollywood producer Steve Sohmer, over legal ownership of their theory that Hamlet encodes an allegory of Lutheranism against Henry VIII's Catholicizing tendencies, reflecting Foxes's account of Luther (McGrail), thus "hide Fox," St Bernard -- Barnardo -- who is guarding the church?, some sort of communion at end, gravedigger as bible-reader, "reform it all together" (theater as surrogate for church).

De Groot's book reissued with Stanley Jaki postscript.

1995 cont.

Anthony Milton, Catholic and Reformed: The Roman and Protestant Churches in English Protestant Thought 1600-1640 (Cambridge): shows convergence of Roman and Anglican doctrines in the Laudian years, and the search for reconciliation. "The removal of the identification of the pope as Antichrist ... allowed Laudians to accept Rome as an erring but basically equal institutional church." "It has often been suggested by historians that the descriptions by Andrewes, Laud and others of their church as being essentially 'Catholic and Reformed', rather than merely Protestant, marked a distinctive strain of 'Anglican' thought within the Church of England."

Margo Todd, intro. Reformation to Revolution: "the focus now is on the vast majority of the religious population occupying the middle of the road, struggling to cope both with changes imposed from above and with the demands of the radical reformers on the one hand and reactionaries on the other."

Mary Heimann, Catholic Devotion in Victorian England (Oxford); on the strong continuity in choice of devotion between pre- and post-'Second Spring' Catholicism, thus linking both cisalpine and ultra-montane, liberal and conservative Catholics, Irish immigrants and English old Catholics. "The Garden of the Soul, far from being abandoned in the post-1850 period, continued

to the staple devotional text.” “It was an invigorated English recusant tradition, not a Roman one, which was most successful in capturing the imagination of Catholics living in England from the middle of the nineteenth century to the early years of the twentieth.”

Pope John Paul II, Ut Unum Sint: “the elements of sanctification and truth present in the other Christian Communities, in a degree which varies from one to the other, constitute the objective basis of the communion, albeit imperfect, which exists between them and the Catholic Church. // To the extent that these elements are found in other Christian Communities, the one Church of Christ is effectively present in them;” “in the other Communities ... certain features of the Christian mystery have at times been more effectively emphasized.” “The desire of every Christian Community for unity goes hand in hand with its fidelity to the Gospel.” “It is necessary to pass from antagonism and conflict to a situation where each party recognizes the other as a partner.”

Colleen McDaniel, Material Christianity: Religion and Popular Culture in America, cites Franchot and Orsi as classics in cultural studies approach.

****1996****

Milward, Love and Marriage in Shakespeare's Plays: the final marriage in Measure signifies the “fulfillment of the Messianic Psalm 85: ‘Mercy and truth are met together’.”

Eamon Duffy, “Was Shakespeare a Catholic?,” The Tablet, on Shakespeare as church papist; replied to by Milward a few weeks later.

Antonia Fraser, The Gunpowder Plot: Terror and Faith in 1605: portrays the Catholic desperation that led to the Plot, stresses “the terror of governments, directed towards dissident minorities,” cites Appellant dispute as typical of dilemma for proscribed Christians in totalitarian countries, plot as typical desperation measure under totalitarianism: “It was indeed ‘a heavy and doleful tragedy,’ that men of such calibre were driven by continued religious persecution to Gunpowder, Treason and Plot” (last sentence).

Michael Schiefelbein, “A Catholic Baptism for Villette's Lucy Snow,” (Christianity and Literature): “For both protagonist and author, the Roman Church, by effectively incorporating the double tyranny of external authority and romantic spells, proves paradoxically sacramental in mediating rebirth” (see Schiefelbein 2001).

Patricia Parker, Shakespeare from the Margins: Iago as informer reflects Elizabethan web of domestic informers ferreting out recusants.

Debora Shuger, “Subversive fathers and suffering subjects: Shakespeare and Christianity,” in Religion, Literature, and Politics in Post-Reformation England, ed. Hamilton and Strier: “those moments in Shakespeare identified by modern critics as radical and subversive derive (however indirectly) from traditions of Christian radicalism ... characteristic of the Church Fathers.” i.e. Lear on the poor “does not voice subversive heterodoxies ... but the social teachings of the medieval church.”

Louis Montrose, The Purpose of Playing (develops 1980 article): theater became a substitute to satisfy for the loss of the banned Catholic liturgy.

Julia Lupton, Afterlives of the Saints, on Measure for Measure and The Winter's Tale: in Shakespeare, Catholic religious remnants, in continuous dialogue with Protestant iconoclasm, give energy to the plays. Excellent explications, though claiming that Catholicism is -- ultimately -- cancelled out by being emptied into secular energy.

Kenneth Branagh's movie, Hamlet, accentuating the Gothic Catholic elements, echoing Gothic novels (which Hamlet itself influenced).

Blair Worden, The Sound of Virtue: Philip Sidney's Arcadia and Elizabethan Politics, on Sidney's fierce patriotic (though not doctrinal) Protestantism; yet footnote on p. 329: “A forthcoming essay by Katherine Duncan-Jones ... emphasizes the evidence that Sidney may at one stage have been attracted to Roman Catholicism. Though that evidence is far from conclusive, it provides a further reason for asking whether the politics and religion of Sidney's party can have accommodated every aspect of his personality. It may also cast suggestive light on his representation of love as idolatry, a representation which does not invariably seem unsympathetic.”

Frank Brownlow, Robert Southwell: cites many more parallels than Devlin between St. Peter's Complaint and Rape of Lucrece

Religion and the Arts: Special Issue on Warhol and his Last Supper paintings, ed. Jane

Dillenberger.

****1997****

Richard Wilson, "Shakespeare and the Jesuits," TLS: more on Campion and missionary connection, and charting their journey from Stratford to Hoghton Castle; argues importance of Campion influence on Shakespeare, that Campion may have ridden north with this young bright Catholic to Hoghton Tower.

Richard Wilson, "Voyage to Tunis: New History and the Old World of The Tempest," (ELH): the play coincides with feverish diplomacy over proposed marriage of Prince Henry to Caterina, daughter of Grand Duke Ferdinand of Tuscany, in order to free Milan from Spanish control; portraits were exchanged, and bride was guaranteed freedom of worship; the Medicis gloated how English Catholics were rejoicing that "the prince now turns to Tuscany for a bride." Match depended on pardon of exiled duke, Robert Dudley, son of Leicester, who eloped with cousin, converted to Catholicism, was used by Ferdinand as overlord of Tuscan shipyards. Noted for his secret studies, inventions, chart-making, etc., Dudley hoped that Prince Henry would gain his pardon and (with Lord Northampton) urged the marriage. (Dudley had also voyaged to Americas in 1594 when he explored the Orinoco Delta near Trinidad, and named an island Dudleana; his account described a tempest off "the Bermudes," talked of his miraculous deliverance from the storm.) Author of Arcano del Mare described Dudley: "In this worthy enterprise of bringing two hemispheres into one world, if one man is more eminent than others, it is this Duke of Northumberland, who, to make himself master of marine science, tore himself away from the great house where he had princely birth, and sacrificed full forty years in unveiling the mighty secrets of the sea." No source agreed on yet for Tempest, and yet Dudley's story is good candidate. Dudley thus might have returned as key Catholic adviser of Prince Henry. Pope reported to believe that "the coming of the princess will ease the suffering of English Catholics" and her "followers will begin to convert England." First folio, dedicated to two of Dudley's cousins, William and Philip Herbert, puts Tempest first. "It will take time to sort out what we think of Richard Wilson's ... argument" (Hamilton, "Shakespeare and Religion," 1999).

David Beauregard, "New Light on Shakespeare's Catholicism: Prospero's Epilogue in The Tempest" (Renascence) on the Catholic theology implicit in Prospero's final use of words like "indulgence."

1997 cont.

Milward, The Catholicism of Shakespeare's Plays: seeing Shylock as Puritan relieves Shakespeare from the charge of anti-semitism. "In such snatches [of Ophelia] ... one may find the further implication of lament for the passing of Catholic England." Lucio calls Friar Lodowich (Duke) "the fantastical duke of dark corners," recalling Burghley on "secret lurkings" of Jesuits in Execution of Justice. Fool's "priests are more in word" adapt "Chaucer's Prophecy" ("When faith faileth in priests's saws" etc.) in Verstegan's Declaration of the True Causes (1582), i.e. the spurious "Plowman's Tale" (not in Canterbury Tales). Miracles from Comedy of Errors on culminate "in the Winter's Tale in the supreme miracle of Hermione's resurrection -- however much the dramatist may furnish it with a far-fetched 'natural' explanation. From the Catholic viewpoint, it may point to the conclusion not that 'the Catholic cause is lost' as that "the Catholic cause can now be saved only by a miracle."

Greenblatt, introd., Norton Shakespeare: "Accepting for the moment that William Shakespeare was raised in the recusant faith of his father ..."

Huston Diehl, Staging Reform, Reforming the Stage: "Elizabethan and Jacobean dramatists ... create new forms of drama that are both energized and threatened by the anti-theatricality of the new religion."

Lisa Hopkins, "Neighbourhood in Henry V" in Shakespeare and Ireland, ed. Burnett and Ray: how the play reconstructs an older international Catholic community.

John T. McGreevy, "Thinking on One's Own: Catholicism in the American Intellectual Imagination, 1928-1960" (Jrnl. Amer. Hist): how opposition to Catholicism helped define liberalism in these years; cites Franchot, also J.C.D. Clark, The Language of Liberty, 1660-1832, arguing that anti-Catholicism was central to the revolutionary era.

W. B. Patterson, James VI and I and the reunion of Christendom.

Cardinal Francis Arinze, The Risks and Rewards of Interreligious Dialogue: Meeting with Others.

John Martin, "Inventing Sincerity, Refashioning Prudence: The Discovery of the Individual in Renaissance Europe" (AHR). Distinguishes medieval concordia between inner and outer self, on

objective analogy principle, from Protestant sincerity, expressing one's emotions without filter. "Unlike the Protestant theologian who connected sincerity ... with the need to express one's emotion, the Catholic and stoic Montaigne based his ethic of sincerity on the need to be true to one's nature."

Ellis Hanson, *Decadence and Catholicism* (Harvard UP): "certain 'paradoxes ... made 'decadence' and Catholicism seem for a time partners: spiritualized sensuality, secret and ineffably homoerotic brotherhoods, treasonous internationalisms, the edgy enfolding of Hellenism and medievalism in an argumentative modernity, and above all, the baroque extremes of shame and grace" (Judith Wilt summary))

****1998****

Park Honan, *Shakespeare: A Life*, on Shakespeare's Catholic background and with chapter treating seriously the Lancaster possibility.

Honigsmann, *Shakespeare: the 'lost years'*, second edition (see 1985).

Richard Dutton, "Shakespeare and Lancaster" (*Shakespeare Quarterly*), on Shakespeare's tetralogy influenced by Doleman's *Conference*.

Amy Wolf, "Shakespeare and Harsnett: 'Pregnant to Good Pity'?" (SEL): Lear exhibit the real suffering and madness that the exorcism victims experienced in their own way, and Lear's ravings ("Down from the waist" etc.) reflect some of Harsnett's language of description. 257 Cordelia administers to him a gentle benediction. Edgar is a sympathetic pretender, unlike Harsnett's deceiving fakes. Genuine sympathy needed to empathize with suffering. [Is Edmund and his cynicism parallel to Harsnett contra Gloucester's superstition?]

Achsah Guibbory, *Ceremony and Community from Herbert to Milton* (Cambridge UP), on the longing for these things in the Laudian tradition, and also in Herrick, Browne. Milton desires "a ritual experience that might integrate body and spirit and connect human beings," "Milton's depiction of Edenic love and worship expresses a longing for both the community and the sense of integration that the ceremonialism of the Church of England claimed to provide. Though Milton rejected its worship ... as idolatrous ... he seem to have been at some level repelled by the dualism of a puritan ideology that would split inner and outer, body and soul." But with *Paradise Regained* and *Samson Agonistes*, "these final, rigorously iconoclastic poems represent the lonely, deconstructive, antisocial, and antihistorical implications of a radical puritan ethos ... the Son ... is a distinctively solitary figure, alone in the desert, obeying a divine Father who gives no material evidence of his presence until ... the end." "The act of divorce is at the center of *Samson Agonistes* ... concludes with the destruction of the idol-worshipping Philistines and their Temples" versus Dalila as the figure of idolatry." "The absence of positive forms of worship in *Samson* represents the ... impossibility ... of Milton's imagining in 1671 what form true ties of worship might take... Samson explicitly distances himself from the idolatrous, treacherous Israelites ... in a way that suggests Milton's own distance from his fellow Englishmen."

Maurice Hunt, "The Hybrid Reformations of Shakespeare's Second Henriad" (*Comparative Drama*): Henry V finally succeeds by combining Catholic and Protestant traits: "In typically syncretic fashion, Shakespeare melds aspects of two religious systems held to be antithetical during the later sixteenth century"; "The Catholic 'miracle' that at a decisive moment helps to cleanse his [Henry's] heart is Shakespeare's subtle argument for Protestant tolerance of Catholics."

Jessica Slights and Michael Holmes, "Isabella's Order: Religious Acts and Personal Desires in *Measure for Measure*" (*Studies in Philology*): Isabella's refusal to conform to heterosexual norms, plus her silent refusal at end, shows "that religion in early modern culture was ... a potentially dynamic zone of self-assertion and cultural critique;" cites multiple articles recently on this theme (i.e. DiGangi 1993, etc.) and on the self-validation of nuns (Bynum 1991, Grundy 1992, Wood 1995, McNamara 1996, etc.).

Theodora Jankowski, "Queer(y)ing Virginity in ... *Measure for Measure* ..." (*Shakespeare Studies*): on Isabella, cloistered "virginity represented a queer space," "a threat to the sexual economy" of "the restrictive male/female binary of the early modern Protestant sex/gender system."

Jonathan Bate, *The Genius of Shakespeare*: "indeed it is not the man, for Falstaff is if anything an embodiment of those ancient Catholic rhythms which were suppressed in the name of Reformation," vs. Hal who is beginning his "reformation."

Harold Bloom, *Shakespeare: The Invention of the Human* (title paraphrasing Hazlitt): "G. K.

Chesterton [often quoted by Bloom], a wonderful literary critic, insisted that Shakespeare was a Catholic dramatist ... I do not know, and Chesterton did not know either ... I certainly do not have a clue as to whether he favored Protestantism or Catholicism or neither ... His politics, like his religion, evades me, but I think he was too wary to have any." "I suspect that he had no politics, and no religion, only a vision of the human, or the more human" [yet] "I think part of Shakespeare's irony, in the play [Julius Caesar], is to suggest that no Roman, in good faith, could stand up against the spirit of Caesar, even as no Englishman could stand up against the spirit of Elizabeth." "Shakespeare, always wary of a state power that had murdered Marlowe and tortured Kyd into an early grave, makes a fine joke of the raging mob's dragging off the wretched Cinna the poet ... Shakespeare, whatever his nonpolitics, did not want to be torn for his good verses." "Johnson was massively right, something inhibited Shakespeare, though I cannot believe that it was North's Plutarch or Roman stoicism. We must look elsewhere, perhaps to the tyrannicide debate, as Robert Miola has suggested. By the time Shakespeare was at work on the play, the popes had excommunicated Elizabeth, and Catholics had plotted to murder her ..." "Shakespeare, in his dying, may have returned to his father's Catholicism, but like Wallace Stevens's reputed deathbed conversion, this would have been another instance of the imaginative achievement going one way and the personal life another."

William J. Abraham, Canon and Criterion in Christian Theology: "The heart of the Anglican proposal is that theological claims are to be justified by a complex appeal to Scripture, tradition, and reason." "The Reformation effectively created a massive epistemological crisis for the whole of Western culture [see Richard Popkin] ... The Enlightenment was not merely a secular revolt against the authority of the Church or tradition or Scripture; it was a movement created by Christian intellectuals to resolve deep canonical problem which Christians themselves had unwittingly created."

****1999****

Lancaster Conference, Lancaster University/Hoghton Castle Conference. Followed by extensive discussion on the Shakespeare Listserv (Bowie State). See books ed. Dutton et al, 2004. Greenblatt's assessment: in no other conference had he "experienced so much excitement and passion" (qu. Wilson 2004, p. 31). Brownlow review of Lancastrian Shakespeare: Region, Religion and Patronage, ed. Dutton et al (2003): "After all, Shakespeare is the national poet of an officially Protestant and anti-Catholic country with an established church. The news that a large assembly of scholars had met to discuss Shakespeare's Catholic affiliations was reported on all the British TV news programs, surely a first in academic history" (ELN, Dec 2005)

John Berryman, Berryman's Shakespeare, ed. John Haffenden: entertains seriously the Shakeshafte hypothesis in essay written in 1952.

Scott Crider, "Weeping in the Upper World: The Orphic Frame in 5.3 of The Winter's Tale and the Archive of Poetry" (Studies in the Literary Imagination): on the necessity of both theatrical and mythic readings of the final miracle, in the spirit of Ovid's Orpheus on Pygmalion.

David Beauregard, "'Inspired Merit': Shakespeare's Theology of Grace in All's Well That Ends Well" (Renascence), illustrating Catholic theology on miracles, works, interior sanctification, saints, grace, intercessory prayer.

John Tobin "Nashe and Some Shakespearean Sonnets" (N&Q) on many verbal echoes from Nashe's Christes Teares Over Jerusalem and other works. Also see Tobin's "A Touch of Greene, Much Nashe, and All Shakespeare," in Henry VI: Critical Essays, ed. Thomas Pendleton (2001).

Alison Shell, Catholicism, Controversy and the English Literary Imagination 1558-1660: how Southwell's preface influenced subsequent poets (Spenser, Herbert, etc.) to turn to religious themes, on Catholic loyalism, on continental Jesuit plays, on Cary's Mariam as promoting Catholicism to her husband, on Jacobean drama establishing association of Catholicism with evil, etc.

Ian Donaldson, Jonson's Magic Houses, chapter 4, "Jonson's Duplicity: The Catholic Years": Jonson's Epigram 102 "and scarce one knows, / To which, yet, of the sides himselfe he owes," due to religious subterfuges; Jonson perhaps protected by Esmé d'Aubigny and lodged in his house in Blackfriars, from where he christened his son Benjamin: "How full of want, how swallow'd up, how dead / I, and this Muse had beene, if thou hadst not / Lent timely succours, and new life begot" (Epigrams 127 to d'Aubigny), i.e. perhaps got him off Gunpowder Plot

Anthony Low, "Hamlet and the Ghost of Purgatory: Intimations of Killing the Father": Hamlet doesn't say purgatorial prayers, thus showing his generation's loss of the doctrine, and thus killing

of the father.

Alison Findlay, A Feminist Perspective on Renaissance Drama, that Isabella's Catholic celibacy is also "a powerful feminist symbol;" her final silence can be read "as an act of resistance rather than consent."

Thomas Rist, Shakespeare's Romances and the Politics of Counter-Reformation, arguing for Catholic habits of mind based on Ignatian meditation (see Martz, 1954), Catholic skepticism, miracles, intercessory prayer, etc.

Arthur Marotti, ed., Catholicism and Anti-Catholicism in Early Modern English Texts, on the complexities of Protestant anti-Catholicism, on obscure Catholic writings, including Persons's dream of a Catholic England.

Catholics and Lutherans sign Joint Declaration on the Doctrine of Justification; Ratzinger helps 'untie the knots.'

Gelpi, "The Catholic Presence in American Culture"(review article, Amer. Literary History: "I can envision a book on modern Catholic writers ... that seeks to pursue the consequences of the Incarnation for the Catholic imagination by concentrating chapters on how they connect with a particular issue in the light of their Incarnational theology. There might, for example, be chapters on the Incarnation and sexuality with Everson as focus, on the Incarnation and the good society with Day or Berrigan as focus, on the Incarnation and Jansenism with Lowell and/or Kerouac as focus, on the Incarnation and asceticism with Merton as focus, or the Incarnation and violence with O'Connor as focus, on the Incarnation and parish life with Powers as focus, on the Incarnation and post-structural linguistics with Percy as focus, on the Incarnation and sacramentalism with Denise Levertov as focus, and so on."

1999 cont.

Frances Dolan, Whores of Babylon. Catholicism, Gender, and Seventeenth-Century Print Culture, that Shakespeare's Cleopatra is made parallel to the allure of the papal Whore of Babylon.

Donna Hamilton, "Richard Verstegan's A Restitution ... A Catholic Antiquarian Replies to John Foxe ..." (Prose Studies); see above 1605.

Donna Hamilton, "Shakespeare and Religion" (Shakespearean International Yearbook): perceptive summary of new currents, acknowledging Dutton, Helgerson (see 1992), Duffy, Annabel Patterson on Holinshed, G. Taylor on Shakespeare's invisibility: "a religious allegiance was [not] necessarily the same as or determined social and political allegiances;" "the early goal of obliterating Catholicism was in part managed by enforcing Catholic silence ... a strategy closely linked to the creation of institutional and discursive worlds which then often succeeded in also representing Catholics as absent. Later historians wrote about what was in view;" Hamlet's "To be or not to be" reflects "What nobleness of courage were nedefull?" passage, in Persons's 1582 An Epistle of the Persecution of Catholickes in Englande: "That soliloquy ... from the perspective of catholic discourse names first their effort to return England to catholicism (the Enterprise of England), and second, the attitude needed to resist conformity."

David Kastan, "'Killed with Hard Opinions': Oldcastle and Falstaff and the Reformed Text of 1 Henry IV," in Shakespeare After Theory: Shakespeare is satirizing not a Protestant Oldcastle, but a ultra-Puritan Oldcastle. Thus "not ... a crypto-Catholic tactic but an entirely orthodox gesture, designed to reflect upon the nonconformity that the Queen herself had termed 'prejudicial to the religion established'." See Paul White, "Shakespeare and Religious Polemic," in Shakespeare's Second Historical Tetralogy, ed. B. Batson (2004): "It now seems likely that he [Cobham] was a moderate Protestant;" "the Drayton-Munday-Hathaway-Wilson Oldcastle play ... carefully distinguish[es] Oldcastle from the separatists and other extremists, placing him in the mainstream of serious Protestantism."

John Klaue, "Politics, heresy, and martyrdom in Shakespeare's Sonnet 123 and Titus Andronicus," in Shakespeare's Sonnets, ed. James Schiffer: for the moderate Catholic audience, "who wished to preserve an integrity of conscience but did not yearn for the glory of martyrdom, both the Machiavellianism of the Goths and the austere Romanitas of Titus were cause for dismay in reminding them of the religious politics of their own time."

ARCIC, Anglican-Roman Catholic commission issues The Gift of Authority, citing areas of agreement, and recommending that Anglicans and Catholic share in the "re-reception" of the Roman primacy.

Lutheran-Catholic Joint Declaration on the Doctrine of Salvation.

Robert Clark, memoir, My Grandfather's House, convert to Catholicism from Protestantism,

evokes long Reformation history of his family, cites Duffy et al in sources: "I have now come to believe that Mary has a special affinity for overregulated, hyperintellectualized New England hard cases like Margaret Fuller and Henry Adams, precisely those people to whom Mary ought to be anathema". Clark writes other novels exploring the relation of sexuality and Catholicism, on turning desire into love: see In the Deep Midwinter (1997); Mr. White's Confession (1998); Love Among the Ruins (2001)

2000**

Kenneth Muse, "The Protestant Issue in Hamlet" (Publications of the Missouri Philological Association): Denmark was early Protestant country; James VI had married Protestant Anne of Denmark, marriage in Elsinore, etc. "My best guess, then, is that young Will was exposed in his intimate family context to both religio-cultural value systems ... The effort to make sense of a radical duality of world-views channeling through one's parents can generate a deep and penetrating curiosity ... resulting from the simultaneous sympathy and distance one would feel toward each parent and each world-view. This is certainly what happened to Weber ... The family situation ... would tend to militate against ... a confessional position ... Shakespeare's interest ... is mostly ... in the cultural consequences of religion ... Shakespeare could see ... the imminent demise of an old world, a medieval, traditional, world order, a Catholic/Anglican hierarchical and communal world, and could see the seemingly inevitable overtaking of that world by a Protestant world, a modern, more democratic, and individualist culture and a more entrepreneurial and acquisitive world." Cites Weber's list from Protestant Ethic: loneliness, self-scrutiny, inwardness. Play's emphasis on private familiar matters, shows Protestant degeneration of the state, against which is needed a strong Fortinbras, Henry V redivivus.

David Beauregard, "Shakespeare Against the Homilies: The Theology of Penance in the Comedies" (Ben Jonson Journal): definitive discussion of repentance and penance scenes in the plays; if only Catholic cultural residues, why do the allusions become more emphatic in later plays? If parodied and emptied out, why doesn't Shakespeare emphasize this possibility more? shows that Catholic penance is elided in Protestant privatized version of contrition, confession (to God), faith, and amendment of life: "In using the word 'penance' nineteen times, Shakespeare reflects this [Catholic] aspect of penitential practice, a crucial fact completely overlooked by Noble and Shaheen." S. echoes Catholic structure of auricular confession, absolution, penance, satisfaction. Argues against Alfred Hart's Shakespeare and the Homilies (1934) on S's reliance on the homilies for theories of order and divine right.

Theodora A. Jankowski, Pure Resistance Queer Virginity in Early Modern English Drama (U of Penn): "It is against this Protestant understanding of virginity that I want to set the almost magical power of the estate represented in [Pericles] ... Marina's virginity is shown to carry with it a queer aura of power," "a power [that in Measure] allows virgin characters to be queer, that is to question both the necessity for and the character of patriarchally mandated marriage." Thus from a feminist direction, the old Catholic respect for virginity has been reinstated; also adapts "queer theory" to the value of virginity in Shakespeare.

Thomas Rist, "Topical Comedy: On the Unity of Love's Labour's Lost" (Ben Jonson Journal), on how the play moves from a first ascetic phase, into a worldly phase, into a second ascetic phase, reconfirming Catholic values; the ending suggests the traditional Catholic distinction between contemplative and active lives, and the Spiritual and Corporal works of mercy.

Peter Milward, Shakespeare's Apocalypse, on four tragedies.

Velma Bourgeois Richmond, Shakespeare, Catholicism, and Romance, arguing for a habit of mind based on medieval Catholic romance.

2000 cont.

John Bayley, review of Holden and Kermode (New York Review of Books): John Shakespeare "undoubtedly" Catholic; story of the will "one of the few certainties;" "Shakespeare's youthful consciousness must have been soaked in the old religion, as well as in the violence done to it by the new;" "probable, indeed almost certain, is that thesis of ... Honigmann;" "Catholic critics have usually more sense than to see the Bard as ardent in their cause, but they like to think and with some justification, that he moved in a penumbra of their faith, and mourned desecrated altars and churches."

Ruth Vanita, "Mariological Memory in The Winter's Tale and Henry VIII" (SEL): mariological associations of heroines, opting out of heterosexual structures, in late romances which redo Henry/Catherine conflict, celebrating the latter in Hermione, promoting female bonding, contra Henry; the plot which "ensures that Hermione and Leontes spend the best part of their adult lives

in celibacy, Hermione living in a women's community, posits a startling alternative to marriage." Clare Asquith, "The Phoenix and the Turtle" (Shakespeare Newsletter), on the poem's Catholic elements, especially reflecting the eucharistic paradoxes of Aquinas's hymn as translated by Southwell ("Two in show but one in substance ... Yet is Christ in each kind wholly / Most free from all division ... When the priest the host divideth / Know that in each part abideth / All ...," specifically reflecting the Palm Sunday "Lauda Sion" ("loudest lay"), perhaps celebrated in a recusant household honoring twin martyrs, Southwell and Walpole, written in Catholic code vs. the "shrieking harbinger" Topcliffe.

Alzada Tipton, "The Transformation of the Earl of Essex: Post-Execution Ballads and 'The Phoenix and the Turtle'" (Studies in Philology): Essex made the mournful dove who dies for Elizabeth who need not have died childless; instead her rejection led to her own self-immolation and loss of popularity.

Dennis Flynn, "Donne's Politics, 'Desperate Ambition,' and Meeting Paolo Sarpi in Venice" (JEGP): Donne converted to Anglicanism under influence of Sarpi's argument that secular power should be independent, thus defending Venice's temporal power against the Pope.

John W. O'Malley, Trent and All That, arguing for the category, "early modern Catholicism" as reflecting the manifold development of post-medieval Catholicism and including therefore 'Counter Reformation,' 'Catholic Reformation,' 'Catholic Reform,' 'Tridentine Catholicism,' etc. Thomas Merriam, "The Misunderstanding of Munday as Author of Sir Thomas More" (RES). Argues that Munday was a counter-spy agent provocateur promoting the play to entrap fellow playwrights, like Marlowe and Shakespeare.

Robert B. Bennett, Romance and Reformation: The Erasmian Spirit of Shakespeare's Measure for Measure: discusses parallel of "dramatic elements in Erasmus's Christian humanism ... to features of the genre of comic romance;" thus applies 1531 Erasmus statement, "all these turmoils in the Church will eventually turn out, as in a drama, with a happy ending, thanks to the skill of the Supreme Director whose inscrutable designs control the affairs of men."

David Ellis, "Biography and Shakespeare: An Outsider's View" (Cambridge Quarterly): strong statement insisting on tenuousness of Catholic case.

Randall Martin, "Rehabilitating John Somerville in 3 Henry VI," and John D. Cox, "Local References in 3 Henry VI" (Shakespeare Quarterly); Somerville, added to sources, assists Warwick, alludes to Somerville and Arden executions, the proximate occasion of Burghley's Execution of Justice, which sees Somerville incited by Leslie's A Treatise of Treasons (whose portraits of N. Bacon and Burghley are source for Richard's soliloquy in 3.2); Richard paralleled by Leslie to their scheming to avert true succession; Leicester's Commonwealth blamed Leicester for the Somerville trial; also paralleled Burghley wicked counselors to those of Edward II, Richard II, and Henry VI. Allen's answer to Burghley said the Somerville case was a put-up job by Burghley. "Shakespeare portrays Somerville in a surprisingly positive light, boldly correcting the mildly confused Warwick yet clearly loyal to the Lancastrian cause;" "a coded portrait that challenges the official verdict on his contemporary namesake." When Warwick (whose importance Shakespeare inflates, tried to work continental marriage, killed trying to defend HVI) assures his Lancastrian allies, "In Warwickshire I have truehearted friends, / Not mutinous in peace, yet bold in war," "this praise for a local county is rare in Shakespeare;" "To have a Somerville appear as a loyal retainer of the earl of Warwick gives a very different impression of the family than recent history.") [Notice that these key works by Leslie, Burghley, Persons, Allen are linked by Somerville reference.]

Richard Wilson, "'The Statue of our Queen': Shakespeare's Roman Detour," La Licorne 54 (2000): 111-23; interesting details on Robinson and Blackfriars.

Lucy Wooding, Rethinking Catholicism in Reformation England: on common presence among Tudor Catholics of Erasmus's enthusiasm for Scripture and church reform and devotion centered on grace not works. "No single definition of Catholic orthodoxy existed before the Reformation, and ... the fifteenth-century had left a rich heritage of intellectual pluralism." "Catholicism around 1530 was a dynamic and developing creed with strong reform ideas, capable of incorporating much of what Henry VIII was professing." Justification parallel to Catholic "fides formata which was central to reformed Catholicism and early Protestantism alike." "The Marian Church was still engrossed in perpetuating a reformed and humanist brand of Catholicism." Chapter 6 "examines those elements of Catholic thought in the 1560's and early 1570's which

might be seen as the last flowering of the earlier intellectual tradition, even as they intermingled with the first stirrings of a new approach.” But because of Protestant success, Catholics started emphasizing papacy, tradition, authority, etc. [Because of Protestantism, Catholicism became what Protestants claimed it was, anti-Bible, anti-laity, anti-freedom, emphasis on saints and devotions, etc.] “The age of Erasmus ... was being replaced by an age of orthodoxy.” Then boundaries began to harden, the moderate ground was occupied by Protestants, a “Counter-Reformation” approach began. “The earlier ... religious change was more truly a reformation, in that it tried to reform, rather than overthrow, existing belief systems.” Pettegree review (EHR 2002) questions the Erasmian reconciliation but concedes: “the book does raise, at least implicitly, an interesting question: could Catholic evangelism remain a viable option in a scholarly world poisoned by the dialectic confrontation between Luther and the Pope;” yet the French and Italian experiments failed. Haigh review (Hist. Jnl, 2002): “Were Catholic reformers cheerfully dumping outmoded ideas, or just keeping quiet about the unfashionable bits of the faith? They may be rethinking Catholicism -- or putting up the best case they could.” C. Armstrong (JEH 2003): “fails to deal with the far more obviously Erasmian irenic theologians of Europe ...;” argues anti-Protestant character of 16th century English Catholics bet. HVIII and excommunication of Elizabeth, “a fairly homogeneous group.”

R. V. Young, Doctrine and Devotion in Seventeenth-Century Poetry (Cambridge): While Martz, Helen White and co. ignored the Protestant contexts, Lewalski and co. too easily grouped Donne, Herbert and others with Calvinism. In fact, these poets were retaining much of Catholic insight in so far as they could within the Protestant hegemony. Donne wrestles with different versions of grace; note “his simultaneous discomfort and fascination with this conception of sacramental presence.” “Herbert longed to retain the spiritual consolation and ambiance of the Catholic sacramental system under Protestant auspices.”

M. C. Questier, “What Happened to English Catholicism after the English Reformation” (History): the coming of Jesuits et al in 1580s and early 1590s, radicalizing Catholicism, meant “the disruption of a Catholic ‘puritan’ experiment with separatism.”

****2001****

R. Chris Hassel Jr., “Intercession, Detraction, and Just Judgment in Othello” (Comparative Drama), on the echoes of the medieval Mystery plays like the York play, “Troubles of Joseph” and the N-Town plays, “The Trial of Mary” and “Joseph’s Doubt,” “Trial of Mary and Joseph,” i.e. Mary’s detraction and defense, Joseph’s suspicions, backbiters paralleling Iago. “None has noticed the degree to which Othello’s weighing of Desdemona’s imagined demerit derives from the traditional imagery of Marian lyrics and mediations.”

Stephen Greenblatt, Hamlet in Purgatory (Princeton UP) “an exploration of how a culture can be inhabited by its own spectral leftovers.”

Carol Enos, Shakespeare and the Catholic Religion (Dorrance Publ. Co).

2001 cont.

Shakespeare and Catholicism, special issue of Religion and the Arts includes David **Beauregard**, “Shakespeare on Monastic Life: Nuns and Friars in Measure for Measure,” definitive treatment of Shakespeare’s favorable treatment of friars, monastic life, celibacy, sacramental confession; Stacey and Thomas **Hibbs**, “Virtue, natural Law, and Supernatural Solicitation: A Thomistic Reading of Shakespeare’s Macbeth,” Richard **Wilson**, “A Bloody Question: The Politics of Venus and Adonis,” on Venus as Elizabeth, Adonis as recusant, boar as Burghley; Shakespeare wary of the recusant fate; Beauregard, “Shakespeare and the Bible,” review of Naseeb Shaheen etc., showing that Shaheen’s excessive reliance on Protestant bibles ignores the influence of Catholic biblical translations on Shakespeare, and notes the omission of discussion of key Catholic terms like penance, confession; Dennis Taylor’s “Hamlet in Purgatory,” review of Greenblatt.

John Klaue, “New Sources for Shakespeare’s King John: The Writings of Robert Southwell,” (Studies in Philology); too many verbal echoes to be coincidental: “That Shakespeare should have had available to himself an outlawed and suppressed publication from a Catholic press (The Epistle of Comfort) and a manuscript that circulated only in the Catholic underground ... (the Humble Supplication) raises intriguing questions about his personal connections and interests.”

J. P. Conlan, “Shakespeare’s Edward III: A Consolation for English Recusants” (Comparative Drama): critique of the official propaganda sustaining the persecution of English recusants after the Invincible Armada’s defeat, by showing how Queen’s stubborn Catholic values in the play reform the king and account for ultimate victory.

Shakespeare Survey, “Shakespeare and Religions” section, ed. Peter Holland. Among the essays: **David Daniell**, “Shakespeare and the Protestant Mind”: “such revisionism is far from new, being laid down long ago in both historical method and dogma in books of Catholic polemic;” celebrates Bible nurtured Protestant liberty, thus a “popular” movement; celebrates Tyndale-like common language, though his last example is oddly discordant: Hamlet’s “extraordinary image of the bell serjeant strictly arresting suggests guilt, and martyrdom, and horror ... ;” **Jeffrey Knapp**, “The Religion of the Players”: some scholars do assert that “the deepest inspiration in Shakespeare’s plays is both religious and Christian [cite Milward 1973] ... but they have had little influence on recent Shakespeare scholarship, in large part because they tend to allegorize the plays crudely.” **Donna Hamilton**, “Anthony Munday and The Merchant of Venice”: Munday’s Zelauto (1580) shows a Catholic Munday; part 1 defends royal supremacy and loyalty, but part 2 critiques that notion by portraying Christians, defended by Zelauto, martyred by Turks; part 3 represents usurer Truculento persecuting maiden and demanding eyes of the young men: they resist successfully; but Munday turned Protestant and informer after Oxford, Munday’s patron, recanted Catholicism in 1580, and after Campion’s arrest in 1581; but remained a conflicted turncoat. **Gary Taylor**, “Divine [I]ssences”: on relation of pagan and Catholic divinity; in Sejanus, Jonson portrays female image in chapel giving prophecy which is vindicated though ridiculed by an atheist speaking like Harsnett: “a moment of reverent (Catholic) affect is superseded by a moment of contemptuous (Protestant) affect, but the contempt of a contemptible character only reinforces the reverence of spectators;” “The pagan deities in the romances are not deceiving demons, but benevolent entities with real knowledge and real power, and as such easily understood as allegorical representations of Christian divinity” (cites Rist, 1999, who argued “that the Shakespearean scepticism praised by many critics takes in fact a specifically Counter-Reformation form;” also cites Milward Shakespeare’s Other Dimension 1987 on such allegorical identifications.) “Suggests that pagan ritual ... provides a powerfully coded analogue for old Catholic rites” (Dutton summary, 2005; Shakespeare’s “own late plays follow Jonson’s lead: they give us, not a Brechtian emptying out of Christian mythology, but the commodification of a specifically Catholic affect” (p. 24). **Robert Miola**, “‘An Ancient People Clutching Their Gods’: Shakespeare’s Ancient Religions”: “The allusions do not amount to a manifesto of the playwrights’ personal belief -- biographical Catholicity -- or to a discursive body of dogma advocated openly or secretly -- literary Catholicity. Instead they constitute a cultural Catholicity, which in Shakespeare ancient Rome and Greece, has real presence.” Miola’s review of this volume (in ms.): “The practice of treating Shakespeare’s works as evidence about his life and beliefs seems always to reveal more about the investigator than the investigated. One can easily find as many anti-Catholic passages, moments, and characters, as pro-Catholic. Critics might spend their time more profitably in giving voice to silenced Catholic figures, as Milward has in his impressive two volumes on religious controversies, and to exploring the religious conflicts that constitute the early modern cultural moment.”

R. Chris Hassel, Jr., “‘No boasting like a fool’? Macbeth and Herod” (Studies in Philology), on the many parallels to the Herod of earlier liturgical drama.

Paul J. Voss, Elizabethan News Pamphlets: Shakespeare, Spenser, Marlowe & the Birth of Journalism; on flurry of news pamphlets (1589-93), emphasizing Catholic atrocities. “Extant documents from 1584 to 1594 suggest that no other Englishman, including Sir Francis Drake and the Earl of Essex combined, generated as much interest and support in the general press as Navarre ... Navarre’s popularity came to an abrupt halt after his conversion in 1594.” “Shakespeare’s experimental drama, or perhaps ‘imaginative journalism,’ might actually be suggesting a way to end the wars -- with poetry and not pikes.” “The broken oaths of Navarre suggest that Shakespeare either, quite amazingly, anticipates the king’s abjuration, or that the revision of the play took place after July of 1593.” S. “combines bitter enemies and transforms religious perjury into more benign romantic perjury.”

Hildegard Hammerschmidt-Hummel, Die verborgene Existenz des William Shakespeare: on importance of the Flower portrait painted over painting of Virgin Mary and child (a way of protecting Arden heirloom?). [But painting has now been dated later.]

Maurine Sabine, “Fred Zinnemann’s The Nun’s Story and the Pilgrim Soul of Women” (Religion and the Arts).

Michael Schiefelbein, The Lure of Babylon: Seven Protestant Novelists and Britain’s Roman

2001 cont.

Catholic Revival: on the mixture of attraction and repulsion in such works. Cites Franchot. Discusses Bronte, Eliot, Francis Trollope, Dickens, Scott, Mary Shelley, Kingsley; critiqued in Engelhardt review, Victorian Studies, 2003.

Pope John Paul II visits Greece, first papal visit since the schism of 1054.

Eamon Duffy, The Voices of Morebath: Reformation and Rebellion in an English Village: describing pastor Sir Christopher Highley's slow reluctant enduring of reforms.

Kimberly VanEsveld Adams, Our Lady of Victorian Feminism, citing Marina Warner's Alone of all Her Sex: The Myth and Cult of the Virgin Mary (1976), on Madonna admiration in Anna Jameson, Margaret Fuller, George Eliot, on celibate Virgin's female independence, etc.

Robert Miola, "Ben Jonson, Catholic Poet" (Renaissance and Reformation).

The Pontifical Council For Promoting Christian Unity issues Guidelines for intercommunion between the Chaldean [Catholic] Church and the Assyrian Church of the East. In 1994 Pope John Paul II and Mar Dinkha IV, Patriarch of the Assyrian Church of the East, signed a Common Christological Declaration, "removing the main doctrinal obstacle between the two churches" which "*can recognise each other as sister Churches.*" "When necessity requires, Assyrian faithful are permitted to receive Holy Communion in a Chaldean celebration of the Holy Eucharist; in the same way, Chaldean faithful ... are permitted to receive Holy Communion in an Assyrian celebration of the Holy Eucharist. In both cases, Assyrian and Chaldean ministers should continue to celebrate the Holy Eucharist according to the liturgical prescriptions and customs of their own tradition especially regarding the use of the Anaphora." This is not yet "full communion" between the two churches which are "still travelling, with hope and courage, towards that blessed day when full and visible communion will be attained." [notice this model of intercommunion and "sister" churches.]

2002

Robert Bearman, "'Was William Shakespeare William Shakeshafte?' Revisited" (Shakespeare Quarterly): renews Hamer's anti-Shakeshafte argument, traces many Shakeshaftes in Preston, argues that legacy would be given to older servant.

John Klause, "The Phoenix and Turtle in its Time," in In the Company of Shakespeare, ed. Moisan and Bruster: Shakespeare gives us alternative ideal of strict chastity to the eros-oriented birds of the first part; he idealizes Catholic celibate marriage and prayers for dead. The poem reflects the liturgical language of Skelton's "Sir Philip Sparrow," a mock elegy with much Catholic liturgical imagery for young Jane Scrope, a pupil of Benedictine nuns, many elements of the Latin liturgy; cites other Catholic elements, also reflects Southwell's "A holy Hymne," an English rendering of Aquinas's "Lauda Sion, salvatorem" (scholastic distinctions (charted by Cunningham) found in Southwell's trans. of this work), a liturgical celebration of the Eucharist, detailed parallels of Southwell's words, esp. from "Epistle of Comfort;" also evokes Southwell's "Her Spousals," praises of celibate marriage of Mary and Joseph; also many verbal echoes of Saint Peters Complaint. The poem is "a subtle and enigmatic insult" to Sir John Salusbury, dedicatee of Love's Martyr with its Protestant content, who is trying to cement his credentials (vs. his many Catholic relatives) and hop on the Protestant bandwagon.

R. Watson, "Othello as Reforming Tragedy, in In the Company of Shakespeare, ed. Moisan and Bruster: on Othello by implication "endorsing the Protestant Reformation," i.e. Iago undermining Othello's solifidianism by tempting him to look for proofs and works; his agony of faith tortured by works, like that described by Luther. Compares Iago to Jesuits described in C. Bagshaw's A Sparing Discoverie of our English Jesuits (1601): they abuse confidences and turn "the wife against her husband: the husband's against his wife, and the servant of them both ... to tyrannize over them." The homoerotics of Iago's relation to Othello "evoke the sodomital taint of antimonastic polemics."

Gerard Kilroy, "Requiem for a Prince: Rites of Memory in Hamlet" (Downside Review): on prison of Denmark, like prison of England for recusants; thus the spying, distrust of fathers for sons, "bloody question," "Latin requiem mass in "flights of angels," minister refusing Ophelia funeral like Protestants rejecting funeral mass, Hamlet new confessor for mother, parody of eucharist.

John Velz, "Some Amens in Shakespeare" (Shakespeare Newsletter): that Shakespeare's common expression, "say Amen" echoes Southwell's "sweete Jesu, say Amen" in last line of St. Peter's Complaint.

Brian Vickers, 'Counterfeiting' Shakespeare: Evidence, Authorship, and John Ford's Funerall

Elegy.

Paul Dean, "Shakespeare and Religion: Authorised and Revised Versions" (The Use of English), summary of the case, review of Holland's 2001 Shakespeare Survey collection.

Ernst Honigsmann, "Catholic Shakespeare? A Response to Hildegard Hammerschmidt-Hummel" (Connotations 2002-3): "decoding of hidden meanings too often fails to persuade, and I fear may do more harm than good." But "My Shakespeare was probably (but by no means certainly) brought up as a Catholic, probably continued as a Catholic in his 'lost years,' and possibly returned to his Catholic faith on his death-bed, after (probably) converting to the Church of England when or soon after he started his career in the theatre."

María Elena de las Carreras Kuntz, "The Catholic Vision in Hollywood: Ford, Capra, Borzage and Hitchcock," Film History (suggestive, but needs clear contrasts with Protestant and secular film-makers).

Dennis Taylor, "Wordsworth's Abbey Ruins," in The Fountain Light: Studies in Romanticism and Religion, ed. J. R. Barth, S. J., on Wordsworth's Catholic remnants.

****2003****

James Ellison, "Measure for Measure and the Execution of Catholics in 1604" (English Literary Renaissance): Angelo's strictures reflect Jamesian crackdown on recusants, revising unused Elizabethan laws; thus 'nineteen' (1.2.168) and 'fourteen' (1.3.21) year periods take us back to 1585 and 1590, when Elizabethan legislation was most enforced. Fornication also applied to Catholic vice and popish whoring after false gods. Thus Elbow's "woman cardinally given;" coining "heaven's image / In stamps that are forbid." Ellison argues for moderate Anglican Shakespeare, like the Southampton associated with E. Sandys's irenic Relation of the State of Religion (1605). Vienna seen as key opposition (thus need united Christianity) to Turks, who were temporarily supported by the Protestant king of Hungary; Poland famous for freedom of religion; S. decisively moderates Whetstone source to promote ecumenical spirit. Duke curbs extremes of Catholic Isabella and Puritan Angelo. Promotes James as reconciling Protestant king; marriage with Isabella evokes Luther's.

James Ellison, "The Winter's Tale and the Religious Politics of Europe," in Shakespeare's Romances, ed. A. Thorne (Palgrave 2003). Recognition of Bohemia as Protestant "allows the union of Bohemia and Sicily at the end of the play to be seen as emblematic of the hopes of James and his supporters that some kind of reunification between moderate Protestant and moderate Catholics in Europe might be achievable through entirely peaceful means"; cites Rudolf II; questionable arguments.

Patrick H. Martin and John Finnis, "Thomas Thorpe, 'W.S.,' and the Catholic Intelligencers" (ELR): Thorpe guest of Persons in Spain in 1597 -- Persons trusted him, and perhaps used his help in Catholic publishing; interrogated by Exchequer 1597; early published work by Catholic priest, Thomas Wright; other Catholic connections.

Thomas Merriam, "More and Woodstock" (Notes and Queries), on Sir Thomas Moore: "More's high proportion of feminine endings associates it more with Shakespeare's habits of the 1590s than with those of any other playwright, including Munday."

Michael Hays, Shakespearean Tragedy as Chivalric Romance, on the influence in Shakespeare's background of chivalric romances especially the "two most popular chivalric romances in Shakespeare's day, Guy of Warwick (c. 1300) and Bevis of Hampton (c. 1300)," with their exile and return motifs, their emphasis on chastity, faithfulness and heroism, on final reconciliation. Traces influence on Hamlet of Bevis of Hampton: Bevis's mother plots to kill her husband, opposed by Bevis who eventually kills stepfather. Otherwise, specific influences are few, and Catholic dimension is unproven.

2003 cont.

"Catholic/Protestant Presence in ... Julius Caesar, Macbeth, Hamlet," Shakespeare Institute, Wheaton College, Illinois, June 5-7, 2003. Some excerpts: **Grace Tiffany**, "Hamlet and Protestant Aural Theater": Claudius cannot repent, because he illustrates Calvinist predestination, in this "massively Protestant play." Play illustrates Protestant critique of images and spectacle (thus "Mousetrap" works only when heard explained). **Maurice Hunt**, "Reformation/Counter-Reformation Macbeth": equivocation ethics promoted by bloody questions; Macbeth predestined like Claudius; witches match stereotype of Jesuits -- they use parts of dead bodies for incantations: thus Harsnett describes N. Marwood, healed by pieces of Campion's body; Hooker called killing of king a sacramental violation. Henry VIII contrasts false Catholic prophecy (Buckingham, friar) vs. true (Cranmer at end). Infant Christ crowned misleads Macbeth. Yet pro-Catholic

elements: Edward the confessor, the royal touch and holy aid, “pious,” a Catholic term, miracle-working; 4th vision of witches, on line of kings, is unequivocal; vestiges of Catholic miracles plays. Thus subtle melding of Protestant and Catholic motifs, resulting in impression of tolerance of religious difference. Scourge of God theme goes back to generic Christianity, pre-Catholic/Protestant differentiations. **Robert Miola**, “‘I could not say Amen’: Prayer and Providence in Macbeth”: vs. Protestant reprobate theory, play emphasizes sheer gratuitousness of evil freely chosen. **Peter Milward**, “Topics Awaiting Further Study”: Because mainstream criticism is fiercely secular, the ground is wide-open for religious interpretation. Shakespeare turns to what should unite all Christians, which is not the same as “mere Christianity.” “Indignatio facit versum” characterizes Shakespeare’s works.

Ernst Honigmann, “The Shakespeare/Shakeshafte Question, Continued” (Shakespeare Quarterly): replies to Bearman’s 2002 attack, repeats arguments from 1985 lost years book; S. “seems to have had a remarkable talent for inspiring friendship,” thus Southampton, Pembroke, Jonson, thus also the eccentric Alexander Hoghton.

2003 cont.

Shakespeare and the Reformation, special issue of Religion and the Arts, introd. Dennis Taylor. Includes **Richard Dutton**, “The Comedy of Errors and The Calumny of Apelles: An exercise in source study”: on how Lucian’s theme of slander applies to religious divisions suggested in the play; Katherine Goodland, “‘Obsequious Laments’: Mourning and Communal Memory in Shakespeare’s Richard III”: how women’s laments reflect banned Catholic rituals of mourning for the old Catholic world; **John Klaue**, “Catholic and Protestant, Jesuit and Jew: Historical Religion in The Merchant of Venice”: the play, full of Southwellian verbal echoes, shows Shylock as the Puritan Protestant facing two Southwells, the martyr-like Antonio, the reforming Portia; **R. Chris Hassel, Jr.**, “The Accent and Gait of Christians: Hamlet’s Puritan Style”: how Hamlet reflects a conflicted Puritan trying to stay true to an elected conscience; **Maurice Hunt**, “Helena and the Reformation Problem of Merit in All’s Well That Ends Well”: on the irreconcilable Protestant and Catholic views of merit and grace in the play.

Shakespeare and the Christian Culture of Early Modern England, ed. Taylor and Beauregard (Fordham University Press). Includes the previous, plus

Clare Asquith, “Oxford University and Love’s Labour’s Lost”: the oath is like the oath of supremacy required for admission to Oxford, and the princess represents a wished-for Elabeth who would re-introduce love; **Jean Christophe Mayer**, “Shakespeare’s Religious Background Revisited – Richard II in a New Context”: the performance of Richard II paralleled Essex to Bolingbroke as parliamentarian; **Timothy Rosendale**, “Sacral and Sacramental Kingship in the Lancastrian Tetralogy”: Protestant fictive symbolism replaces Catholic magical univocalism; **Gary Hamilton**, “Mocking Oldcastle: Notes Toward Exploring a Possible Catholic Presence in Shakespeare’s Henry IV”: Falstaff represents the corrupt Protestant counselors of Catholic satire, and his rejection represents the fantasy that the successor to Elizabeth might reject Protestantism; **Regina M. Buccola**, “Shakespeare’s Fairy Dance with Religio-Political Controversy in The Merry Wives of Windsor”: how the play warmly presents the world of faeries, superstition, Catholicism; **John Freeman**, “This Side of Purgatory: Ghostly Fathers and the Recusant Legacy in Hamlet”: how Hamlet reflects the recusant’s antic, hidden, anxious religious life; **Jennifer Rust**, “Wittenberg and Melancholic Allegory: The Reformation and its Discontents in Hamlet”: how Hamlet reflects the new Protestant interiority in a world of interpretative chaos; **David Beauregard**, “Shakespeare on Monastic Life: Nuns and Friars in Measure for Measure”: on the dramatization of Protestant and Catholic values, and their reconciliation; **Lisa Hopkins**, “Paris is Worth a Mass: All’s Well That Ends Well and the Wars of Religion”: the play seeks reconciliation of a Catholic past and Protestant present; **Richard Mallette**, “Blasphemous Preacher: Iago and the Reformation”: on Iago as demonic Protestant preacher; **Paula McQuade**, “Love and Lies: Marital Truth-Telling, Catholic Casuistry and Othello”: on Catholic equivocation in Desdemona in opposition to Protestant companionate marriage.

Michael Wood, In Search of Shakespeare (book and TV series): vivid summary of Shakespeare’s Catholic contexts, beautifully illustrated. “Shakespeare was born of a Catholic family, but perhaps lost his parents’ religion as an adult, although what he imbibed with his mother’s milk and through his Warwickshire roots stayed with him in his heart, as those things shaped by childhood almost always tend to.”

Hammerschmidt-Hummel, William Shakespeare: seine Zeit, sein Leben, sein Werk: John

Shakespeare sold property in 1578, perhaps to finance William's education; Rheims mentioned in Taming dates play before 1593 when college moved back to Douai. Essex (unlike Elizabeth, born and bred a Protestant, and so exempt from papal excommunication) expected succession to the throne was the grounds for the hope that Catholicism might be legally tolerated within a Protestant-led England; failure of his Irish mission in 1599 due partly to his willingness to accede to Irish demands in connection with the Catholic religion. There may have been deliberate arson in the burning of the Globe Theatre on the feast of Saint Peter, 29 June 1613 (Old Style), because of the day's papal association and because of Henry VIII's dangerous political content.

Caroline Bicks, Midwiving Subjects in Shakespeare's England, discovers parallels to the banned papist churning of women ceremony at the end of Pericles, The Winter's Tale, The Comedy of Errors.

David Bentley Hart, The Beauty of the Infinite: The Aesthetics of Christian Truth (Eerdmans): "the doctrine of the resurrection opens up another, still deeper kind of pain: it requires of faith something even more terrible than submission ... and acceptance of fate, and forbids faith in the consolation of tragic wisdom; it places all hope and all consolation upon the insane expectation that what is lost will be given back." "In the light of Easter, the singularity of suffering is no longer tragic (which is to say, ennobling), but merely horrible." Lear and Cordelia's "scene of reconciliation (which strains after an eschatological hope) makes the subsequent death of Cordelia more terrible than anything in Attic tragedy: precisely because the spectator has been granted a glimpse of the joy that tragic wisdom is impotent to adumbrate—the restoration of the beloved" (392-3).

Richard Dutton, Alison Findlay & Richard Wilson, eds., Region, religion and patronage: Lancastrian Shakespeare (Manchester UP) (appeared 2004): on the non-metropolitan theatre spaces which formed a vital part of early modern dramatic activity; and which Shakespeare may have experienced in Lancaster. Includes, among others, **Richard Dutton**, "Shakespeare and Lancaster" (reprinted, see above, 1998); **Mary A. Blackstone**, "Lancashire, Shakespeare and the construction of cultural neighbourhoods in sixteenth-century England": compares Shakespeare to the "transitional men" described by Anthony Smith, Theories of Nationalism (1971), moving up within Tudor networks of traveling "Preachers [Protestant and Catholic], cartographers, playwrights and some performers;" the "Irish Sea province" was a "contiguous cultural province" to the "Severn/Avon province" (Gloucestershire, Warwickshire, Worcestershire, Shropshire), and there was much movement across these; traveling players doubled as couriers. Smith described his "transitional man" as perceiving "connections between ... private dilemmas and public issues," exhibiting "the key traits of inconsistency and ambivalence over old and new values and life-styles," "torn by the confliction between 'new aspirations and old traditions'," and moved most powerfully "by the symbols of 'nation' and 'class'". Thus Henry V, Harry is like a transitional man, with his unconventional education on the highways, showing ambivalence over old and new values, both pro and anti-Catholicism.

Richard Dutton, Alison Gail Findlay, Richard Wilson, eds. Theatre and Religion: Lancastrian Shakespeare (Manchester UP) (appeared 2004): on the Shakespeare and Catholicism issue. Includes, among others, **Richard Wilson**, "Introduction: A torturing hour: Shakespeare and the martyrs": "Simpson was pioneering a method that carefully avoided the traps of either exclusively external or internal interpretation, suggesting instead a dialectical tension between Shakespeare's formal choices and historical determinants," to dismay of formalist like Furnivall. Tribute to Simpson followed by mature review of evidence. **Eamon Duffy**, "Bare ruined choirs: remembering Catholicism in Shakespeare's England": review of the laments for the destruction of monasteries; **Peter Milward**, "Shakespeare's Jesuit Schoolmasters;" **Robert Miola**, "Jesuit drama in early modern England;" **Jean-Christophe Mayer**, "'This papist and his poet': Shakespeare's Lancastrian kings and Robert Parson's Conference About the Next Succession;" **Carol Enos**, "Catholic exiles and As You Like It: Or what if you don't like it at all?": play reflects exile of Thomas Hoghton I, whose brothers tended to betray him; his son Thomas, in exile with father, debarred from succession and became priest, with his brothers hostile; "The evil brother, Duke Frederick and Oliver are redeemed in the play in an almost 'wishful thinking,' fairytale type of resolution that the real Thomas Hoghton I would have welcomed;" "the play was a plea to English Christians, Protestant and Catholics alike, to reconcile their differences in Christian forgiveness and love." **Arthur Marotti**, "Shakespeare and Catholicism": mature

review. Henry VIII “seems to play down Catholic/Protestant differences, preferring to hold out a model of Jacobean irenicism in Henry’s forcing a final reconciliation of Cranmer and Gardiner;” “Like so many of his contemporaries, Shakespeare was haunted by the symbols, rituals and beliefs of a culturally repressed Catholicism;” “It is as though Isabella were asking at the end of this play ‘Where does Isabella belong?’ and leaving the audience with no easy answer;” “In his plays Shakespeare expresses contradictory attitudes toward supernatural manifestations and signs, the first skeptical if not mocking, the second receptive and admiring;” “What Shakespeare might easily demystify, he remystifies and makes ambiguous, participating in a rehabilitation of magic and the visual that is elaborated in the Stuart Court masque;” “Shakespeare could not, and apparently did not wish to, sever his or his culture’s ties to a Catholic past and its residual cultural presence.” Gary Taylor, “The cultural politics of *Maybe*”: “We might begin to suspect that the Shakespeare First Folio was promoted ... by a conspiracy of underground Catholics.” Of the 4 men who wrote commendatory poems, James Mayne and Leonard Digges were hispanophiles, Hugh Holland was openly Catholic; Jonson had been Catholic. “After these Catholic or crypto-Catholic preliminaries, the Folio begins with The Tempest, a tragic-comedy which dramatizes the resolution of inter-state rivalry and political conflict through a dynastic marriage,” like the Spanish match. Ends with Cymbeline because that play “ends with the happy re-union of Britain and Rome.” Re: the Catholic religious background: “I have argued elsewhere that the early modern theatre was distinguished from all earlier forms of Western drama by the ‘routinized commodification of affect’ ... Shakespeare transformed all that real grief, real pain, real loss, real sacrifice, all that individual and collective religious trauma, into an apparently secular affective commodity.”

Hans Hillerbrand, “Was there a Reformation in the sixteenth century?” (Church History): “At present Reformation studies are at an impasse: theological and social historians face one another as do those who posit dramatic changes in the early part of the sixteenth century and those who do not.”

Kathleen Vejvoda, “Idolatry in Jane Eyre,” Victorian Literature and Culture. Rochester associated with Catholic idolatry, opposed to St. John Rivers (but a Protestant form): “the heroine must express and define her identity in the dialectical space between Protestant and Catholic forms of idolatry.”

Steven F. Walker, “The Name of the Madeleine: Signs and Symbols of the Mass in Proust’s In Search of Lost Time” (Religion and the Arts).

Jarlath Killeen, “Mother and Child: Realism, Maternity and Catholicism in Kate Chopin’s The Awakening” (Religion and the Arts).

Alexandra Walsham, “Miracles and the Counter-Reformation Mission to England” (Historical Journal). Use of miracles and such characterized both pre- and post-Reformation Catholicism. Trent “ordered the eradication of all ‘superstition; associated with pilgrimages, images, and relics but vigorously reaffirmed the value of venerating and invoking the saints and their remains and representations ... Vigorous rejection of the Protestant precept that miracles had ceased also became an increasingly prominent feature of English Catholic polemic in the course of Elizabeth’s reign” etc. Argues for this strong continuity between pre- and post-Reformation Catholicism (anti-Bossy).

Ethan Shagan, Popular Politics and the English Reformation; on the successful use of force and persuasion, making compliance into complicity.

Margaret Harvey, “Some Reflections on Recent Scholarship on the English Reformation” (Sewanee Theology Review), excellent reflection on revisionist Reformation history.

John T. McGreevey, Catholicism and American Freedom: on the struggle between Protestant individualism and Catholic communitarianism in American history.

Robert Bearman, “John Shakespeare’s ‘Spiritual Testament’: A Reappraisal” (Shakespeare Survey), arguing likelihood that the testament was a Jordan fabrication.

Dennis Taylor, “Bearish on the Will: John Shakespeare in the Rafters,” Shakespeare Newsletter 54.1 (Spring 2004): 11, 16, 24, 28. See Greenblatt’s 2004 Will in the World: “The case against authenticity [of the John Shakespeare will] ... has been vigorously resumed by Robert Bearman ... but more recent scholarship has cautiously tended to confirm its authenticity” (p. 397).

Summary of the Taylor article: 1) Jordan’s forgery of the first leaf of the will need not be mentioned in connection with the five leaves of the will as published by Edmond Malone in 1790.

2) Malone's knowledge of the will was independent of Jordan's intervention, and the will's discovery was attested by several reputable residents of Stratford. 3) The theory that Jordan early conspired with the bricklayer to plant a doctored will in the Henley Street is extremely unlikely for a number of reasons. 4) The discovery of a template for the will, in the Borromeo formulary, was an astonishing confirmation of the historical authenticity of the will's language. 5) The assumption that Jordan concocted the first leaf of the will cannot be taken for granted, despite his unsatisfactory explanation on how he obtained possession. 6) The labeling of the entire will as "Jordan's forgery," a mistake traditionally made by mainstream scholars, is based on an historical myth which needs to be deconstructed. 7) Malone's late and unexplained doubts about the will can be given various explanations and were, arguably, answered by the discovery of the Borromeo template and other later research. 8) William Allen's reference to "testamentis" to be carried into England refers, as is more likely, to copies of the Borromeo template, as shown by examination of other uses of "testamento" and "testamenta" in the Allen correspondence. 9) The conditions of persecution and concealment in the 16th and 17th century explain the gaps in the 'geological record' of such testaments, and also explain the behavior of John Shakespeare in hiding the will. 10) The phrasing in the will, "when I least thought of it," supposed to reflect a later idiom, can in fact be cited in examples nearly contemporary to John Shakespeare.

Tom Merriam, "A Protestant-Based Lampoon," ms, refutes Kastan's Arden edn. claim that Falstaff is satirized as extreme Protestant from Anglican point of view; in fact, Shakespeare's object is the mainstream Protestant forerunner praised by John Foxe, and re-defended as such, contra-Shakespeare, by Munday et al. in 1 Sir John Oldcastle (Munday had attacked Marprelate, who is thus unlikely to be Shakespeare's object of satire, as seen by Munday.) But Falstaff also embodies, in grotesque form, the anti-angelic corporality associated by Protestants with Catholicism.

Maurice Hunt, Shakespeare's Religious Allusiveness: Its Play and Tolerance (Ashgate): Hunt puts Shakespeare at the center of the Western Catholic/Protestant schism in religious history, and sees him conducting a major exploration, with a view of their possible or impossible harmonizing. Historical Research, retrospective essays on revisionism: Haigh: "It sometimes seems to me that Reformation history is just a convenient battlefield in the struggle for the soul of the Church of England -- but that is a wicked thought."

Katherine Goodland, "'All for Nothing': Male Anxiety over the Portrayal of Female Grief in Shakespeare's Hamlet," talk April 3, Renaissance Society Conference, NYC: on series of interruptions of female mourning (by Hecuba, player Queen, etc.) in the play. To be chapter in forthcoming book.

Julie Maxwell, "Counter-Reformation Versions of Saxo: A New Source for Hamlet?" (Renaissance Quarterly): Argues that an important source of Hamlet, Belleforest's adaptation of Saxo, was influenced by the Swedish Magnus brothers: Johannes Magnus's Historia de omnibus Gothorum Sveonumque regibus (History of all the Kings of the Goths and Swedes) which tells the story of Amleth's father, Horvendil; and Olaus Magnus's Historia de Gentibus Septentrionalibus (Description of the Northern Peoples) which describes the 16th-century conflict of Denmark and Sweden, in which Protestant Denmark (and Norway) led by Christian II takes over Catholic Sweden. Gustav Vasa, Danish noble in exile, will lead the Swedish revolt against Christian II, and make his way onto the Swedish throne; but the Magnus brothers regard him as a tyrant who has corrupted Sweden with the introduction of Lutheranism. Both Magnus histories are inflected with counter-reformation religious ideology: an illustration in Olaus Magnus shows the soldiers of Danish conqueror Christian II murdering the abbot and monks of Nydala monastery. A later edition of O. Magnus's work (a more proximate source for Belleforest) combined Johannes' account of the Horvendil story with Olaus's later Danish-Swedish contemporary story. Thus Catholic/Protestant division is implicitly imported into the Gothic tale of Horvendil, the ruler appointed for Jutland, who is then slain by his brother Fengo who marries his wife Gerutha, and is in turn slain by Amleth, who will also be slain. Maxwell fills in the Catholic credentials of the Magnuses, and also of Belleforest, protégé of Margaret of Navarre ("Belleforest's English critics ignore the Counter-Reformation sources of his thinking.") Belleforest also saw parallels to the French Catholic-Protestant struggle and the evil of overturning the traditional Catholic religion. A further note finds a likely source for the "sledded Polacks" passage in Hamlet, namely Johannes Magnus's description of the battle between Christian II and the sledded Swedish army, apparently

reinforced with Polish auxiliaries, and led by Sten Sture, anti-unionist Swedish regent, a battled waged on the ice in which Sture was defeated. Olaus includes remarkable woodcuts of the fighting on the ice. Thus Shakespeare may have known Magnus directly. Maxwell does not see partisan religious Protestant or Catholic ideology in Shakespeare's use of the story; Shakespeare "is interested creatively in both" (email, 6/7/04).

Katherine Duncan-Jones, "Did the Boy Shakespeare Kill Calves?" (MLQ): Aubrey story of how young Shakespeare would kill calves "in high style and make a speech," may be "obscurely disguised recollection" of various things, including Guy of Warwick, slayer of Dun Cow of Dunsmore Heath.

Thomas Merriam, "Taylor's Method Applied to Shakespeare and Fletcher" (Notes and Queries); devises test to improve on Gary Taylor and show that for Henry VIII the Spedding divisions should be modified with following additions: Shakespeare's also includes beginning and ending of 2.2, also beginning of 3.1, also part of 3.3, 3.2 continuing to line 306, middle of 4.1, and middle of 4.2; Fletcher's includes chamberlains intervention in 2.3.

Thomas Merriam, "King John Divided" (Literary and Linguistics Computing): similar statistical tests show that many lines of King John can be attributed to another writer, perhaps Marlowe: 1.1.1-1.1.137; 2.1.1-2.1.109; 2.1.201-2.1.424; 3.1.75-3.1.262 (includes King John's "free breath of a sacred king" speech); 4.2.131-4.2.26; 5.2.1-5.6.15.

Greenblatt, Will in the World: How Shakespeare Became Shakespeare (Norton): "a decisively secular dramatist" (36). "The dream of restoration haunted Shakespeare throughout his life" (81), i.e. for the family name and fortunes (not the more ambitious dream of restoration, of the father's whole religious system). "Many scholars have come to take seriously a controversial claim," i.e. the Lancaster thesis (89). "If his father was both Catholic and Protestant, William Shakspeare was on his way to being neither" (113). Shakespeare's experience of his son Hamlet's funeral may have influenced the "mained rites": "it is also possible that he found the service, with its deliberate refusal to address the dead child as 'thou,' its reduction of ritual, its narrowing of ceremony, its denial of any possibility of communication, painfully inadequate" (315). Shakespeare "was part of a very large group, probably the bulk of the population, who found themselves still grappling with longings and fears that the old resources of the Catholic church had served to address ... By the late 1590s, insofar as his faith could be situated in any institution at all, that institution was the theater" (321). "he also believed that the theater ... could tap into the great reservoir of passionate feelings that, for him and for thousands of his contemporaries, no longer had a satisfactory outlet ... Shakespeare drew upon the pity, confusion, and dread of death in a world of damaged rituals (the world in which most of us continue to live) because he himself experienced those same emotions at the core of his being" (321).

David Salter, "Shakespeare and Catholicism: The Franciscan Connection" (Cahiers Élisabéthains), how Shakespeare's positive valuation of Franciscan friars sharply diverges from the Protestant critique of them. But Shakespeare treats friars not as relevant to religious controversy but as nostalgic "figures who belonged more to the distant past or to far off land."

Richard Wilson, Secret Shakespeare: Studies in Theatre, Religion and Resistance (Manchester UP): Shakespeare a "politique" reacting against Catholic fanaticism and sectarianism in favor of toleration, a "critique of martyrdom." In play after play, "an anti-Jesuit subtext." R. V. Young review: "it is difficult to see how such knowledge enhances the public meaning of the plays or adds to the depth of their meaning or the power of their appeal" (Renaissance Quarterly).

Irene Visser, "Faulkner's Mendicant Madonna: The Light of Light in August" (Literature and Theology), on Lena Grove.

Patrick W. Carey, Orestes A. Brownson: American Religious Weathervane (Eerdmans), major detailed account of Brownson's important interaction with 19th century American thought.

James Deboo, "Wordsworth and the Stripping of the Altars" (Religion and the Arts): Wordsworth seeks continuity between the new currents and old traditions, as in "Tintern Abbey."

Franz Wright, Walking to Martha's Vineyard: Poems, Pulitzer prize, Waltham MA Catholic.

****2005****

Phebe Jensen, "Pastime and Pastoral", paper for SAA Conference 2005 (Bermuda):

Distinguishing pruned pastoral from festivity, the paper shows how the folding of festivity back into pastoral, reflects a Catholic point of view (and not just a Sidneyan preference for a purified

genre), as illustrated in As You Like It and Twelfth Night.

Andrew Moran, “Synaesthesia and Eating in The Winter’s Tale” (Religion and the Arts): on the Eucharistic dimensions of the final scene.

Clare Asquith, Shadowplay: The Hidden Beliefs and Coded Politics of William Shakespeare (Public Affairs, Perseus Books): begins with analogy of Chekhov stories performed in 1983 under Soviet rule. Shakespeare “never forgets the country’s original crime, the desertion and mistreatment of its proper spiritual heritage for the sake of an alien faith.” “Throughout his work, he argues not for union of Catholic and Protestant, nor for the ascendancy of one over the other—but for reconciliation and mutual respect,” for example, between Julia and Silvia in Two Gentlemen—“though a return to the fold of universal Christendom is seen as England’s best hope.” Shakespeare is a “Catholic humanist”, the plays are allegoric, coded. Shakespeare appealed to Prince Henry’s love of romances. Shakespeare is a “a uniquely privileged thorn in the flesh of the country’s new religious and political order.” An lively argument that the plays are coded representations, “holograms,” that continually refer to Catholic/Protestant conflict from a Catholic point of view.

David Ellis, That Man Shakespeare: Icon of Modern Culture (East Sussex, Helm Information Ltd., 2005), the most recent anti-speculation book in the Levin-Bearman tradition, mocks biographies for relying on arguments drawn from “absence,” “history,” “proximity,” and the plays and sonnets. Yet concedes: “It could well be that Shakespeare’s parents were among these [“who ... kept the substance of the old beliefs”] and that Shakespeare himself always retained not merely a familiarity with the old ways but a positive fondness for them. That would not however be very interesting from a biographical point of view”, because we don’t know Shakespeare’s commitments. [But note the concession.]

Martin Wiggins, “Shakespeare Jesuited: The Plagiarisms of ‘Pater Clarcus’,” (Seventeenth Century) : at least one later Jesuit dramatist drew on Shakespeare’s history play, 3 Henry VI, to dramatize the king as a saint, in Father Clarke’s c. 1654 play, Innocentia Purpurata seu Rosa Candida et Rubicunda, performed at St Omers. The folio version of Shakespeare’s play was the source of many details used by Clarke, who was impressed by Henry VI’s meeting with Richmond and the prophecy that Richmond will reign and join the roses; other details borrowed from King John. The conclusion with the angel receiving Henry into heaven “is, in effect, a Catholic riposte to the official history of Henry’s death, construing it as the martyrdom of a holy monarch.” The play may reflect unrealized hopes placed on the exiled Prince Charles.

Maurice Hunt, “Reformation/Counter-Reformation Macbeth” (ES) : Protestant elements, equivocation, witches as Harsnett-like in use of body parts, what James I attacked, also like equivocating Jesuits wonder workers, allusion to James I as climactic king. Yet Edward the Confessor “is a distinctly Catholic Monarch”, stress on royal touching. Malcolm uses equivocation. Gatekeeper may be derived from medieval play about harrowing of hell (citing Kranz). Vision of the show of 8 kings is a “true” vision, deriving from a Catholic miracle play (citing Hassel). Thus the play shows “a subtle melding of a multitude of Protestant and Catholic motifs, as I have tried to show in a series of articles written over the last decade.” The result is to give “the impression of tolerance of religious difference.” More important is the deep non-sectarian message about the “scourge of God.”

Nicholas Watson, “Chaucer’s Public Christianity” (Religion and Literature), classic description of Chaucer’s defense of middling lay Catholicism, contra Langland and others, in resistance to more “puritan” notions of lay fervor. [Thus Wife of Bath a sort of Falstaff.] On the pilgrims: “In some ways, if read against contemporary perfectionist writings, this community can be described as traditional, even conservative; it still in some sense cherishes figures of purity like St. Cecilia, and has, as I see it, no direct truck with Lollardry or other radical contemporary discourse. In other ways, however, the self-consciously worldly Christianity of The Canterbury Tales contains something new. It is deeply laicized ...”

ARCIC reaches agreement on “Mary: Grace and Hope in Christ.”

Cardinal Ratzinger becomes Pope Benedict XVI, focuses on reunion of Catholic and Orthodox churches.

Doubt: A Parable, drama by John Patrick Shanley, deeply intelligent play about a suspected priest, who is nevertheless warm and enlightened in Vatican 2 style, and a mother superior who is harsh and traditional but cares deeply for her students. All that can be said for (and against) Catholicism

in its liberal and traditional aspects is embodied, in this major Broadway event engaging a diverse New York audience.

Nicholas Boyle, Sacred and Secular Scriptures: A Catholic Approach to Literature: uses Hegel's notion of history of religion as driven by power of reconciliation of sacred and secular (but not climaxing in Hegelian political state). By representing world as worth representing, secular literature shows the world as forgiven, reconciled to God through incarnation; but cannot connect with God like scriptures.

Diarmaid MacCulloch, "Putting the English Reformation on the Map," Transactions of the RHS 2005: "Elizabeth I's religious settlement ... asserted Protestant values with no concessions to Catholicism" and showed "Tudor distrust of assertions of the real presence in the eucharist, a deep animus against images and shrines and a reassertion of the value of law and moral systems within the Reformation structure of salvation ... all three clashed with Luther's style of Protestantism." As far as the so called Elizabethan religious compromise is concerned, "it would be more sensible to note how little compromise the queen made in swiftly and decisively setting up an unmistakably Protestant regime in Westminster" footnote: "the settlement is described in detail (including a thorough-going and effective demolition of Sir John Neale's reconstruction of events in 1558-9) in N. L. Jones, Faith by Statute: Parliament and the Settlement of Religion 1559 (1982)." "The resulting parliamentary settlement was in fact a snapshot of King Edward VI's Church as it had been in doctrine and liturgy. That meant bringing back the 1552 Prayer Book, not the 1549 Book ... The 1559 legislation made a number of small modifications in the 1552 Book ... centering on liturgical dress and the eucharist. Traditionally in Anglican history, these were called concessions to Catholics. That is absurd. How would these little verbal and visual adjustments mollify Catholic-minded clergy and laity, whom the settlement simultaneously deprived of the Latin mass, monasteries, chantries, shrines, guilds and compulsory celibate priesthood? ... the alternation were probably aimed at conciliating Lutheran Protestant either at home or abroad." Not Calvinist, but pre-Calvinist Reform pushed by Cranmer, Laski, Bullinger, Bucer and Martyr; tending to sympathize with Zurich more than Geneva, with Calvinist sort of sacramental theology "regarded as over-sacramentalism by the majority of English divines." Thus Elizabethans should be distinguished from the "sacramental world of theologian like Lancelot Andrewes, William Laud, the world that still values real presence, bishops and beauty" versus "the other, the world of the Elizabethan Reformation, which rejects shrines and images, which rejects real presence, which values law and moral regulation based on both Old and New Testament precept. These two world [still] contend for mastery within English tradition." Such is Anglicanism. 'It will be better for the sanity of the Anglican tradition if neither side manages to win.' (last sentence)

Robert Bearman, "John Shakespeare: A Papist or Just Penniless?" (SQ), well researched article redoing the traditional argument that John Shakespeare's difficulties were due to business, not to recusancy. Bearman makes one important mistake, re. John's "Spiritual Testament": "the evidence, when scrutinized, merely confirms what Edmond Malone suspected—that this document bears all the hallmarks of an eighteenth-century hoax and that subsequent attempts to link it to the Jesuit Mission of the early 1580s is unjustified." The suggestion of hoax, associated with the hapless John Jordan, applies only to the first page of the testament; Malone accepted the validity of the rest of the testament, until much later he remarked but never substantiated that he had found "documents" to prove the will not to be John Shakespeare's. These reasons had nothing necessarily to do with Jordan, but probably concerned the style of the will. In fact, the discovery of later templates answered such doubts: Bearman's misleading phraseology, "subsequent attempts to link it to the Jesuit Mission of the early 1580s", implies that the subsequent attempts were simply argumentation and not discovery of actual evidence verifying the validity of the testament as a traditional form used by Catholics. See above Greenblatt 2004, Taylor 2004. Bearman cites D. Thomas and N. Evans 1984 article, "John Shakespeare in the Exchequer" (SQ) but doesn't directly address their argument that John Shakespeare was rich all along, and so debt excuses must have been a cover.

Richard Dutton, "Jonson, Shakespeare and the Exorcists," (Shakespeare Survey): In Lear, "theatricality ... is almost always a virtuous mode, not a vicious one—whether in the form of Kent's disguise, the Fool's brave 'performance' in the face of adversity, or Lear's 'trial' of Goneril and Regan. And this is particularly true in the case of Edgarmar," in contrast with

Volpone, where “the notion of possession is consistently associated with the intensely theatrical fraud perpetrated by Volpone and Mosca.” Mark Noll and Carolyn Nystrum, Is The Reformation Over? An Evangelical Assessment of Contemporary Roman Catholicism.

David Chandler, “Catholic Shakespeare: The Making of the Argument” (ELN), review of older materials, some incorporated into this Chronology (search “Chandler”).

****2006****

Devon Fisher, “Spurring an Imitative Will: The Canonization of Arthur Hallam” (Christianity and Literature): on Tennyson “creating a secularized version of the saint out of Arthur Hallam.”; i.e. the Hallam who wrote “The Influence of Italian Upon English Literature” (see above 1832); thus on Hallam’s “relics” etc. Thus Tennyson’s “progressive conservatism” wants the Hallam exemplar to be influential.

Anglican General Synod votes to ordain women bishops.

Eamon Duffy, “The English Reformation After Revisionism” (Renaissance Quarterly): “while some historians like Diarmaid McCulloch and Andrew Petegree might want to argue for an earlier, wider, and deeper popular dissemination of Protestant ideas than most revisionists would be willing to concede, the broad outline of the revisionist account of the Reformation has been accepted and absorbed in school and university courses.”

Jean-Christophe Myaer, Shakespeare’s Hybrid Faith: History, Religion and the Stage: the plays wrestle with and do not resolve the religious contradictions of the time.

Return to [Shakespeare and Religion](#) webpage

Return to [Shakespeare Chronology](#) webpage